

Saṅgārava Sutta – The Discourse to Saṅgārava

"*Saṅgārava Sutta*" appears altogether seven times in the ancient strata of Pāli scriptures. However, the *Saṅgārava Sutta* of *Majjhima Nikāya 100* has no duplicate of the same name, although there is a complementary version in *Samyutta Nikāya*. The brahmin Saṅgārava in the *Majjhima Nikāya sutta* seems to be different from all those mentioned in the other discourses. See below in brief what the other *Saṅgārava Suttas* are about and where exactly they occur.

SN 1.7.2.11. Saṅgārava Sutta – ven. Ānanda sees a Brahmin (Comy.: a friend from ven. Ānanda's lay life), as the Brahmin enthusiastically practices ablution (purification of sins by water). Ven. Ānanda then asks the Buddha to teach Dhamma to his friend, upon which the Buddha approaches the Brahmin, and recites a verse of Dhamma about the benefits of virtue, and the Brahmin then vows to be the Buddha's lay follower for life.

SN 5.2.6.5. Saṅgārava Sutta & *AN 5.4.5.3. Saṅgārava Sutta* – The brahmin Saṅgārava's background is not explained either in the *SN* or in the *AN* version, but it is possible that it is the same brahmin Saṅgārava as in the previous *Saṅgārava Sutta* of *SN*, i.e. *SN 1.7.2.11. Saṅgārava Sutta*. The brahmin asks the Buddha why some memorized texts are sometimes easily remembered even when difficult, and why are some text soon forgotten even if they seemed to be easy to remember. The Buddha explains that it depends on the presence of the five hindrances in the mind (i.e. sensual desire, ill will, sloth and torpor, restlessness and anxiety, and doubt).

AN 3.2.1.10. Saṅgārava Sutta – Brahmin Saṅgārava approaches the Buddha with the idea that those who practice sacrifice and enjoin others to practice sacrifice benefit many living beings, whereas others who become ascetics [such as Buddhist monks] benefit only themselves. The Buddha then explains that He Himself benefits many hundreds of thousands by teaching the unsurpassed culmination of the spiritual life. Ven. Ānanda then asks the Brahmin which of the two (sacrificing or ascetic life) seems simpler and less harmful, and the Brahmin refuses to answer. The Buddha then explains to the brahmin the three psychic powers ((1) self-multiplication, element transformation, (2) telepathy, and (3) teaching virtuous life) and acknowledges that He and many of His disciples have attained them. The Brahmin then becomes the Buddha's lay follower for life. The brahmin Saṅgārava, according to the Pāli Commentary, was a superintendent of construction (building) repairs in the city of Rājagaha.

AN 10.3.2.5. Saṅgārava Sutta – The text here doesn't provide us with any further information about the brahmin Saṅgārava. The brahmin approaches the Buddha and asks him what is "near shore" and "far shore." The Buddha then explains that the eight factors of the Eight-Fold Noble Path, if practiced wrongly they are the "near shore", and if they are practiced correctly, they are the "far shore". (Here "far shore" means transcending all suffering and rebirth, attainment of ultimate Enlightenment.) The discourse ends with the eulogy of the Enlightened beings.

AN 10.4.2.3. Saṅgārava Sutta – The text here also doesn't provide any information about the brahmin Saṅgārava. It seems to be a different version of the previous *Saṅgārava Sutta* in *AN 10.3.2.5*. The Brahmin here also asks what is "near shore" and "far shore," and the Buddha answers that the "near shore" is breaking the five precepts (i.e., killing, stealing, sexual misconduct, false speech, and drinking alcohol), and the "far shore" is following the five precepts (i.e., not killing, not stealing, no sexual misconduct, no false speech, no drinking alcohol). The discourse finishes with the same eulogy verses as the *Saṅgārava Sutta* of *AN 10.3.2.5*.

A complementary version of the *Majjhima Nikāya's Saṅgārava Sutta* appears in *SN 1.7.1.1. Dhanañjānī Sutta*, which describes how the husband of the Brahmin woman Dhanañjānī approached the Buddha with the intention to accuse Him of a mistake, whereas the *Majjhima Nikāya's Saṅgārava Sutta* describes how the youngest brother of her husband, brahmin Saṅgārava, questioned the Buddha's wisdom. After their attempts to test the Buddha, both of them asked to be accepted and ordained as the Buddha's monastic disciples, as monks, and soon after that, became Arahants. A large part of the Commentary to the *Dhanañjānī Sutta* is supplementary to the introduction of the *Saṅgārava Sutta*; hence that part is included in this translation, inserted at the end of the introductory part.

The Translation of Saṅgāra Sutta and the Related Commentaries

Introductory Part

<i>MN 100. Saṅgāra Sutta</i>	MN 100. The Discourse to Saṅgāra
473. <i>Evaṃ me sutam – ekaṃ samayaṃ bhagavā kosalesu cārikaṃ carati mahatā bhikkhusaṅghena saddhiṃ.</i>	473. Thus was heard by me – on one occasion the Exalted One journeys on a journey in (the kingdom of) Kosala, together with a Community of monks.
<i>Tena kho pana samayena dhanañjānī¹ nāma brāhmaṇī cañcalikappe² [maṅḍalakappe (sī.), paccalakappe (syā. kaṃ.), caṅḍalakappe (pī.)] paṭivasati abhippasanna buddhe ca dhamme ca saṅghe ca.</i>	At that time, indeed, the brahmin woman named Dhanañjānī ³ dwelled in Cañcalikappa, devoted to the Buddha, the Dhamma, ⁴ and the Saṅgha ⁵ as well.

<i>MNA 100. Saṅgārasuttavaṇṇanā</i>	Commentary to MN 100. Discourse to Saṅgāra
473. <i>Evaṃ me sutanti saṅgārasuttam.</i>	473. "Thus was heard by me" means the Discourse to Saṅgāra.
<i>Tattha cañcalikappeti evaṃnāmake gāme.</i>	There "Cañcalikappe" means in a village of that name.
<i>Abhippasannāti aveccappasādasena pasannā.</i>	"Devoted" means she had unshakeable faith (in the Buddha, Dhamma, and Saṅgha.)
<i>Sā kira sotāpannā ariyasāvika bhāradvājagottassa brāhmaṇassa bhariyā.</i>	She, indeed, (was) a Stream-Enterer, a Noble Disciple, (and) the wife of the brahmin of Bhāradvāja clan.
<i>So brāhmaṇo pubbe kālena kālam brāhmaṇe nimantevā tesam sakkāram karoti.</i>	That brahmin (would) formerly every now and then invited brahmins (home) and treated them (by meal).
<i>Imam pana brāhmaṇiṃ gharam ānetvā abhirūpāya mahākulāya brāhmaṇiyā cittaṃ kopetuṃ asakkonto brāhmaṇānam sakkāram kātuṃ nāsakkhi.</i>	However, after (the Brahmin) brought this Brahmin woman home (i.e., married her), (the Brahmin) was unable to turn the mind of the beautiful Brahmin lady of a powerful family (from thoughts about the Buddha), and (therefore) was unable to treat the brahmins (as before). ⁶
<i>Atha nam brāhmaṇā diṭṭhaditṭhatṭhāne – "nayidāni tvam brāhmaṇaladdhiko, ekāhampi brāhmaṇānam sakkāram na karosī"ti nippīlenti.</i>	Then, whenever the brahmins would see him, (they) pestered (him): "Now you are not a Brahmin of gain; you don't treat brahmins even a single day."
<i>So gharam āgantvā brāhmaṇiyā tamattham ārocetvā – "sace, bhoti ekadivasam mukham rakkhituṃ sakkuṇeyyāsi, brāhmaṇānam ekadivasam bhikkham dadeyya"nti āha.</i>	He came home, told about that issue to the Brahmin woman, and said: "If (you), lady, manage to guard (your) mouth, one day (I) might make a donation for Brahmins."
<i>Tuyham deyyadhammam rucanakatṭhāne dehi, kiṃ mayham etthāti.</i>	"Give your donation wherever it pleases (you). What (shall) I do there?" ⁷

<i>Atha kho dhanañjānī brāhmaṇī upakkhalitvā tikkhattum udānam udānesi –</i>	Then, indeed, the brahmin woman Dhanañjānī stumbled and exclaimed an exclamation three times:
<i>"namo tassa bhagavato arahato sammāsambuddhassa. Namo tassa bhagavato arahato sammāsambuddhassa. Namo tassa bhagavato arahato sammāsambuddhassa"ti.</i>	"I bow to Him, the Exalted One, the One Worthy (of offerings), the Rightly and Thoroughly Awakened (to the truth of the world). I bow to Him, the Exalted One, the One Worthy (of offerings), the Rightly and Thoroughly Awakened (to the truth of the world). I bow to Him, the Exalted One, the One Worthy (of offerings), the Rightly and Thoroughly Awakened (to the truth of the world)."

¹ In Sinhalese and PTS versions there is "dhānañjānī" (Dhānañjānī).

² In Sinhalese version there is "maṅḍalakappe" (in Maṅḍalakappa), in Thai and Cambodian "paccalakappe" (in Paccalakappa), and in PTS version there is "caṅḍalakappe" (in Caṅḍalakappa).

³ The brahmin lady Dhanañjānī, as we learn from the Commentaries, was a Stream-Enterer (Sotāpanna), hence she had unshakeable faith in the Buddha, Dhamma, and Saṅgha. She was the wife of a brahmin who was from Bhāradvāja clan.

⁴ i.e. the Buddha's Teachings.

⁵ i.e. the Community of the Buddha's monastic disciples: monks and nuns.

⁶ i.e. the brahmin lady was so faithful to the Buddha, Dhamma, and Saṅgha, that it seemed impossible to persuade her to cooperate in invitation of non-Buddhist brahmins.

⁷ According to the Sub-Commentary, the brahmin woman – being a Stream-Enterer – was free from the blemish of envy, hence she could be supportive of both the Buddha and the brahmins.

<i>So brāhmaṇe nimantetvā appodakaṃ pāyāsaṃ pacāpetvā gharañca sujjhāpetvā āsanāni paññāpetvā brāhmaṇe nisīdāpesi.</i>	He (i.e., the brahmin) invited brahmins, asked (his wife ⁸) to cook milk-rice of little water, to clean the house as well, and after (he) asked (his wife) to prepare seats, (he) asked the brahmins to sit (there).
<i>Brāhmaṇī mahāsāṭṭhakaṃ nivāsetvā kaṭacchuṃ gahetvā parivisaṇṭī dussakaṇṇake pakkhalitvā</i>	The brahmin woman took on a large garment, took a ladle, and as (she) served (the brahmins), (she) stumbled over a corner of the cloth (of her garment), ⁹
<i>“brāhmaṇe parivisaṇṭī”ti saññāmpi akatvā</i>	And not keeping in mind (the thought) "I am serving the brahmins,"
<i>āsevanavasena sahasā satthārameva anussaritvā udānaṃ udānesi.</i>	And because of the habit, (she) hurriedly remembered the Master and exclaimed the exclamation.

<i>Tena kho pana samayena saṅgāravo nāma māṇavo cañcalikappe paṭivasati tiṇṇaṃ vedānaṃ pāragū sanighaṇḍukeṭubhānaṃ sākkharappahedānaṃ</i>	Indeed, at that time the young man named Saṅgārava dwelled in Cañcalikappa, accomplished in (1) the Three Vedas, (2) vocabulary, (3) literary composition, (4)
---	--

⁸ From the later mention in this Commentary to the *Saṅgārava Sutta (MNA 100)* - "*ettakaṃ te khīrañca taṇḍulādāni ca nāsītāni*"ti = "now (/"this much") is your milk and rice in vain" - it seems that it was the wife of the brahmin, the brahmin woman Dhanañjānī, who cooked the milk-rice. According to the Commentary to the *Dhanañjānī Sutta (SNA 1.7.1.1.)* it however seems that the brahmin woman Dhanañjānī didn't cook anything – "*Tayā aññaṃ kiñci kātabbaṃ natthi, sabbam pacanaparivesanaṃ aññe karissanti.*" = "There is no other duty to be done by you, other (people) will do all the cooking and serving."

⁹ Note here that according to this Commentary the brahmin woman stumbled over a corner of her garment, whereas according to the Commentary of *SN 1.7.1.1. Dhanañjānīsutta*, the brahmin woman stumbled over a wrongly placed wooden piece of furniture.

<i>itihāsapañcamānaṃ, padako, veyyākaraṇo, lokāyatamahāpurisalakkhaṇesu anavayo.</i>	grammar, and (5) history as the fifth (lore); ¹⁰ chanter, grammarian, erudite in the heretic philosophies ¹¹ and the marks of a Great Man.
<i>Assosi kho saṅgāravo māṇavo dhanañjāniyā brāhmaṇiyā evaṃ vācaṃ bhāsamānāya.</i>	Then, the young man Saṅgārava heard that utterance (i.e., the exclamation) told by the Brahmin woman Dhanañjānī.
<i>Sutvā dhanañjāniṃ brāhmaṇiṃ etadavoca – “avabhūtāva ayaṃ¹² dhanañjānī brāhmaṇī, parabhūtāva¹³ ayaṃ dhanañjānī brāhmaṇī, vijjāmānānaṃ tevijjānaṃ¹⁴ brāhmaṇānaṃ, atha ca pana</i>	After (the young man) heard (it), (he) told the brahmin woman Dhanañjānī this: "This brahmin woman Dhanañjānī is just retarded, this brahmin woman Dhanañjānī is just retarded, this brahmin woman Dhanañjānī is just retarded, this brahmin woman Dhanañjānī is just ruined for the knowledgeable

¹⁰ The five lores of ancient brahmins were, paraphrasing from the English translation made by the Burmese (in *"Majjhima Nikāya - Medium Length Discourses of the Buddha, A Translation of Majjhimaṇṇāsa Pāli"*, by U Htin Fatt, Department for the Promotion and Propagation of the Sāsana, Yangon, 2008; p.586, PDF p.601) namely - (1) *vedattaya* (Three Vedas), (2) *niḡhandu* (vocabulary), (3) *ketubha* (literary composition), (4) *akkharappabheda* (grammar), and (5) *itihāsa* (history). Bhikkhu Bodhi however accepts Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoli's translation (in *"The Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha, A Translation of the Majjhima Nikāya"*, Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoli and Bhikkhu Bodhi, Wisdom Publications, Boston, 2009; p.819) as "Three Vedas, with their vocabularies, liturgy, phonology, and etymology, and the histories as the fifth". The most detailed explanation of the five lores is found in *Vinayapitaka Tikā – Vimativinodanī – Bāhiraṇidānakathā - Tatīyasāṅgītikathāvannaṇā* (MM vol.1 p.26). The correct understanding of the Pāli grammar is explained thus:

1. The five lores are understood including the Three Vedas, *not* as separate from them: *"tayo vedā, tesu itihāsapañcomesu"* – "the Three Vedas, by them (it is) with history as the fifth." The Three Vedas are the first lore of the five, they are not superordinate to the other four (or five in Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation).

2. *Keṭubha* is literary composition, *not* liturgy. "Liturgy" (according to OED on CD-ROM, Oxford University Press, 2009) is "A form of public worship, esp. in the Christian Church; a collection of formularies for the conduct of Divine service.". The Pāli-Burmese dictionary explains that *keṭubha* is the book of poems (ကတ်မြူထုံးကုံး၊ အလကတ်ကုံး); and the *kiriyaḡkappavikappa* which characterizes the poems is "the composition of poems related to actions of wise men" (ပညာရှိတို့၏ အမှုအရာတို့ ဆိုအပ်သော ကတ်မြူထုံးကုံး အစီအရုံး). The explanation of *Vimativinodanī Tikā* goes: *"Keṭubhanti kiṭāti gameti kiriyādivibhāganti keṭubhaṃ, kiriyāḡkappavikappo kavinaṃ upakārasatthaṃ. Ettha ca kiriyāḡkappavikappoti vacībhedaḡdilakkaṇā kiriyā kappiyati vikappiyati etenāti kiriyāḡkappo, so pana vaṇṇapadabandhapadattādivibhāgato bahuvikappoti "kiriyāḡkappavikappo"ti vuccati. Idañca mūlakiriyāḡkappaganthaṃ sandhāya vuttaṃ."* = "*Keṭubha*" means "the analysis of actions such as arriving (*kiṭāti*) (and) going (*gameti*) (of wise men), (hence it is called) *keṭubha*. The thinking and considering the actions (of wise men) is the art instrumental in poetry. Also, there "thinking and considering the actions" (*kiriyaḡkappavikappa*) means that by the work on distinctive characteristics of speech etc. there is thinking (and) considering, hence (it is called) "thinking (about) actions" (*kiriyaḡkappavikappa*). It is in fact called "thinking and considering the actions" (because) of deep ("much") pondering over (poetic) elaboration(s) of connecting syllables (and) words (into verses), the meaning of the words, etc. It is also said in connection to the *Mūlakiriyāḡkappagantha* (The Original Book of Ways of Action)." -> Therefore, "liturgy" is not a plausible translation. Correct translation is "literary/poetic composition", or (as we can see in U Htin Fatt's translation) "the art of writing".

3. *"Akkharappabheda"* is to be understood as one word (grammar/"distinction of syllables"), *not* as two words (*akkhara* - phonology and *pabheda* - etymology). Again, according to *Vimativinodanī Tikā – "Thānakaraṇādivibhāgato ca nibbacanavibhāgato ca akkharā pabhediḡyanti etenāti akkharappabhedo, sikkhā ca nirutti ca.* = "The syllables are divided/sorted by the analysis of the origin place of the sound (*thāna*), the tongue area where the sound is pronounced (*karaṇa*) etc., as well as by the analysis of the definition (of the syllables), hence (it is called) "distinction ("dividing"/"sorting") of syllables", (both) the training (of it), as well as the application ("utterance"). Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation of *akkharappabheda* as "phonology, and etymology" is ultimately correct, but in the context it should not be taken as two brahmanic lores; it is one lore only.

-- Note that the interpretation of Sub-Commentaries is essential for *Theravāda* tradition of Buddhists and especially monks, because it helps to prevent unnecessary misunderstandings. For example, due to the ignorance of Sub-Commentaries the Sinhalese monks few centuries ago had a bitter argument regarding ordination validity, a problem which would never occur in Myanmar. In Myanmar the great masters easily resolved the Sinhalese dispute by providing the Sinhalese monks with a number of quotes from Sub-Commentaries. It is the knowledge of Sub-Commentaries which helped the Burmese to be the most brilliant Buddhist meditators and scholars in the world.

¹¹ Bhikkhu Bodhi translates *lokāyata* as "natural philosophy". Natural philosophy of course is included in the Buddha's teachings as well, if we understand it as "the philosophy of nature". Therefore such translation makes no sense in the context. The Burmese interpretation says that it is the teachings of other philosophers and religious leaders of that time (တိထိတို့၏ ကုံးကုံး, in Tipiṭaka Pāli-Burmese Dictionary, vol.18, p.297).

¹² Sinhalese, Thai, Cambodian, and PTS versions: *"avabhūtā cayaṃ"* ("this (brahmin woman) is also retarded").

¹³ Sinhalese, Thai, Cambodian, and PTS versions: *"parābhūtā cayaṃ"* ("this (brahmin woman) is also ruined").

¹⁴ The word *"tevijjānaṃ"* ("of three powers/knowledges") does not appear in the Sinhalese, Thai, Cambodian, and PTS version.

<i>tassa muṇḍakassa samaṇakassa vaṇṇaṃ bhāsissatī</i> ¹⁵ .	brahmins of three proficiencies ("knowledges"), ¹⁶ because (she) speaks praise for that bald-headed ascetic.
"Na hi pana tvam, tāta bhadramukha, tassa bhagavato silapaññāṇaṃ jānāsi.	"You, however, dear beautiful-faced one ¹⁷ , don't know the virtue and wisdom of that Exalted One.
Sace tvam, tāta bhadramukha, tassa bhagavato silapaññāṇaṃ jāneyyāsi, na tvam, tāta bhadramukha, taṃ bhagavantaṃ akkositabbaṃ paribhāsitabbaṃ maññeyyāsi ¹⁸ ti.	If you, dear beautiful-faced one, knew the virtue and wisdom of the Exalted One, you, dear beautiful-faced one, would not think of blaming (or) censuring the Exalted One.
"Tena hi, bhoti, yadā samaṇo gotamo cañcalikappaṃ anuppatto hoti atha me āroceyyāsi ¹⁸ ti.	"Well then, lady, (you) should inform me when ("that day") the ascetic Gotama arrives in Cañcalikappa.
"Evaṃ, bhadramukhā ¹⁸ ti kho dhanañjānī brāhmaṇī saṅgāravassa māṇavassa paccassosi.	"Yes ¹⁸ , beautiful-faced one," then replied the Brahmin woman Dhanañjānī to the young man Saṅgāra.

<i>Brāhmaṇā udānaṃ sutvā "ubhatopakkhiko esa samaṇassa gotamassa sahāyo, nāssa deyyadhammaṃ gaṇhissāmā</i> ¹⁹ ti kupitā bhojanāni chaḍḍetvā nikkhamiṃsu.	The brahmins heard the exclamation, (and saying): "(serving) both sides, (this brahmin is a) friend of that ascetic Gotama, we won't take a donation from him," (the brahmins) were angry, threw away the food, and left.
<i>Brāhmaṇo</i> ¹⁹ – "nanu paṭhamameva taṃ avacaṃ 'ajjekadivasaṃ mukhaṃ rakkheyyāsi ¹⁹ ti, ettakaṃ te khīrañca taṇḍulādāni ca nāsītāni ¹⁹ ti	The brahmin (husband said): "didn't (I) tell you already in the beginning, 'today you should guard (your) mouth for one day', now ("this much") is your milk and rice in vain."
<i>ativiya kopavasam upagato – "evameva panāyaṃ vasalī yasmim vā tasmim vā tassa muṇḍakassa samaṇassa vaṇṇaṃ bhāsati, idāni tyāhaṃ vasalī tassa satthuno vādaṃ āropessāmi</i> ¹⁹ ti āha.	Getting extremely angry, (the brahmin then) said: "Thus, indeed, this scoundrel woman speaks praise for that bald-headed ascetic (who lives) somewhere away. Now I will accuse your teacher of a mistake, scoundrel woman!"
<i>Atha naṃ brāhmaṇī "gaccha tvam, brāhmaṇa, gantvā vijānissasi</i> ¹⁹ ti vatvā	Then the brahmin woman told him: "Go, you brahmin, when (you) have gone, you will learn,"
<i>"Na khvāhaṃ taṃ, brāhmaṇa, passāmi sadevake loke samārake sabrahmake sassamaṇabrāhmaṇiyā pajāya sadevamanussāya, yo tassa bhagavato vādaṃ āropeyyā</i> ²⁰ tiādīmāha.	Adding ("saying"): "indeed, brahmin, I don't see in the world with gods, higher gods, Brahmas, ascetics (and) brahmins, with those born of gods and men, who could (correctly) accuse that Exalted One of a mistake."
<i>So satthāraṃ upasaṅkamitvā –</i>	He (i.e., the Brahmin woman's husband) approached the Teacher and asked (this) question:
<i>"Kiṃsu chetvā sukhaṃ seti, kiṃsu chetvā na socati;</i>	"What (should) be destroyed in order to have a pleasant sleep? What (should) be destroyed in order not to grieve?"
<i>Kissassu ekadhammassa, vadhaṃ rocesi gotamā</i> ¹⁹ ti. (saṃ. ni. 1.187) – Pañhaṃ pucchi.	What would be that one thing that (you) Gotama declare to be slain? (<i>SN 1.7.1.1. Dhanañjānī Sutta</i>)
<i>Satthā āha –</i>	The Teacher said:
<i>"Kodhaṃ chetvā sukhaṃ seti, kodhaṃ chetvā na socati;</i>	"Having destroyed anger, (one) has a pleasant sleep. Having destroyed anger, (one) doesn't grieve.

¹⁵ Sinhalese, Thai, Cambodian, and PTS versions: "*bhāsati*".

¹⁶ *Tevijjānaṃ* - of three knowledges, of three proficiencies. This word is also used for Buddhist monks, but unlike in brahmins, where the three knowledges mean the Three *Vedas*, in the case of Buddhist monks "Three Knowledges" are the psychic power of remembering their past lives, the vision of other beings born in different worlds according to their *kamma*, and the full comprehension of Four Noble Truths, i.e. complete eradication of all mental defilements. The word *vijjā* therefore may mean "knowledge", "psychic power", and "wisdom" as well. I therefore suggest "proficiency" as the word that could carry all the three meanings.

¹⁷ Bhikkhu Bodhi doesn't translate this word, keeping only "sir". According to *SNA – 1.3.1.7. Addakaranasuttavannanā – "Bhadramukhoti sundaramukho."* = "*bhadra mukha*" means 'beautiful face/mouth'. Pāli-Burmese dictionary (vol.15, p.524) says: "(၁) ကောင်းသော မိန့်ခွင့်၊ (၂) ကောင်းသော မိန့်ခွင့် ရှိသောသူ" = "(1) good face; (2) person who has good face."

¹⁸ "Yes", according to the Oxford English Dictionary, stands "for the affirmative sentence corresponding to the interrogative one constituting the question: = 'It is so.' The Pāli word "*evaṃ*" usually means "thus" or "so", hence I suppose "yes" is a translation most direct and comprehensible as well.

¹⁹ From here onward we learn the story-line of *Dhanañjānī Sutta*. Because this is a faithful rendering of the original, I believe it is sufficient for the present purposes.

²⁰ I have replaced the abbreviated version consisting of dots with the full version from *SN 1.7.1.1. Dhanañjānī Sutta*.

<i>Kodhassa visamūlassa, madhuraggassa brāhmaṇa;</i>	Of the anger that has a poisoned root (and) sweet tip, brahmin,
<i>Vadhaṃ ariyā pasamsanti, tañhi chetvā na socatī</i> "ti. (saṃ. ni. 1.187) –	Noble Ones praise the slaughter, if that is destroyed, (one) doesn't grieve." (SN 1.7.1.1. Dhanañjānī Sutta)
<i>Pañhaṃ kathesi. So pabbajitvā arahattaṃ patto.</i>	(Thus the Buddha) answered ("spoke") the question. He (i.e., the Brahmin) was ordained and attained Arahantood.
<i>Tasseva kaniṭṭhabhātā akkosakabhāradvājo nāma "bhātā me pabbajito"ti sutvā bhagavantam upasaṅkamitvā akkositvā bhagavatā vinito pabbajitvā arahattaṃ patto.</i>	Even when his younger brother named <i>Akkosaka Bhāradvāja</i> ("the blaming Bhāradvāja") heard "my brother is ordained," (he) approached the Exalted One, blamed (Him), and admonished by the Exalted One, he (the brahmin) was ordained and attained Arahantood.
<i>Aparo tassa kaniṭṭho sundarikabhāradvājo nāma.</i>	Another (was) his younger (brother) named <i>Sundarika</i> (i.e., "Beautiful") <i>Bhāradvāja</i> .
<i>Sopi bhagavantam upasaṅkamitvā pañhaṃ pucchitvā vissajjanam sutvā pabbajitvā arahattaṃ patto.</i>	He also approached the Exalted One, heard the answer, was ordained (as a monk), and attained Arahantood.
<i>Aparo tassa kaniṭṭho piṅgalabhāradvājo nāma.</i>	Another (was) his younger (brother) named <i>Piṅgala</i> (i.e., "Tawny").
<i>So pañhaṃ pucchitvā pañhabyākaraṇapariyosāne pabbajitvā arahattaṃ patto.</i>	He asked (the Buddha) a question, and at the end of the answer, he was ordained (as a monk) and attained Arahantood.
<i>Saṅgāravo māṇavoti ayaṃ tesam sabbakaniṭṭho tasmim divase brāhmaṇehi saddhim ekabhattagge nisinno.</i>	"The young man <i>Saṅgārava</i> " means the youngest (brother) of them, (who) sat on that day (of <i>Dhānañjānī</i> 's exclamation) together with (other) brahmins in one refectory.
<i>Avabhūtāvāti avadḍhibhūtā avamaṅgalabhūtāyeva.</i>	"Retarded" means without progress, simply subject to bad omens.
<i>Parabhūtāvāti vināsam pattāyeva.</i>	"Ruined" means simply fallen into destruction.
<i>Vijjamānānanti vijjamānesu.</i>	"For the knowledgeable (brahmins)" means "in the knowledgeable (brahmins)."
<i>Sīlapaññānanti sīlañca ñāṇaṇca na jānāsi.</i>	"Virtue (and) wisdom" means you do not know (the Buddha's) virtue as well as (His) wisdom.

<i>SNA 1.7.1.1. Dhanañjānīsuttavaṇṇanā</i> ²¹	Commentary to SN 1.7.1.1. Discourse about <i>Dhanañjānī</i> ²²
<i>187. Brāhmaṇasaṃyuttassa paṭhame dhanañjānīti dhanañjānigottā.</i>	187. " <i>Dhanañjānī</i> " of the first (discourse) of <i>Brāhmaṇa Saṃyutta</i> means she is from the <i>Dhanañjānī</i> clan.
<i>Ukkaṭṭhagottā kiresā.</i>	Indeed, she is of a glorious clan.
<i>Sesabrāhmaṇā kira brahmuno mukhato jātā, dhanañjānigottā matthakaṃ bhinditvā nikkhantāti tesam laddhi.</i>	Other brahmins are indeed born from the <i>Brahmā</i> 's mouth; those of the <i>Dhanañjānī</i> clan came out from the (<i>Brahma</i> 's) broken head, they believed. ²³
<i>Udānaṃ udānesīti kasmā udānesi?</i>	"Exclaimed an exclamation" why did (she) exclaim (it)?
<i>So kira brāhmaṇo micchādiṭṭhiko "buddho dhammo saṅgho"ti vutte kaṇṇe pidahati, thaddho khadirakhāṇusadiso.</i>	Indeed, that Brahmin was of the wrong view, covering (his) ears when (the Brahmin woman) said " <i>Buddha, Dhamma, Saṅgha</i> ," obdurate, like a stump of an acacia tree.
<i>Brāhmaṇī pana sotāpannā ariyasāvikā.</i>	The Brahmin woman was, however, a Stream-Enterer, a Noble Disciple.
<i>Brāhmaṇo dānaṃ dento pañcasatānaṃ brāhmaṇānaṃ appodakaṃ pāyāsaṃ deti, brāhmaṇī buddhappamukhassa saṅghassa nānārasabhojanaṃ.</i>	When the Brahmin gave a donation to the five hundred Brahmins, he gave milk-rice with little water, (whereas) the meal of the Brahmin woman (donated) to the

²¹ This Commentary nicely illustrates the qualities of a lay woman as a Stream-Enterer, together with an issue that may arise when she lives with a non-Buddhist husband. I believe that the characteristics of a Stream-Enterer (esp. the unshakeable faith in the Buddha, Dhamma, and Saṅgha; complete devotion to them) possessed by a lay person will be clearly understood from this narrative.

²² The translation has been done according its Pāli-Burmese verbatim translation in "*Thanyote Aṭṭhakathā Nisya*" (သံယုတ္တကထာနိဒါး), vol.2, [author unknown], [publisher unknown], [year of publishing unknown]; pp.84-90.

²³ This is apparently a ridicule on the brahmins' conceited evolution history. Generally is believed (until today), that brahmins are born of the *Brahma*'s mouth, whereas others are born of other bodily parts of *Brahma*. The name "*Dhanañjānī*" can be translated as "experiencing wealth".

	Community of monks headed by the Buddha (consists) of various tastes.
<i>Brāhmaṇassa dānadivase brāhmaṇī tassa vasavattitāya pahīnamaccheratāya ca sahatthā parivisati.</i>	On the day of the Brahmin's donation, the Brahmin woman serves (the Brahmins) by her hand due to (her) compliance to him (i.e., her husband) as well as due to (her) absence of envy.
<i>Brāhmaṇiyā pana dānadivase brāhmaṇo pātova gharā nikkhamitvā palāyati.</i>	However, on the day of the Brahmin woman's donation (to the Buddha and Saṅgha), the Brahmin (i.e., her husband) left from the home early in the morning and scampered away.
<i>Athekadivasam brāhmaṇo brāhmaṇiyā saddhiṃ asammantetvā pañcasate brāhmaṇe nimantetvā brāhmaṇiṃ āha –</i>	Then on one day the brahmin, without consulting (that) with the brahmin woman, invited five hundred brahmins and told to the brahmin woman:
<i>“sve bhoti amhākaṃ ghare pañcasatā brāhmaṇā bhuñjissanti”ti.</i>	"Lady, tomorrow, five hundred brahmins will eat in our house."
<i>Mayā kiṃ kātabbam brāhmaṇāti?</i>	What should be done by me, brahmin? (Replied his wife.) ²⁴
<i>Tayā aññaṃ kiñci kātabbam natthi, sabbam pacanaparivesanam aññe karissanti.</i>	There is no other duty to be done by you; other (people) will do all the cooking (and) serving.
<i>Yaṃ pana tvaṃ thitāpi nisinnāpi khipitvāpi ukkāsitvāpi “namo buddhassā”ti tassa muṇḍakassa samaṇakassa namakkāraṃ karosī, taṃ sve ekadivasamattaṃ mā akāsī.</i>	However, how you, either standing or sitting, sneezing, (or) coughing, pay homage to that bald-headed ascetic (saying) "I bow to the Buddha," don't do that tomorrow just for a single day.
<i>Taṃ hi sutvā brāhmaṇā anattamanā honti, mā maṃ brāhmaṇehi bhindasīti.</i>	Indeed, if the brahmins hear that, they will be displeased; don't destroy my (reputation) among the brahmins.
<i>Tvaṃ brāhmaṇehi vā bhijja devehi vā, ahaṃ pana satthāraṃ anussaritvā na sakkomi anamassamānā saṅghātunti.</i>	Your (reputation) shall be destroyed among brahmins or among gods, I, however, can't stay remembering the Teacher and not paying respect (to Him).
<i>Bhoti kulasatike gāme gāmadvārampi tāva pidahituṃ vāyamanti, tvaṃ dvīhaṅgulehi pidahitabbaṃ mukhaṃ brāhmaṇānaṃ bhojanakālamattaṃ pidahituṃ na sakkosīti.</i>	Lady, (people at night) can try to close the village door of the village (where live) hundred families, (however) you can't close a mouth that could be closed by two fingers (even) just during the time when brahmins eat.
<i>Evam punappunaṃ kathetvāpi so nivāretuṃ asakkonto ussīsake thapitaṃ maṇḍalaggakhaṅgaṃ gahetvā –</i>	Even though speaking thus again and again, he (i.e. the brahmin) was unable to conclude (the talk), (hence he) took the dagger of rounded tip kept above (his) head, (and threatened):
<i>“bhoti sace sve brāhmaṇesu nisinnesu taṃ muṇḍasamaṇakaṃ namassasi,</i>	"Lady, if you pay homage to that bald-headed ascetic tomorrow while the brahmins are sitting,
<i>iminā taṃ khaggena pādatalato paṭṭhāya yāva kesamatthakā kaḷīraṃ viya koṭṭetvā rāsīṃ karissāmi”ti imaṃ gāthaṃ abhāsī –</i>	I will chop (your body) from the soles of (your) feet until the hair of (your) head like a top sprout and make a pile (of it)." (Then) he pronounced this verse:
<i>“Iminā maṇḍalaggena, pādato yāva matthakā; Kaḷīramiva chejjāmi, yadi micchaṃ”²⁵ na kāhasi.</i>	"By this (dagger's) rounded tip, from feet until the head; I will slice (you) like a top sprout if you don't do (according to) my will.
<i>“Sace buddhoti bhaṇasi, sace dhammoti bhāsasi; Sace saṅghoti kittesi, jīvantī me nivesane”ti.</i>	"If you say "Buddho," if you speak "Dhammo," If you praise "Saṅgho," alive in my dwelling place."
<i>Ariyasāvīkā pana pathavī viya duppakampā, sineru viya dupparivattiyā.</i>	The Noble Disciples, however, are difficult to shake like the earth, difficult to turn over like (the mountain) Sineru. ²⁶
<i>Sā tena naṃ evamāha –</i>	Then she spoke to him thus:

²⁴ The intention here is to show that unlike the brahmin husband, who couldn't stand even meeting with the Buddha and Saṅgha, the brahmin woman has no problem meeting with the brahmin's visitors, and is even open to serve them. It might be also interpreted to show the openness and support of Buddhists toward followers of other faiths.

²⁵ I suppose *micchaṃ* is made of *me* + *icchaṃ*.

²⁶ Sineru (or also Meru) is a mythical mountain believed to be in the center of the flat-earth world system, as taught by Hindu cosmology. Unfortunately, although the Buddhist masters had the psychic powers of levitation and clair-voyance, in the Pāli scriptures there is no mention of the false perceptions of the Hindus, nor any mention that the "world" may seem to be spherical. All the concept of Hindu cosmology has been entirely accepted by the Buddhist scriptures. The mythical mountain of Sineru (or Meru) is there described being in the very center of the disk-like flat earth, measuring 84 000 *yojanas* (one *yojana* is equivalent to ca. 15 km) above the surface of water, and 84 000 *yojanas* below the surface of water. The mountain Sineru (or Meru) is visible only by psychic powers.

<i>"Sace me aṅgamaṅgāni, kāmaṃ chejjasi brāhmaṇa; Nevāhaṃ viramissāmi, buddhaseṭṭhassa sāsanaṃ.</i>	"If (you) brahmin willingly cut off my limbs, Even (then) I will not refrain from the Teaching of the Supreme Buddha.
<i>"Nāhaṃ okkā varadharā, sakkā rodhayitum jinā; Dhītāhaṃ buddhaseṭṭhassa, chinda vā maṃ vadhassu vā"ti.</i>	"I am not accomplished (or) carrying perfection, (I am) able to cry up to the Victor, I am a daughter of the Supreme Buddha, (whether you) cut me or slain me."
<i>Evaṃ dhanañjānigajitaṃ nāma gajantī pañca gāthāsātāni abhāsi.</i>	Thus roaring the so-called "roar of Dhanañjānī", (she) spoke five hundred verses (in this manner). ²⁷
<i>Brāhmaṇo brāhmaṇiṃ parāmasitum vā paharitum vā asakkonto "bhoti yaṃ te ruccati, taṃ karohi"ti vatvā khaggaṃ sayane khiṇi.</i>	The Brahmin, unable to touch or hit the Brahmin woman, said: "lady, do as you like," and threw the dagger on the bed.
<i>Punadivase gehaṃ haritupalittaṃ kārapetvā lājāpunṇaghaṭamālāgandhādīhi tattha tattha alaṅkārapetvā</i>	The next day (the brahmin) asked (the servants) to smear the house with cow dung ²⁸ , adorned (the house) here and there with parched corn, pots filled with water, flowers, etc.,
<i>pañcannaṃ brāhmaṇasātānaṃ navasappisakkharamadhuuyuttaṃ appodakapāyāsaṃ paṭiyādāpetvā kālaṃ ārocāpesi.</i>	requested (his servants) to prepare milk-rice of little water combined with new ghee, new molasses, (and) new honey, and informed (the brahmins) that the time (is right to eat).

<i>Brāhmaṇīpi pātova gandhodakena sayam nhāyitvā sahassagghanakaṃ ahavatthaṃ nivāsetvā</i>	The brahmin woman, indeed, early in the morning took bath herself in perfumed water, clothed a new garment worth thousand (pieces of money),
<i>pañcasatagghanakaṃ ekaṃsaṃ katvā sabbālaṅkārapaṭimaṇḍitā suvaṇṇakaṭacchum gahetvā</i>	Arranged ("made") (another garment) worth five-hundred (pieces of money) over one shoulder, adorned with all adornments (she) took a golden ladle,
<i>bhattagge brāhmaṇe parivisaṃmānā tehi saddhiṃ ekapantiyaṃ nisinnassa tassa brāhmaṇassa bhattaṃ upasamharantī dunnikkhitte dārubhaṇḍe pakkhali.</i>	And as she was serving the brahmins in the refectory, she was carrying rice for a brahmin who was sitting with them (i.e., the other brahmins) together in the same row, and stumbled over a wrongly placed wooden piece of furniture.
<i>Pakkhalanaghaṭṭanāya dukkhā vedanā uppajji.</i>	Because of the crash (caused by) stumbling, unpleasant feelings arose.
<i>Tasmiṃ samaye dasabalaṃ sari.</i>	At that moment (she) remembered the One of Ten Powers ²⁹ .
<i>Satisampannatāya pana pāyāsapātiṃ achadḍetvā saṅhikaṃ otāretvā bhūmiyaṃ saṅghapetvā</i>	However, because (she) was endowed with mindfulness, (she) didn't throw away the (golden) cup of milk-rice, putting (the cup) slowly down, and when (the cup) was well put on the ground,
<i>pañcannaṃ brāhmaṇasātānaṃ majjhe sirasi añjaliṃ ṭhapetvā yena veḷuvanaṃ, tenañjaliṃ paṇāmetvā imaṃ udānaṃ udānesi.</i>	In the midst of five hundred (non-Buddhist) brahmins, she placed (her erected) fingers on (her) head, directed (her) fingers where there was Bamboo Grove ³⁰ , and exclaimed the exclamation.

<i>Tasmiñca samaye tesu brāhmaṇesu keci bhuttā honti, keci bhuñjamānā, keci hatthe otāritamattā, kesañci bhojanaṃ purato ṭhapitamattam hoti.</i>	Also, at that moment, some of those brahmins had already eaten, some were (still) eating, some had just put their hand into (their alms-bowls), and some had the meal just placed in front of them.
--	--

²⁷ Unfortunately, I am not able to find any more verses of Dhanañjānī's roar throughout the available Pāli scriptures.

²⁸ In ancient India cow dung was used as disinfectant, both inside houses and on roads as well.

²⁹ *Dasabala*, also known as *Tathāgatabala* are ten powers of the Buddha, mentioned and explained in different text throughout the Pāli scriptures. The most famous list is included in *MN 12. Mahāsīhanāda Sutta*. In brief, they are: (1) the understanding of what is possible and what is impossible, (2) understanding of the result of action, (3) understanding the ways leading to all destinations (rebirth), (4) understanding the world with its many and different elements, (5) understanding the different inclinations of beings, (6) understanding the disposition of the faculties of other beings, (7) understanding the path to the attainment of jhānas and Enlightenment, (8) knowledge of His past lives, (9) understanding and vision of beings passing through death and life according to their actions, and (10) the attainment of the taintless deliverance of mind and deliverance by wisdom. (Written with help of *Bhikkhu Bodhi's "The Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha, A Translation of Majjhima Nikāya"*, Wisdom Publications, Boston, 2005; p.165-166.)

³⁰ *Veḷuvana* (Bamboo Grove) is apparently the place near her dwelling place where the Buddha stayed most often.

<i>Te taṃ saddaṃ sutvāva sinerumattena muggarena sīse pahaṭṭā viya kaṇṇesu sūlena viddhā viya dukkhadomanassaṃ paṭisaṃvediyamānā</i>	Having heard that sound (of the exclamation), they experienced suffering (and) grief as if they were struck by a club of the size of the (mountain) Sineru, (or) pierced into (their) ears by a skewer,
<i>“iminā aññaladdhikena mayaṃ gharaṃ pavesitā”ti kujjhitvā hatthe piṇḍaṃ chaḍḍetvā mukhena gahitaṃ niṭṭhubhitvā</i>	And (saying) angrily: "We have entered a house of this man of different views" (they) threw the lump (of rice they had in their hand) from their hands, spat away what was in (their) mouths,
<i>dhanuṃ disvā kākā viya brāhmaṇaṃ akkosamānā disāvidisā pakkamiṃsu.</i>	Reviled the Brahmin like a crow that saw a bow ³¹ and left in different directions.
<i>Brāhmaṇo evaṃ bhijjivā gacchante brāhmaṇe disvā brāhmaṇiṃ sīsato paṭṭhāya oloketvā,</i>	When the brahmin's (reputation) was thus destroyed, as (he) saw the brahmins going away, (he) looked at the brahmin lady from her head (down),
<i>“idameva bhayaṃ sampassamānā mayaṃ hiyyo paṭṭhāya bhotiṃ yācantā na labhimhā”ti nānappakārehi brāhmaṇiṃ akkositvā,</i>	And blaming the brahmin lady in different ways (starting) : "Exactly this danger (I) presumed since yesterday, and (although) requesting the lady (to obey), we didn't receive (her obedience),
<i>etaṃ “evamevaṃ panā”tiādivacanaṃ avoca.</i>	(He) said the words (of scolding): "Thus indeed (this scoundrel)" etc.

<i>Upasaṅkamīti “samaṇo gotamo gāmanigamaraṭṭhapūjito, na sakkā gantvā yaṃ vā taṃ vā vatvā santajjetuṃ, ekameva naṃ pañhaṃ pucchissāmī”ti</i>	"Approached" means (thinking): "the ascetic Gotama is revered by the village, town, (and) the country, it is not possible to go (there) and frighten (him) just by saying something; I will ask him just one question."
<i>gacchantova “kiṃsu chetvā”ti gāthaṃ abhisarṅkharitvā –</i>	(And) already while going (he) made up the verse: "What (should) be destroyed (etc.)."
<i>‘sace ‘asukassa nāma vadhaṃ rocemī’ti vakkhati, atha naṃ ‘ye tuyhaṃ na ruccanti, te māretukāmosi, lokavadhāya uppanno, kiṃ tuyhaṃ samaṇabhāvenā’ti? Niggahessāmī.</i>	If he says: "I teach the slaughter of this particular (person)," then I will censure him (saying): "You want to kill those that don't appreciate you, (you) are (here) in order to kill humans, why would you be an ascetic?"
<i>Sace ‘na kassaci vadhaṃ rocemī’ti vakkhati, atha naṃ ‘tvam rāgādīnampi vadhaṃ na icchasi. Kasmā samaṇo hutvā āhiṇḍasī’ti? Niggahessāmī.</i>	If he says: "I do not teach slaughter of anything," then I will censure him (saying): "You don't wish to slaughter (your) lust, etc. Why are (you) then roaming about as an ascetic?"
<i>Iti imaṃ ubhatokoṭikaṃ pañhaṃ samaṇo gotamo neva gilītuṃ na uggilītuṃ sakkhissatī”ti cintetvā upasaṅkami.</i>	And thinking: "Thus the ascetic Gotama will be able neither to swallow up nor vomit this two-edged (sword-like) question," (the Brahmin) approached (the Buddha).

<i>Atha kho bhagavā kosalesu anupubbena cārikaṃ caramāno yena cañcalikappaṃ tadavasari.</i>	Then the Exalted One, journeying on a gradual journey in (the city of) Kosala, settled where was Cañcalikappa.
<i>Tatra sudaṃ bhagavā cañcalikappe viharati todeyyānaṃ brāhmaṇānaṃ ambavane.</i>	There indeed, the Exalted One stays in Cañcalikappa, in the mango grove of the brahmins of Todeyya (clan).
<i>Assosi kho dhanañjānī brāhmaṇī – “bhagavā kira cañcalikappaṃ anupatto, cañcalikappe viharati todeyyānaṃ brāhmaṇānaṃ ambavane”ti.</i>	Then the brahmin woman Dhanañjānī heard: "Really, the Exalted One has arrived in Cañcalikappa. He stays in Cañcalikappa, in the mango grove of the brahmins of Todeyya (clan).
<i>Atha kho dhanañjānī brāhmaṇī yena saṅgāravo māṇavo tenupasaṅkami; upasaṅkamitvā saṅgāravaṃ māṇavaṃ etadavoca –</i>	So, then the brahmin woman Dhanañjānī approached where there was the young man Saṅgārava; (and) having approached (him) (she) told to the young man Saṅgārava:
<i>“ayaṃ, tāta bhadramukha, so bhagavā cañcalikappaṃ anupatto, cañcalikappe viharati todeyyānaṃ brāhmaṇānaṃ ambavane.</i>	"Now, dear beautiful-mouthed one, the Exalted One has arrived in Cañcalikappa, He stays in Cañcalikappa, in the mango grove of the brahmins of Todeyya (clan).
<i>Yassadāni, tāta bhadramukha, kālaṃ maññasi”ti.</i>	Now (you), dear beautiful-mouthed one, know the time of it.

³¹ I suppose this reflects the experience of the writer – at that time crows were shot by arrows (from bows), hence the crows learned to be scared of bows. It seems that crows at that time would fiercely cry when they saw a bow.

Part One: The Contemporary Ascetic Traditions

474. "Evaṃ, bho"ti kho saṅgāraṃ māṇavo dhanañjāniyā brāhmaṇiyā paṭissutvā yena bhagavā tenupasaṅkami; upasaṅkamitvā bhagavatā saddhiṃ sammodi.	474. "Yes, friend," replied indeed the young man Saṅgāraṃ to the brahmin woman Dhanañjāni and approached the Exalted One where He (was). After (he) approached (Him), (they) exchanged courteous talk. ³²
Sammodanīyaṃ kathaṃ sāraṇīyaṃ vītisāretvā ekamantaṃ nisīdi.	When the courteous talk on important (matters) was finished, (the brahmin) sat on one side. ³³
Ekamantaṃ nisinno kho saṅgāraṃ māṇavo bhagavantaṃ etadavoca –	And sitting on one side, the young man Saṅgāraṃ told this to the Exalted One:
"santi kho, bho gotama, eke samaṇabrāhmaṇā diṭṭhadhammābhiññāvosānapāramippattā, ādibrahmacariyaṃ paṭijānanti.	"Indeed, friend Gotama, certain ascetics (and) brahmins have attained the supernatural knowledge of the present reality, (as well as) the final end (of the defilements, the Enlightenment), (and) proclaim the origin of holy life.
Tatra, bho gotama, ye te samaṇabrāhmaṇā diṭṭhadhammābhiññāvosānapāramippattā, ādibrahmacariyaṃ paṭijānanti, tesaṃ bhavaṃ gotamo katamo"ti?	There, friend Gotama, those ascetics (and) brahmins who have attained the supernatural knowledge of the present reality, (as well as) the final end (of the defilements), (and) proclaim the origin of holy life – who is the Exalted Gotama in comparison to them?
"Diṭṭhadhammābhiññāvosānapāramippattānaṃ, ādibrahmacariyaṃ paṭijānantānaṃpi kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, vemattaṃ vadāmi.	I, Bhāradvāja, proclaim difference among those who have attained the supernatural knowledge of the present reality, (as well as) the final end (of the defilements), (and) proclaim the origin of holy life.
Santi, bhāradvāja, eke samaṇabrāhmaṇā anussavikā.	There are, Bhāradvāja, some ascetics (and) brahmins just following (what they) hear. ³⁴
Te anussavena diṭṭhadhammābhiññāvosānapāramippattā, ādibrahmacariyaṃ paṭijānanti; seyyathāpi brāhmaṇā tevijjā.	They, by repeating (what they heard), (say that they have) attained the supernatural knowledge of the present reality, (as well as) the final end (of the defilements), (and) proclaim the origin of holy life – such as the brahmins of Three Knowledges (i.e. Three Vedas).
Santi pana, bhāradvāja, eke samaṇabrāhmaṇā kevalaṃ saddhāmatkena diṭṭhadhammābhiññāvosānapāramippattā, ādibrahmacariyaṃ paṭijānanti; seyyathāpi takkī vīmaṃsī.	However, Bhāradvāja, there are certain ascetics (and) brahmins, (who) (believe they have) attained the supernatural knowledge of the present reality, (as well as) the final end (of the defilements), (and) proclaim the origin of holy life – entirely just by faith (that it is so) – such as the thinkers-philosophers. ³⁵
Santi, bhāradvāja, eke samaṇabrāhmaṇā pubbe ananussutesu dhammesu sāmānyeva dhammaṃ	There are, Bhāradvāja, certain ascetics (and) brahmins, who themselves, indeed, attained the supernatural knowledge of the present reality, (as well as) the final

³² Literally "(he) rejoiced with (him)". This is a phrase often used to indicate a meeting of two friendly (or not unfriendly) persons, which starts with questions like "are you healthy?" "Do you have everything you need?" Etc. (See e.g. in *Pārājika Pāli – Catuttha Pārājika – Vinīta Vatthu: "kaccāvuso khamaṇīyaṃ kacci yāpanīyaṃ."*) It is comparable to today's "how do you do" in UK. The UK version is however not taken seriously, and instead of a particular answer you'd just answer "how do you do" too. There were many times when a monk met a monk, and asking them "are you healthy?" they would reply they are sick, and then the visitor would make efforts to help that monk.

³³ There are six places that are not appropriate for sitting down, as explained by the Commentary to *Pārājika Pāli – Verañjakandavannanā*: (1) *atidūraṃ* - too far (the teacher will have to shout at the student), (2) *accāsannaṃ* - too close (the teacher's natural movement is obstructed), (3) *uparivātaṃ* - in the direction of the wind (e.g. if the wind blows on the teacher from front right side, if the student sits in the front right side, the wind will carry the potential smells from the student's mouth (and other smells) to the teacher), (4) *unnatappadesaṃ* - on a higher seat (the student would show disrespect by assuming a superior position), (5) *atisammukhaṃ* - directly in front (the teacher loses his natural view), (6) and *atipacchā* - behind (the teacher would have to turn his head to see the student).

³⁴ According to what we learn from the next sentence, they just hear and speak, but do not attain the attainments themselves. Here "hearing" is not just overhearing something, here is meant the ancient way of teaching and learning – the teacher utters a sentence or a verse, and the student repeats in the way they hear it. Then the teacher trains the student by uttering and being repeated again and again, in different ways (e.g. uttering beginning and expecting to hear end, asking to recite beginning and himself ending, etc.) until the student "grasps" all of the sentences, paragraphs, and texts, that have to be immaculately memorized and retained for whole their lives, exactly as they learned from their teacher. The same method of teaching-learning was followed by Buddhist monks for the first three centuries before the scriptures were written down in ca. first century BC., and many more centuries after.

³⁵ I.e. they just think and ponder over how the reality might work, what is right and what is wrong, but themselves didn't experience the entire freedom from defilements. For example, those who suppose "perhaps I am now Enlightened because I didn't break any of the five precepts for a long time" would be included in this category.

<i>abhiññāya diṭṭhadhammābhiññāvōsānapāramippattā, ādibrahmacariyaṃ paṭijānanti.</i>	end (of the defilements) by supernatural knowledge of the Truth, (and) proclaim the origin of holy life.
<i>Tatra, bhāradvāja, ye te samaṇabrāhmaṇā pubbe ananussutesu dhammesu sāmaṃyeva dhammaṃ abhiññāya diṭṭhadhammābhiññāvōsānapāramippattā, ādibrahmacariyaṃ paṭijānanti, tesāhamasmi.</i>	There, Bhāradvāja, out of those ascetics (and) brahmins who themselves, indeed, attained the supernatural knowledge of the present reality, (as well as) the final end (of the defilements) by supernatural knowledge of the Truth, (and) proclaim the origin of holy life, I am (One).
<i>Tadamināpetam, bhāradvāja, pariyāyena veditabbaṃ, yathā ye te samaṇabrāhmaṇā pubbe ananussutesu dhammesu sāmaṃyeva dhammaṃ abhiññāya diṭṭhadhammābhiññāvōsānapāramippattā, ādibrahmacariyaṃ paṭijānanti, tesāhamasmi.</i>	It also should be understood ("known") in this way: in the way those ascetics (and) brahmins themselves, indeed, attained the supernatural knowledge of the present reality, (as well as) the final end (of the defilements) by supernatural knowledge of the Truth, (and) proclaim the origin of holy life, I am (One) out of them (who attained that in the same way). ³⁶
<i>474. Diṭṭhadhammābhiññā vosānapāramippattāti diṭṭhadhamme abhiññāte imasmiññeva attabhāve abhijānitvā vositavosānā hutvā</i>	474. "Attained the supernatural knowledge of the present reality, (as well as) the final end (of the defilements)" means that (they) say "we have attained the supernatural understanding of the present reality in this very life, and having supernaturally understood (the reality) (we,) having ended the (defilements that should be) ended,
<i>pāramisaṅkhātāṃ sabbadhammānaṃ pārabhūtaṃ nibbānaṃ pattā mayanti vatvā ādibrahmacariyaṃ paṭijānantīti attho.</i>	attained the Enlightenment (<i>Nibbāna</i>), (being) the overcoming of all the phenomena known as (those that should be) overcome," (and) they proclaim the origin of holy life.
<i>Ādibrahmacariyanti brahmacariyassa ādibhūtā uppādakā janakāti evaṃ paṭijānantīti vuttaṃ hoti.</i>	"Origin of holy life" is said (meaning) they proclaim that (they) are the originators, the pioneers, the creators of the holy life.
<i>Takkīti takkagāhī.</i>	"Thinkers" (means) (they) attach to assumptions.
<i>Vīmaṃsīti vīmaṃsako, paññācāraṃ carāpetvā evaṃvādī.</i>	"Philosophers" means a philosopher; he teaches by instructing conduct (in the form of) wise behavior.
<i>Tesāhamasmīti tesam sammāsambuddhānaṃ ahamasmi aññataro.</i>	"Of them I am (One)" means I am One out of those Rightly and Self Awakened Ones.

<i>475. "Idha me, bhāradvāja, pubbeva sambodhā anabhisambuddhassa bodhisattasseva sato etadahosi – 'sambādho gharāvāso rajāpatho, abbhokāso pabbajjā.</i>	475. Here, Bhāradvāja, before (my) complete Enlightenment, when not supernaturally Enlightened, just when I was a <i>bodhisatta</i> ³⁷ , it occurred to me: "Life in a house is narrow (by the little opportunity for spiritual progress), dusty (by the abundant opportunity for mental defilements), (whereas) going forth is (like) open space.
<i>Nayidaṃ sukaraṃ agāraṃ ajjhāvasatā ekantaparipuṇṇaṃ ekantaparissuddhaṃ saṅkhalikhiṭaṃ brahmacariyaṃ caritaṃ.</i>	Dwelling in a house, it is not easy to live the holy life entirely complete, entirely pure, (like) a conch shell.

³⁶ According to the verbatim Pāli-Burmese translation here the Buddha spoke about the previous Buddhas, i.e. those that did not live any more, so obviously He did not mean any of the contemporary ascetics. See for example [AN 4.24.10. Samana Sutta](#), where the Buddha explained that only in His teachings there were Enlightened beings, nowhere else in the world: "*Idheva bhikkhave samaṇo, idha dutiyo samaṇo, idha tatiyo samaṇo, idha catuttho samaṇo; suññā parappavādā samaṇebhi aññehīti.*" = "Only here, monks, is an ascetic (with the first stage of Enlightenment), here is an ascetic with the second (stage of Enlightenment), here is an ascetic with the third (stage of Enlightenment), here is an ascetic with the fourth (stage of Enlightenment); the other teachings of other (teachers) are void of (Enlightened) ascetics." The same statement occurs also in [MN 11. Cūlasīhanāda Sutta](#) and [DN 16. Mahāparinibbāna Sutta](#). There is also a simile explaining the vast difference between the benefit of following other ascetic traditions and that of following the Buddha in [SN 2. Nidānavaggapāli – 2. Abhisamayāsamyuttaṃ - 11. Tatiyapabbatasuttaṃ](#). There the benefit of a Stream-Enterer (*Sotāpanna*)'s attainment vs. the attainments of ascetics of other sects and teachings are respectively compared to the amount of rock in the huge Mountain Meru/Sineru vs. seven seeds of sesame.

³⁷ *Bodhisatta* ("being (to be) Awakened") is the portion of Siddhattha Gotama when he was not yet a Buddha, and it also includes large number of the previous lives since the time he was predicted by Padumuttara Buddha to be a Buddha in future. The 547 *jātakas* available to us today are believed to be accounts of some of those previous lives when the Buddha-To-Be trained in perfecting the Ten Perfections (generosity, morality, renunciation, wisdom, effort/energy, patience, truth/integrity, determination, loving-kindness, and equanimity).

<i>Yaṃnūnāhaṃ kesamassuṃ ohāretvā kāsāyāni vatthāni acchādetvā agārasmā anagāriyaṃ pabbajeyya'nti.</i>	What if I shaved off ("removed") (my) hair (and) beard, covered (myself) in robes (dyed in) tree-bark-dye, and went forth from home to homelessness?
<i>So kho ahaṃ³⁸, bhāradvāja, aparena samayena daharova samāno susukāḷakeso bharena yobbanena samannāgato paṭhamena vayasā akāmakānaṃ mātāpītūnaṃ assumukhānaṃ rudantānaṃ kesamassuṃ ohāretvā kāsāyāni vatthāni acchādetvā agārasmā anagāriyaṃ pabbajim.</i>	Hence I, Bhāradvāja, at a later time, being just young, of fresh black hair, endowed with youthful ("good") age, in the prime of life, to the unhappy parents ³⁹ weeping tears (over their) face, removed (my) hair (and) beard, covered (myself) in robes (dyed in) tree-bark-dye, and went forth from home to homelessness.

<i>MN 26. Pāsārāsīsuttavaṇṇanā</i>	Commentary to MN 26. Discourse on The Heap of Fetters
<i>277. Tattha daharova samānoti taruṇova samāno.</i>	277. There "being just young" means "being just youthful."
<i>Susukāḷakesoti suṭṭhu kāḷakeso, añjanaṇṇakesova hutvāti attho.</i>	"Of fresh black hair" means rightly black hair, like the hair (that has) the color of collyrium ⁴⁰ .
<i>Bhadrenāti bhaddakena.</i>	"Youthful ("good")" means favorable.
<i>Paṭhamena vayasāti tiṇṇaṃ vayānaṃ paṭhamavayena.</i>	"In the prime of life" means in the first age of the three ages (/stages of life). ⁴¹
<i>Akāmakānanti anicchamānānaṃ, anādaratthe sāmivacanaṃ.</i>	"Unhappy" means undesiring; the (word) "not appreciative" (<i>anādaratthe</i>) is in the genitive case.
<i>Assūni mukhe etesanti assumukhā; tesam assumukhānaṃ, assukilinnamukhānanti attho.</i>	"Tears in the face" thus they are of tearful faces; to them of tearful faces, to (those) of faces smeared by tears, (that is) the meaning (here).
<i>Rudantānanti kanditvā rodamānānaṃ.</i>	"(To them,) weeping" means sobbing and weeping. ⁴²
<i>So evaṃ pabbajito samāno kiṃkusalagavesī anuttaraṃ santivarapadaṃ pariyesamāno yena āḷāro kālāmo tenupasaṅkamim; upasaṅkamitvā āḷāraṃ kālāmaṃ etadavocaṃ –</i>	Then thus, having gone forth, (I) was searching what was skillful, the supreme word ("Enlightenment") of the ultimate peace. Seeking (that), I approached where there was Āḷāra Kālāma. Having approached (him), I told this to Āḷāra Kālāma:

³⁸ "So (*kho*) *ahaṃ*" is apparently a grammatical expression peculiar to the ancient Pāli language. The Burmese translation says "that me the Lord-to-be" ("ဝိပဿနာတို့၏ဘုရားဘဝသို့"). The intended meaning here perhaps is "thus", "me indeed", "me and noone else" etc.

³⁹ The mother of the prince Siddhattha passed soon after she gave him birth. However, her sister *Mahāpajāpatī Gotamī* took care of the prince as if he was her own true son.

⁴⁰ Collyrium (*añjana*) was commonly used as eyewash, eye-lotion.

⁴¹ The Sub-Commentary explains this was when the *bodhisatta* was 29 years old; the "first age" is until the age of 33.

⁴² At this point someone may ask: "Well, didn't the prince Siddhattha escape from the palace at night, not seen by anybody apart from his charioteer Channa, who took him to the river Anomā on the horse Kaṇḍaka/Kaṇṭaka? Didn't they actually pass through the city-portal opened at night by deities (because otherwise city-portals were always locked at night)? Didn't the prince cut off his hair famously at the river Anomā and threw them in the air, thinking: "if they don't fall down (i.e. if they disappear in the air), I will become a Buddha" – whereafter Sakka, the king of gods, took them from the air to build the Cūḷāmoni pagoda in his heaven (and so the hair never fell down)?" The most important thing to keep in mind is that the Buddha told to His audience only that what was helpful on their spiritual path. I suppose that narrating the story of His secret escape from palace would not be particularly useful to the audience in their practice of ethics etc., hence the Buddha didn't mention it. The others of course knew it from the members of the prince's large Sakyan family. Also note, that the story of the prince Siddhatta's secret escape from the palace at night is included in sixteen different texts throughout all of the *Tipiṭaka* Commentaries – in four of the five *Nikāyas*, in *Vinaya Piṭaka*, and *Abhidhamma Piṭaka* as well. To show the importance of the story in the way the Elders presented it I have collected all relevant references to the Commentarial account: **(1)** *MNA 1. (vol.2). 3. Opammavaggo - 6. Pāsārāsīsuttavannanā - para. 53; (2)* *SNA 3.1.8.6. Sīhasuttavannanā - para. 9; (3)* *ANA 1.13. Ekapuggalavaggavannanā - para. 21; (4)* *ANA 1.14.(14)1. Pathamaetadaggavaggo - Aññāsikondaññattheravatthu - para. 18; (5)* *ANA 4.1.4.3. Sīhasuttavannanā - para. 9; (6)* *KNA Dhammapada (vol.1). 1.8. Sāriputtattheravatthu - para. 11; (7)* *KNA Dhammapada (vol.2). 14.1. Mārādhitāravatthu - para. 9; (8)* *KNA Jātaka 1 (vol.1) – Nidānakathā - 2. Avidūrenidānakathā - para. 38; (9)* *KNA Jātaka 1 (vol.4) - 11.[460] 6. Yudhañcayajātakavannanā - para. 1; (10)* *KNA Vimānavatthu 2.7.7. Kandakavimānavannanā - para. 81; (11)* *KNA Therīgāthā 1.1. Aññatarātherīgāthāvannanā - para. 5; (12)* *KNA Apadāna 1.2. Avidūrenidānakathā - para. 39; (13)* *KNA Buddhavamsa. Nidānakathā - Abbhantaranidānam - 1. Ratanacaṅkamanakandavannanā - para. 9; (14)* *VinA 1.2.12. Dubbacasikkhāpadavannanā - para. 1; (15)* *Vinaya Tikā 1. Veraññakandavannanā - para. 32; (16)* *AbhiA Dhammasaṅganī – Nidānakathā – Sumedhakathā - para. 583.*

<i>‘icchāmaḥaṃ, āvuso kālāma, imasmiṃ dhammavinaye brahmacariyaṃ caritu’nti.</i>	"Friend ⁴³ Kālāma, I want to live a holy life in these teachings and discipline."
<i>Evaṃ vutte, bhāradvāja, ājāro kālāmo maṃ etadavoca – ‘viharatāyasmā.</i>	Saying so, Bhāradvāja, Ājāra Kālāma told me this: "May the venerable sir stay (here);
<i>Tādiso ayaṃ dhammo yattha viññū puriso nacirasseva sakaṃ ācariyakaṃ sayamaṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja vihareyyā’ti.</i>	This is the kind of teachings, where the knowledgeable man might soon attain, enter, and dwell by (his) own supernatural knowledge in the (attainment) of (his) own teacher."
<i>So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, nacirasseva khippameva taṃ dhammaṃ pariyāpuṇiṃ.</i>	Hence I, Bhāradvāja, soon, indeed quickly, mastered that teachings.

<i>Kim kusalagavesīti kiṃ kusalanti gavesamāno.</i>	"(I) was searching what was skillful" means (he was) searching (thinking) "what is skillful?"
<i>Anuttaraṃ santivarapadanti uttamaṃ santisaṅkhātaṃ varapadaṃ, nibbānaṃ pariyesamānoti attho.</i>	"Supreme word of ultimate peace" means the ultimate word of the highest expression of peace, meaning (he) was searching for the Enlightenment (<i>Nibbāna</i>).
<i>Yena ājāro kālāmoti ettha ājāroti tassa nāmaṃ, dīghapiṅgalo kireso.</i>	"There where (was) Ājāra Kālāma," there Ājāra is his name, indeed he (was) long and brown. ⁴⁴
<i>Tenassa ājāroti nāmaṃ ahosi.</i>	Thus his name became (to be) "Ājāra."
<i>Kālāmoti gottaṃ.</i>	"Kālāma" is the clan (where he was born).
<i>Viharatāyasmāti viharatu āyasmā.</i>	"May the venerable sir stay" (means) may the venerable sir stay. [The Commentary just separated the conjoined words.]
<i>Yattha viññū purisoti yasmiṃ dhamme paṇḍito puriso.</i>	"Where the knowledgeable man" means in which teachings a wise man.
<i>Sakaṃ ācariyakanti attano ācariyasamayaṃ.</i>	"Own teacher" means the understanding of (one's) own teacher.
<i>Upasampajja vihareyyāti paṭilabhitvā vihareyya.</i>	"May (...) enter, and dwell" means having attained, (he) might dwell.
<i>Ettāvatā tena okāso kato hoti.</i>	So much was the opportunity given ("made") by him (i.e., Kālāma).
<i>Taṃ dhammanti taṃ tesamaṃ samayaṃ tantim.</i>	"That teachings" means (learning) the procedure of that understanding (/attainment) by them (i.e., the student-ascetics).
<i>Pariyāpuṇinti sutvāva uggaṇhiṃ.</i>	"I mastered" means I have memorized (it all) having just heard (it once).

<i>So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, tāvatakeneva oṭṭhapahatamattena lapitalāpanamattena ‘ñāṇavādañca vadāmi, theravādañca jānāmi, passāmi’ti ca paṭijānāmi, ahañceva aññe ca.</i>	Thus I, Bhāradvāja, (at that time) claimed: "I speak the teachings on knowledge, know and see the teachings on eternity," only by the contact of lips (while saying it), only by repeating what (Ājāra Kālāma) said; both me and others. ⁴⁵
---	--

⁴³ *Āvuso* is a word often used among monks in the Pāli scriptures, regardless their monastic seniority. It is translated as "friend", "brother", etc. According to the PTS dictionary, it has descended from *āyusmanto*. In the Buddha's time the word "*āyasmā*" was however an address used for a superior person. In *Dīgha Nikāya 16. Parinibbāna Sutta - Tathāgatapacchimavācā* the Buddha is reported to decide that junior monks will address elder monks as "*bhante*" ("exalted one") or "*āyasmā*" ("elder"; "venerable"), whereas the elder monks would address the juniors by their name, clan, or as *āvuso*. To prevent unnecessary *faux pas* when monks encounter one another and do not know the seniority of the second one, it is traditionally followed that all monks treat one another in the most respectful way, especially in official settings.

⁴⁴ The Sub-Commentary explains, that he was "long" in height, and had brown eyes – "*tuṅgasarīratāya dīgho, piṅgalacakkhutāya piṅgalo*" – "long because of the height of body, (and) brown because of the brown eyes." Pāli-Burmese dictionary however explains, that he was "long (with) weird eyes" ("ရှည်ရှည် ဝေဖန်ကာဇောသာ မှီကိရှိဇောသာ"), hence he was called "Ājāra". The dictionary also says that "weird" means "gay and mad" ("ဂျမ်းရမ်း"), a Burmese word that I have possibly misunderstood. I suppose that "brown eyes" are "weird" because eyes of Indians are usually black.

⁴⁵ This seems to refer to Brahmin Saṅgārava's question in the beginning, and the Buddha here explains he was the first of the three kinds of those who claim enlightenment. Tipiṭakadhara Mingun Sayadaw explains: "Just by repeating what the teacher uttered with slight lip-movements, the Bodhisatta reached the stage of learning at which he could say, "I have understood!" In fact, he did declare, "I have understood! I have seen the course!" and the Sect-leader and his other disciples also agreed to his declaration." (From "*The Great Chronicle of Buddhas*", The Most Venerable Mingun Sayadaw Bhaddanta Vicittasārābhavaṃsa, tr. U Ko Lay & U Tin Lwin, The State Buddha Sāsana Council, Ti=Ni Publishing Center, 2006 [second edition]; vol.2, p.140/PDF p.158.)

<i>Tassa mayham, bhāradvāja, etadahosi – ‘na kho ālāro kālāmo imaṃ dhammaṃ kevalaṃ saddhāmatkena sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharāmiti pavedeti; addhā ālāro kālāmo imaṃ dhammaṃ jānaṃ passaṃ viharatīti.</i>	Then, Bhāradvāja, it occurred to me: "Indeed, Ālāra Kālāma does not claim 'I have attained, enter, (and) dwell in this teachings by (my) own supernatural knowledge' entirely just by faith; verily, Ālāra Kālāma dwells in this teachings knowing (and) seeing (it in reality).
--	--

<i>Oṭṭhapahatamattenāti tena vuttassa paṭiggahaṇattham oṭṭhapaharaṇamattena; aparāparaṃ katvā oṭṭhasañcaraṇamattakenāti attho.</i>	"as much as is the contact of lips (during saying so)" has the meaning that what was said by him (i.e., Kālāma), the grasped/learned meaning was (repeated) as much as is the beating of lips; doing (so) again and again, just moving the lips.
<i>Lapitalāpanamattenāti tena lapitassa paṭilāpanamattakena.</i>	"as much as is the repeating of what (Ālāra Kālāma) said" means just by repeating after him who spoke.
<i>Ñāṇavādanti jānāmīti vādaṃ.</i>	"I know the teachings on knowledge" ⁴⁶ means the (particular) teaching.
<i>Theravādanti thirabhāvavādaṃ, thero ahametthāti etaṃ vacanaṃ.</i>	"Teachings on eternity" means the teachings on permanence; "there (he) said 'permanence'" is the (meaning of) the word. ⁴⁷
<i>Ahañceva aññe cāti na kevalaṃ ahaṃ, aññepi bahū evaṃ vadantī.</i>	"Both me as well as others" means not just me, many others say so too.
<i>Kevalaṃ saddhāmattakenāti paññāya asacchikatvā suddhena saddhāmatkeneva.</i>	"Entirely just by faith" means not having attained it by wisdom, believing just as much as faith (can).
<i>Bodhisatto kira vācāya dhammaṃ uggaṇhantoyeva,</i>	In fact, just as the <i>bodhisatta</i> by word memorized ("grasped") the teachings,
<i>“na kālāmassa vācāya pariyattimattameva asmiṃ dhamme, addhā esa sattannaṃ samāpattinaṃ lābhīti aññāsi, tenassa etadahosi.</i>	He realized: "Kālāma doesn't (understand) that teaching only to the extent of memorizing it by word, verily he has attained the seven attainments" ⁴⁸ ; thus it occurred (to the <i>Bodhisatta</i>).

<i>“Atha khvāhaṃ, bhāradvāja, yena ālāro kālāmo tenupasaṅkamim; upasaṅkamitvā ālāraṃ kālāmaṃ etadavocaṃ –</i>	"Then I, Bhāradvāja, indeed approached there where was Ālāra Kālāma. Having approached (him), I told this to Ālāra Kālāma:
<i>‘kittāvatā no, āvuso kālāma, imaṃ dhammaṃ sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharāmiti pavedesīti?’</i>	"Friend Kālāma, to what extent do (you) proclaim to us: 'I attain, enter, (and) dwell in these teachings by (my) own supernatural knowledge'?"

⁴⁶ Note that the Commentary here apparently follows a different version of the text, which is however not uncommon (in irrelevant cases). The main text says "*ñāṇavādañca vadāmi*" = "I speak the teachings on knowledge", whereas the Commentary reads "*ñāṇavādañca jānāmi*" = "I know the teachings on knowledge."

⁴⁷ "*Thero ahamettha*" makes sense if it was out of context; it would mean "There I am the elder." – "*thero*" (= elder), "*ahaṃ*" (= I), "*ettha*" (= there). In the context it however doesn't make any sense. Could it be so, that instead of "*ahamettha*" it should be "*āhamettha*" (a kind of difference commonly found in different versions of Pāli text), joining in a nontraditional way the word "*āha*" (= said), and "*ettha*" (= there)? In fact, the Pāli-Burmese verbatim translation (*MNA1* vol.3 p.20 (PDF p.20)) seems to follow exactly that version of the Pāli text. It says: "*Theravādanti*, ထေရဝါဒီတို့သည်; *thirabhāvavādaṃ*, စစ်စစ်ဖြူဖူစွာတို့သာ စကားကို; *ettha*, ဤအယူ၌; *thiro*, စစ်စစ်ဖြူဖူစွာ; *iti etaṃ vacanaṃ*, ဤစကားကို; *āha*, ဆိုလိမ့်။" = "*Theravāda*" means the teachings on permanence; there (i.e. in that belief) (the attainment) is permanent; thus (the Buddha) told that word (*theravāda*)." So, instead of "*thero ahamettha*" this author's version possibly read "*thiro āha(m)ettha*." The Sub-Commentary adds "*akampaniyatāya thiro*" (= "permanent by (its) stability ("non-trembling"))".

The aim of the *bodhisatta*, the Buddha-to-be, was to find a permanent attainment, permanent freedom from Cycle of Birth, permanent freedom from birth, old age, and death. Therefore, "Teachings on permanence" was exactly that what the *bodhisatta* searched for. Unlike in the Buddha's Teachings, where all attainments are impermanent in terms of the mental experience, and only the final passing away (*Parinibbāna*) is permanent, in this case Ālāra Kālāma (as well as Udaka, the son of Rāma) believed, that the attainment of the Base of Nothingness is a permanent attainment, because it seems to be so when it is experienced. In the context of the name of the Buddhist school the term *Theravāda* is exclusively used for the "Teachings of Elders". In fact, the word *theravāda* in the sense of "teachings on permanence" appears only in the narrative of the prince Siddhattha becoming an ascetic and training with the then teachers - *Majjhima Nikāya suttas 26. 36. 85*, and *100* - where it reflects only the ideas of Ālāra Kālāma and Udaka, the son of Rāma.

⁴⁸ There are altogether "eight attainments" in the *samatha* (concentration) practice, four "material absorptions" (*rūpa jhāna*) and four "immaterial absorptions" (*arūpa jhāna*). The attainment of Base of Nothingness taught by Ālāra Kālāma is the third immaterial absorption, attained by passing through the preceding four material and two immaterial absorptions.

<i>Evam vutte, bhāradvāja, ālāro kālāmo ākiñcaññāyatanam pavedesi.</i>	Having spoken thus, Bhāradvāja, Ālāra Kālāma proclaimed (his attainment as) the Base of Nothingness. ⁴⁹
<i>Tassa mayham, bhāradvāja, etadahosi – ‘na kho ālārasseva kālāmassa atthi saddhā, mayhampatthi saddhā; na kho ālārasseva kālāmassa atthi vīriyam...pe... sati... samādhi... paññā, mayhampatthi paññā.</i>	Then, Bhāradvāja, this occurred to me: "Indeed, not only Ālāra Kālāma has faith, I also have faith indeed; not only Ālāra Kālāma has energy...rep... mindfulness... concentration... wisdom, I also have wisdom indeed."
<i>Yamnūnāham yam dhammam ālāro kālāmo sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharāmīti pavedeti tassa dhammassa sacchikiriyāya padaheyya’nti.</i>	What if I endeavored to attain those teachings which ("teachings") Ālāra Kālāma proclaims (as): "I attain, enter, (and) dwell in (this teaching) by (my) own supernatural knowledge."
<i>So kho aham, bhāradvāja, nacirasseva khippameva tam dhammam sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja vihāsim.</i>	Hence I, Bhāradvāja, indeed soon, indeed quickly, attained, entered, (and) dwelled in that teachings by (my) own supernatural knowledge.

<i>Ākiñcaññāyatanam pavedesīti ākiñcaññāyatanapariyosānā satta samāpattiyo mam jānāpesi.</i>	"Proclaimed the Base of Nothingness" means he announced to me the seven attainments ending with the Base of Nothingness (as attained by him).
<i>Saddhāti imāsam sattannaṃ samāpattiṇaṃ nibbattanatthāya saddhā.</i>	"Faith" means the faith necessary for attaining these seven attainments.
<i>Vīriyādīsupi eseva nayo.</i>	In energy, etc., the way (of explanation) is the same (as with faith).
<i>Padaheyyanti payogaṃ kareyyam.</i>	"If I endeavored" means if I made an effort.
<i>Nacirasseva tam dhammam sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja vihāsimīti bodhisatto kira vīriyam paggahetvā</i>	"indeed soon, quickly, attained, entered, (and) dwelled in that teachings by (my) own supernatural knowledge" means that the <i>Bodhisatta</i> indeed concentrated (his) energy, and
<i>katipāhaññeva satta suvaṇṇanissenīyo pasārento viya satta samāpattiyo nibbatesi; tasmā evamāha.</i>	Just within a few days ⁵⁰ attained the seven attainments as if (just) spreading seven ladders (made of Indian madder); hence (the Buddha) said so.

<i>Atha khvāham, bhāradvāja, yena ālāro kālāmo tenupasaṅkamim; upasaṅkamitvā ālāram kālāmam etadavocaṃ –</i>	Then I, Bhāradvāja, indeed approached there where was Ālāra Kālāma. When I approached (him), I told this to Ālāra Kālāma:
<i>‘ettāvatā no, āvuso kālāma, imaṃ dhammam sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja pavedesī’ti?</i>	'Is it this much, friend Kālāma, that you proclaim to us the attainment (and) entering this teaching by (one's) own supernatural knowledge?
<i>‘Ettāvatā kho aham, āvuso, imaṃ dhammam sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja pavedemī’ti.</i>	"Indeed that much, friend, I proclaim the attainment (and) entering this teaching by (one's) own supernatural knowledge.
<i>‘Ahampi kho, āvuso, ettāvatā imaṃ dhammam sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharāmīti.</i>	"Even I, friend, have that much attained, entered, (and) dwell in this teaching by (my) own supernatural knowledge.
<i>‘Lābhā no, āvuso, suladdham no, āvuso, ye mayam āyasmantaṃ tādisaṃ sabrahmacāriṃ passāma.</i>	"It is a gain for us, friend; it is a good gain for us, friend, that we see the venerable sir of such a good holy life.
<i>Iti yāham dhammam sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja pavedemi tam tvaṃ dhammam sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharasi;</i>	Thus the teaching of which I proclaim attainment (and) entrance by (one's) own supernatural knowledge, that (same) teaching you have attained, entered, (and) dwell in by (your) own supernatural knowledge.

⁴⁹ *Visuddhimagga* explains the Base of Nothingness in detail. See below its explanation of the word-meaning:

"... it has no owning (*kiñcana*), this it is non-owning (*akiñcana*); what is meant is that it has not even the mere act of its dissolution remaining. The state (essence) of non-owning is nothingness (*ākiñcañña*). This is a term for the disappearance of the consciousness belonging to the base consisting of boundless space [i.e. the sixth absorption]. That nothingness is the "base" in the sense of foundation for that jhāna, as the "deities' base" [*devāyatana*, i.e. heaven] is for deities, thus it is the "base consisting of nothingness." (From "*Path of Purification (Visuddhimagga)*", by Bhaddantācariya Buddhaghosa, tr. by Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoli, Buddhist Publication Society, 2010 [first edition in 1975]; pp.329-330/PDF pp.387-388. I have omitted footnotes and par. numbering to encourage reading of the original book.)

⁵⁰ I.e. two or three days (says the verbatim Pāli-Burmese translation). Ordinary people may need a decade or two.

<i>yaṃ tvaṃ dhammaṃ sayaṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharasi tamahaṃ dhammaṃ sayaṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja pavedemi.</i>	That teaching that you have attained, entered, (and) dwell in by (your) own supernatural knowledge, that (is) the teaching of which I proclaim attainment (and) entrance by (one's) own supernatural knowledge.
<i>Iti yāhaṃ dhammaṃ jānāmi taṃ tvaṃ dhammaṃ jānāsi, yaṃ tvaṃ dhammaṃ jānāsi tamahaṃ dhammaṃ jānāmi.</i>	Thus the teaching that I know, that (same) teaching you know, that teaching that you know, that (same) teaching I know.
<i>Iti yādiso ahaṃ tādiso tuvaṃ, yādiso tuvaṃ tādiso ahaṃ.</i>	Thus as am I, you are the same; as are you, I am the same.
<i>Ehi dāni, āvuso, ubhova santā imaṃ gaṇaṃ pariharāmā'ti.</i>	Come, friend, now (we) shall care for this group (of students) staying both (together), indeed."
<i>Iti kho, bhāradvāja, āḷāro kālāmo ācariyo me samāno attano antevāsīṃ maṃ samānaṃ attanā samasamaṃ thapesi, uḷārāya ca maṃ pūjāya pūjesi.</i>	Thus, Bhāradvāja, Āḷāra Kālāma being my teacher, me being his own student, placed me on the same level as himself and offered me the greatest offerings.
<i>Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, etadahosi – 'nāyaṃ dhammo nibbidāya na virāgāya na nirodhāya na upasamāya na abhiññāya na sambodhāya na nibbānāya saṃvattati, yāvadeva ākiñcaññāyatanūpapattiyā'ti.</i>	Then, Bhāradvāja, this occurred to me: "This teaching does not culminate in dispassion (to rebirth), not in non-craving, not in cessation of lust, not in cessation of all defilement, not in supernatural knowledge, not in thorough awakening (to the Truth), not in the attainment of Enlightenment ⁵¹ , (being) as high ("much") as the arising of the Base of Nothingness."
<i>So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, taṃ dhammaṃ analaṅkaritvā tasmā dhammā nibbijja apakkamiṃ.</i>	Hence I, Bhāradvāja, indeed displeased with that teaching and dispassionate for that teaching, I left.

<i>Lābhā no, āvusoti anusūyako kiresa kālāmo.</i>	"It is gain for us, friend" means that Kālāma was indeed not jealous.
<i>Tasmā "ayaṃ adhunāgato, kinti katvā imaṃ dhammaṃ nibbattesi"ti usūyaṃ akatvā pasanno pasādaṃ pavedento evamāha.</i>	Therefore, not being jealous ("making jealousy") (thinking): "This (one) has (just) now come, what did (he) do that (he) attained this teaching (so quickly)?" And respectfully expressing respect, said so (the Buddha).
<i>Ubhova santā imaṃ gaṇaṃ pariharāmā'ti "mahā ayaṃ gaṇo, dvepi janā pariharāmā"ti vatvā gaṇassa saññāṃ adāsi,</i>	"(We) shall carry out (the teaching) for this group (of students) staying both (together), indeed" means "large is this group, (we) will carry out (the teaching) in two indeed" said (Kālāma) and announced to the group:
<i>"ahampi sattannaṃ samāpattīnaṃ lābhī, mahāpurisopi sattannameva, ettakā janā mahāpurisassa santike parikammaṃ uggaṇhatha, ettakā mayha"nti majjhe bhinditvā adāsi.</i>	"As well as I have attained the seven attainments, the great man (attained) just the seven too; this number of people take the meditation instruction from the great man, this number of people from me" (saying so) he divided (his students) in the middle and gave (one half to the <i>Bodhisatta</i>).
<i>Uḷārāyāti uttamāya.</i>	"By the greatest" means by ultimate.
<i>Pūjāyāti kālāmassa kira upaṭṭhākā itthiyopi purisāpi gandhamālādīni gaheṭvā āgacchanti.</i>	"Offerings" means, indeed, the women and men as well who supported Kālāma took perfumes (and) flowers and arrived (at Kālāma's place).
<i>Kālāmo – "gacchatha, mahāpurisaṃ pūjethā"ti vadati.</i>	Kālāma says: "Go (pl.), make offerings to the great man."
<i>Te taṃ pūjetvā yaṃ avasiṭṭhaṃ hoti, tena kālāmaṃ pūjenti.</i>	They made offerings for him (i.e., the <i>Bodhisatta</i>), and what remained by that they made offerings for Kālāma.
<i>Mahagghāni mañcapīṭhāni āharanti; tānipi mahāpurisassa dāpetvā yadi avasiṭṭhaṃ hoti, attanā gaṇhāti.</i>	(The people) bring valuable beds (and) chairs, those they also offer to the great man and what was leftover, that (Kālāma) takes himself.
<i>Gatagataṭṭhāne varasenāsanam bodhisattassa jaggāpetvā sesakaṃ attanā gaṇhāti.</i>	Wherever (they) went, (Kālāma) requested (people) to clean the supreme bedding, and himself took what remained.
<i>Evaṃ uḷārāya pūjāya pūjesi.</i>	Thus (Kālāma) offered the greatest offerings.

⁵¹ Here "Nibbāna" is understood in the ultimate meaning, keeping it therefore at the end. The word can be analysed into two parts: *ni* (= out), *vana* (= blow), and with the analogy of an oil-lamp or camp-fire that cannot burn more when there is no more fuel, *Nibbāna* is the ultimate cessation from rebirth caused by the absolute absence of all craving (*taṇhā*) and ignorance (*avijjā*).

<i>Nāyaṃ dhammo nibbidāyātiādīsu ayaṃ sattasamāpattidhammo neva vaṭṭe nibbindanattāya, na virajjanattāya, na rāgādinirodhattāya,</i>	"This teaching does not culminate in dispassion, etc." means "this teaching of seven attainments is neither for the dispassion for rebirth, nor for removal of (mental) defilement, nor for cessation of lust,
<i>na upasamattāya, na abhiññeyyadhammaṃ abhijānanattāya, na catumaggasambodhāya⁵², na nibbānasacchikiriyāya saṃvattatī attho.</i>	Nor for cessation of all defilement, nor for the supernatural realization of the teachings that should be known supernaturally, nor does it culminate in the Awakening by the Four Paths ⁵³ , (or) in the attainment of Enlightenment;" (that) is the meaning.

<i>Yāvadeva ākiñcaññāyatanūpapattiyāti yāva saṭṭhikappasahassāyuparimāṇe ākiñcaññāyatanabhava upapatti, tāvadeva saṃvattati, na tato uddham.</i>	"(Being) as high ("much") as the arising of the Base of Nothingness" means it culminates only in as much as is the birth in the existence of Base of Nothingness where the life-span has the extent of sixty-thousand eons, not more than that.
<i>Evamayaṃ punarāvattanadhammoyeva; yañca thānaṃ pāpeti, taṃ jātijarāmarañehi aparimuttameva maccupāsaparikkhittamevāti.</i>	Thus this is just teaching that (leads) to further rebirth; the place that (the teaching) takes (one) to, that (place) is simply not free from birth, old age, (and) death; (it) is simply surrounded by the fetter of death. ⁵⁴
<i>Tato paṭṭhāya ca pana mahāsatto yathā nāma chātājhattapuriso manuññabhojanaṃ labhitvā sampiyāyamānopi bhujjivā</i>	And right since then the great being, like for example when a man who (suffered) hunger pangs have received delicious food and ate (it) with appetite,
<i>pittavasena vā semhavasena vā makkhikāvasena⁵⁵ vā chaḍḍetvā puna ekaṃ piṇḍampi bhujjissāmīti maṇaṃ na uppādeti;</i>	Upon refusing it due to a bile (ailment), or due to a phlegm (ailment), or due flies will not arouse the desire (thinking): "I will eat one more lump;"
<i>evameva imā satta samāpattiyo mahantena ussāhena nibbattetvāpi, tāsu imaṃ punarāvattikādibhedam ādīnavaṃ disvā,</i>	In just that way (the great being), having attained these seven attainments by great effort, having seen this their drawbacks in detail, such as continued rebirth, ⁵⁶
<i>puna imaṃ dhammaṃ āvajjissāmi vā samāpajjissāmi vā adhiṭṭhahissāmi vā vuṭṭhahissāmi vā paccavekkhissāmi vāti cittameva na uppādesi.</i>	Didn't arouse even a thought (such as): (1) "I will consider this attainment again," or (2) "I will attain (it)," or (3) "I will make the determination (to dwell in it)," or (4) "I will exit ("rise up) (from it)," or (5) "I will reflect (on it)." ⁵⁷
<i>Analaṅkaritvāti alaṃ iminā, alaṃ imināti punappunaṃ alaṅkaritvā⁵⁸.</i>	"Displeased" means "enough of this, enough of this," saying ("doing") "enough" repeatedly.
<i>Nibbijjāti nibbinditvā.</i>	"Dispassionate" means being disgusted.
<i>Apakkaminti agamāsīm.</i>	"I left" means I went (away).
476. "So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, kiṃkusalagavesī anuttaraṃ santivarapadaṃ pariyesamāno yena udako rāmaputto tenupasaṅkamim; upasaṅkamitvā udakaṃ rāmaputtaṃ etadavocaṃ –	476. "Then thus, having gone forth, (I) was searching what was skillful, the supreme word ("Enlightenment") of the ultimate peace. Seeking (that), I approached where there was Udaka, the son of Rāma. Having approached (him), I told this to Udaka, the son of Rāma:

⁵² The verbatim Pāli-Burmese translation has instead "*catusaccasambodhāya*" (= Awakening into the Four (Noble) Truths).

⁵³ There are four levels so called "Fruitions" (*Phala*) of Awakening/Enlightenment, and each is preceded by "Path" (*Magga*). Thus there are Four Paths and Four Fruitions for each level of Enlightenment.

⁵⁴ Tipiṭakadhara Mingun Sayadaw says: "It is, in fact, a region already encircled by the snares of the King of Death." (*"The Chronicle of Buddhas"*, vol.2, p.144/PDF p.162.)

⁵⁵ The verbatim Pāli-Burmese translation has instead "*pacchimakāvasena*" (= due to (the food) being of inferior (quality)). I suppose this means stale etc. The Sub-Commentary however also reads *makkhikāvasena* and explains: "*Makkhikāvasenāti bhōjanassa makkhikāmissatāvasena*" = "Due to flies' means due to the food being mixed with flies."

⁵⁶ The Sub-Commentary glosses: "*Bodhisattassa tā samāpattiyo nibbattetvā thitassa purimajātīparicayena ñāṇassa ca mahantatāya tāsam gati ca abhisamparāyo ca upaṭṭhāsi.*" = "When the *bodhisatta* attained those attainments, he realized ("occurred") the next birth (caused by the attainments) as well as the birth after the next, through (his) knowledge by acquaintance with (his) previous lives and the greatness (of the *bodhisatta*)." So it seems the *bodhisatta* remembered his past lives, or at least some of them. Then some may ask: "If the *bodhisatta* remembered his past lives, why didn't he simply follow the Middle Path taught to him by Buddhas of the past?" I suppose that these were exactly the lives he still didn't remember, or perhaps he remembered them but not with sufficient detail.

⁵⁷ These are the five masteries (*pañca vasiyo*) of *samatha* practice. These masteries are necessary to practice in order to purify the already attained attainment of absorption (*jhāna*), they are usually not taught to beginners.

⁵⁸ The Sub-Commentary says "*Analaṅkaritvāti anu anu alaṅkatvā*" = "Displeased" means saying ("doing") "enough" again and again. – The word *analaṅkaritvā* is therefore analysed into *anu* (= repeatedly) and *alaṅkaritvā* (= saying "enough"). From this explanation "*alaṅkaritvā*" well fits the context of the original text as well as the Commentaries, i.e. when we take this second sense of the word - *alaṃ karoti* (= "says 'enough'") instead of the more common *alaṅkaroti* (= "decorates").

'icchāmaḥaṃ, āvuso [passa ma. ni. 1.278 pāsārāsīsutte], ⁵⁹ imasmim̐ dhammavinaye brahmacariyaṃ caritu'nti.	"Friend [see (a comment) in <i>MN 26. Pāsārāsi Sutta. par.278</i>], I want to live a holy life in these teachings and discipline."
Evaṃ vutte, bhāradvāja, udako rāmaputto maṃ etadavoca – 'viharatāyasmā.	Saying so, Bhāradvāja, Udaka, the son of Rāma told me this: May the venerable sir stay (here);
Tādiso ayaṃ dhammo yattha viññū puriso nacirasseva sakaṃ ācariyakaṃ sayam̐ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja vihareyyā'ti.	This is the kind of teachings, where the knowledgeable man might soon attain, enter, and dwell by (his) own supernatural knowledge in the (attainment) of (his) own teacher."
So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, nacirasseva khippameva taṃ dhammaṃ pariyāpunim̐.	Hence I, Bhāradvāja, soon, indeed quickly, mastered those teachings.
So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, tāvatakena va oṭṭhapahatamattena lapitāpanamattena 'ñānavādañca vadāmi, theravādañca jānāmi, passāmi'ti ca paṭijānāmi, ahañceva aññe ca.	Thus I, Bhāradvāja, (at that time) claim that I speak the teachings on knowledge, know and see the teachings on eternity: as much as is the contact of lips (during saying so), as much as is the repeating of what (Udaka) said; both me and others.
Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, etadahosi – 'na kho rāmo imaṃ dhammaṃ kevalaṃ saddhāmatkena sayam̐ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharāmi'ti pavesesi; addhā rāmo imaṃ dhammaṃ jānaṃ passaṃ vihāsi'ti.	Then, Bhāradvāja, it occurred to me: "Indeed, Rāma did not claim 'I have attained, enter, (and) dwell in this teachings by (my) own supernatural knowledge' entirely just by faith; verily, Rāma dwelled in this teachings knowing (and) seeing (it in reality).
Atha khvāhaṃ, bhāradvāja, yena udako rāmaputto tenupasaṅkamim̐; upasaṅkamitvā udakaṃ rāmaputtaṃ etadavocaṃ –	"So I, Bhāradvāja, indeed approached where was Udaka, the son of Rāma. Having approached (him), I told this to Udaka, the son of Rāma:
'kittāvatā no, āvuso, rāmo imaṃ dhammaṃ sayam̐ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharāmi'ti pavesesi'ti?	"Friend, to what extent did Rāma proclaim: 'I attain, enter, (and) dwell in these teachings by (my) own supernatural knowledge'?"
Evaṃ vutte, bhāradvāja, udako rāmaputto nevasaññānāsaññāyatanaṃ pavesesi.	Having spoken thus, Bhāradvāja, Udaka, the son of Rāma proclaimed (the attainment as) the Base of Neither-Perception-Nor-Non-Perception. ⁶⁰

⁵⁹ A gloss here refers us to first version of this text in this book (*Majjhima Nikāya*), namely in *Pāsārāsi Sutta* (also known as *Ariyapariyesanā Sutta*), *MN 26*. There we find a nice critique (I suppose composed by Tipiṭakadhara Mingun Sayadaw) of the mistake which occurs in the Sinhalese (Sri Lankan), Thai, and Cambodian/Khmer texts, which goes in contradiction to the story and is refuted by the Sub-Commentaries as well. In fact, the mistake *formerly* led I.B. Horner and other great Pāli scholars in the west to suppose that the *bodhisatta* visited Udaka Rāma (because the non-Burmese texts claim the *bodhisatta* called his new teacher as "Rāma" – "*āvuso rāma*") and learned the eighth attainment from Rāma himself. The Burmese version, again of course well acquainted with the Sub-Commentaries, is clear that Udaka was son of Rāma (hence his correct name Udaka Rāmaputta), and he (i.e. Udaka) was not a teacher of the *bodhisatta* (in the sense of attainments), because both had the seventh attainment. Hence they were "*sabrahmacārī*" (i.e. companions in holy life), rather than a teacher and a student. (Note that the two are here compared by attainment, not by knowledge.)

⁶⁰ The explanation of "Base of Neither-Perception-Nor-Non-Perception" is illustratively supplied by *Visuddhimagga*:

"The word meaning here is this: that jhāna with its associated states neither has perception nor has no perception because of the absence of gross perception and the presence of subtle perception, thus it is "neither perception nor non-perception" (*n'eva-saññā-nāsaññā*). It is "neither perception nor non-perception" and it is a "base" (*āyatana*) because it is included in the mind-base (*manāyatana*) and the mental-object base (*dhammāyatana*), thus it is the "base consisting of neither perception nor non-perception" (*nevasaññānāsaññāyatana*). [The Sub-Commentary for *Visuddhimagga* explains, that "perception" was selected from these states for the name of the attainment in respect of the difference in beings due to perception, in the way it is mentioned in *DN 33. Saṅgīti Sutta (Navasattāvāsā)* and *AN 9.3.4. Sattāvāsa S.*]

Or alternatively: the perception here is neither perception, since it is incapable of performing the decisive function of perception, nor yet non-perception, since it is present in a subtle state as a residual formation, thus it is "neither perception nor non-perception." It is "neither perception nor non-perception" and it is a "base" in the sense of a foundation for the other states, thus it is the "base consisting of neither perception nor non-perception." And here it is not only perception that is like this, but feeling as well is neither-feeling-nor-non-feeling, consciousness is neither-consciousness-nor-non-consciousness, and contact is neither-contact-nor-non-contact, and the same description applies to the rest of the associated states; but it should be understood that this presentation is given in terms of perception.

And the meaning should be illustrated by the similes beginning with the smearing of oil on the bowl. A novice smeared a bowl with oil, it seems, and laid it aside. When it was time to drink gruel, an elder told him to bring the bowl. He said, "Venerable sir, there is oil in the bowl." But then when he was told, "Bring the oil, novice, I shall fill the oil tube," he replied, "There is no oil, venerable sir." Herein, just as "There is oil" is in the sense of incompatibility with the gruel because it has been poured into [the bowl] and just as "There is no oil" is in the sense of filling the oil tube, etc., so too this perception is "neither perception" since it is incapable of performing the decisive function of perception and it is "nor non-perception" because it is present in a subtle form as a residual formation." (From "*Path of Purification (Visuddhimagga)*", by Bhadantācariya Buddhaghosa, tr. by Bhikkhu Ñānamoli, Buddhist Publication Society, 2010 [first edition in 1975]; pp.332-333/PDF pp.390-391. (I have omitted footnotes and par. numbering to encourage reading of the original book.)

<i>Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, etadahosi – ‘na kho rāmasseva ahosi saddhā, mayhaṃpatthi saddhā; na kho rāmasseva ahosi vīriyaṃ...pe... sati... samādhī... paññā, mayhaṃpatthi paññā.</i>	Then, Bhāradvāja, this occurred to me: "Indeed, not only Rāma had faith, I also have faith indeed; not only Rāma had energy ...rep... mindfulness... concentration... wisdom, I also have wisdom indeed.
<i>Yaṃnūnāhaṃ yaṃ dhammaṃ rāmo sayāṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharāmīti pavesesi tassa dhammassa sacchikiriyāya padaheyya’nti.</i>	What if I endeavored to attain the teachings which ("teachings") Rāma proclaimed (as): "I attain, enter, (and) dwell in (this teaching) by (my) own supernatural knowledge."
<i>So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, nacirasseva khippameva taṃ dhammaṃ sayāṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja vihāsiṃ.</i>	Hence I, Bhāradvāja, indeed soon, quickly, attained, entered, (and) dwelled in that teachings by (my) own supernatural knowledge.

<i>“Atha khvāhaṃ, bhāradvāja, yena udako rāmaputto tenupasaṅkamim; upasaṅkamitvā udakaṃ rāmaputtaṃ etadavocaṃ –</i>	Then I, Bhāradvāja, indeed approached where was Udaka, the son of Rāma. When I approached (him), I told this to Udaka, the son of Rāma:
<i>‘ettāvatā no, āvuso, rāmo imaṃ dhammaṃ sayāṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja pavesesī’ti?</i>	'Is it this much, friend, that Rāma proclaimed the attainment (and) entering this teaching by (one's) own supernatural knowledge?
<i>‘Ettāvatā kho, āvuso, rāmo imaṃ dhammaṃ sayāṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja pavesesī’ti.</i>	"Indeed that much, friend, Rāma proclaimed the attainment (and) entering this teaching by (one's) own supernatural knowledge.
<i>‘Ahampi kho, āvuso, ettāvatā imaṃ dhammaṃ sayāṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharāmīti.</i>	"Even I, friend, have that much attained, entered, (and) dwell in this teaching by (my) own supernatural knowledge.
<i>‘Lābhā no, āvuso, suladdhaṃ no, āvuso, ye mayaṃ āyasmantaṃ tādisaṃ sabrahmacāriṃ passāma.</i>	"It is a gain for us, friend; it is a good gain for us, friend, that we see the venerable sir of such a good, holy life.
<i>Iti yaṃ dhammaṃ rāmo sayāṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja pavesesi taṃ tvaṃ dhammaṃ sayāṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharasi;</i>	Thus the teaching of which Rāma proclaimed attainment (and) entrance by (one's) own supernatural knowledge, that (same) teaching you have attained, entered, (and) dwell in by (your) own supernatural knowledge.
<i>yaṃ tvaṃ dhammaṃ sayāṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharasi taṃ dhammaṃ rāmo sayāṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja pavesesi.</i>	That teaching that you have attained, entered, (and) dwell in by (your) own supernatural knowledge, that (is) the teaching of which Rāma proclaimed attainment (and) entrance by (one's) own supernatural knowledge.
<i>Iti yaṃ dhammaṃ rāmo abhiññāsi taṃ tvaṃ dhammaṃ jānāsi, yaṃ tvaṃ dhammaṃ jānāsi taṃ dhammaṃ rāmo abhiññāsi.</i>	Thus the teaching that Rāma supernaturally knew, that (same) teaching you know, that teaching that you know, that (same) teaching Rāma supernaturally knew.
<i>Iti yādiso rāmo ahosi tādiso tvaṃ, yādiso tvaṃ tādiso rāmo ahosi.</i>	Thus as was Rāma, you are the same; as are you, Rāma was the same.
<i>Ehi dāni, āvuso, tvaṃ imaṃ gaṇaṃ pariharā’ti.</i>	Come, friend, now you shall carry out (the teaching) for this group (of students).
<i>Iti kho, bhāradvāja, udako rāmaputto sabrahmacārī me samāno ācariyaṭṭhāne maṃ ṭhapesi, uḷārāya ca maṃ pūjāya pūjesi.</i>	Thus, Bhāradvāja, Udaka, the son of Rāma, being (my) companion in the holy life, placed me on the level of (his) teacher and offered to me the greatest offerings (as well).
<i>Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, etadahosi – ‘nāyaṃ dhammo nibbidāya na virāgāya na nirodhāya na upasamāya na abhiññāya na sambodhāya na nibbānāya</i>	Then, Bhāradvāja, this occurred to me: "This teaching does not culminate in dispassion (to rebirth), not in non-craving, not in cessation of lust, not in cessation of all defilement, not in supernatural knowledge, not in

<i>saṃvattati, yāvadeva nevasaññānāsaññāyatanūpapattiyā'ti.</i>	thorough awakening (to the Truth), not in the attainment of Enlightenment, (being) as high ("much") as the arising of the Base of Neither-Perception-Nor-Non-Perception." ⁶¹
<i>So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, taṃ dhammaṃ analaṅkaritvā tasmā dhammā nibbijja apakkamiṃ.</i>	Then I, Bhāradvāja, indeed displeased with that teaching, and dispassionate for that teaching, I left. ⁶²
<i>278. Na kho rāmo imaṃ dhammanti idhāpi bodhisatto taṃ dhammaṃ uggaṇhantoyeva aññāsi –</i>	278. "Indeed, Rāma (did not claim 'I have attained...') this teachings" means even here, just when the <i>Bodhisatta</i> (by word) memorized that teaching, he realized:
<i>"nāyaṃ aṭṭhasamāpattidhammo udakassa vācāya uggahitamattova, addhā panesa aṭṭhasamāpattilābhi'ti.</i>	"This teaching of eight attainments is not learned (by Rāma) only as much as is the word of Udaka, but verily he (i.e., Rāma) had attained the eight attainments (himself)."
<i>Tenassa etadahosi – "na kho rāmo...pe... jānaṃ passaṃ vihāsi'ti.</i>	Hence it occurred to him (i.e., to the <i>Bodhisatta</i>): "Indeed, Rāma did not...rep.... dwelled (in this teachings) knowing (and) seeing (it in reality)."
<i>Sesamettha purimavāre vuttanayeneva veditabbaṃ.</i>	What there (in the main text) remains (for explanation) that should be known from the previous portion in the way it was said (there).

Parth Two: The Three Similes on Kindling Fire

<i>477. "So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, kiṃkusalagavesī anuttaraṃ santivarapadaṃ pariyesamāno magadhesu anupubbena cārikaṃ caramāno yena uruveḷā senānigamo tadavasariṃ.</i>	477. "Then, Bhāradvāja, I was searching what was skilful, the supreme word ("Enlightenment") of the ultimate peace, and as (I) was journeying on a gradual journey in (the kingdom of) Māgadha, (I) settled there where was the Uruveḷa (Forest) (in) the Village Sena.
<i>Tatthaddasaṃ ramaṇīyaṃ bhūmibhāgaṃ, pāsādikañca vanasaṇḍaṃ, nadiñca sandantiṃ setakaṃ supatitthaṃ ramaṇīyaṃ, samantā ca gocaraḡamaṃ.</i>	There I saw a charming piece of land with gorgeous forests ⁶³ , a flowing pure (and) well-located charming river (Nerañjarā) as well, with an alms-providing village all around.
<i>Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, etadahosi – 'ramaṇīyo vata, bho, bhūmibhāgo, pāsādiko ca vanasaṇḍo, nadī ca sandati setakā supatitthā ramaṇīyā, samantā ca gocaraḡamo.</i>	Then, Bhāradvāja, it occurred to me: "Friend, indeed charming (is this) piece of land, with gorgeous forests and the flowing pure (and) well located charming river, with an alms-providing village all around.
<i>Alaṃ vatidaṃ kulaputtassa padhānatthikassa padhānāyā'ti.</i>	Oh, certainly this is for a clansman keen on making an effort in order that (he) makes an effort.
<i>So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, tattheva nisidiṃ – 'alamidaṃ padhānāyā'ti.</i>	Then I, Bhāradvāja, indeed sat down right there – "Oh, this (place) is (suitable) for making an effort." ⁶⁴

<i>MNA 26. Pāsarāsisuttavaṇṇanā</i>	Commentary for MN 26. Discourse on the Variety of Fetters
-------------------------------------	---

⁶¹ Tipiṭakadhara Mingun Sayadaw adds: "In fact, these eight attainments result at most only in the Brahma abode of Nevasaññā-nāsaññāyatana where one lives for eighty-four thousand *Mahā-kappas*, but they cannot produce any benefit superior to that. The highest Brahma world of Nevasaññā-nāsaññāyatana in which the same *Jhāna* results is also only a realm not liberated from the dangers of birth, decay and death. It is, in fact, a region already encircled by the snares of the King of Death." (*The Chronicle of Buddhas*, vol.2, p.148/PDF p.166.)

⁶² Ibid. p.145/PDF p.163.: "As for Udaka himself, only when the Bodhisatta had left him, he was greatly overcome by *saṃvega* [i.e. realizing the problem of life as an urgent matter] and (after he) made exertion to gain the attainments, he realized Jhānas up to Nevasaññā-nāsaññāyatana."

⁶³ *vana* (= forest), *saṇḍa* (= aggregation, group). It is therefore a group of forests, or a large forested area.

⁶⁴ Tipiṭakadhara Mingun Sayadaw mentions in his *The Great Chronicle of Buddhas*, Eng. tr. by U Ko Lay and U Tin Lwin, Ti=Ni Publishing Center, 2006; vol.2, part 1, p.149, that "he [i.e. the *bodhisatta*] built a small dwelling place with available dry firewood and leaves and stayed in the forest of Uruvelā to engage in meditation."

279. <i>Yena uruvelā senānigamoti ettha uruvelāti mahāvelā, mahāvālikarāsīti attho.</i>	279. "Where was the Uruvela (Forest) in the Village Sena" (has the) meaning that there "Uruvela" is of abundant sand, of a large heap of sand.
<i>Atha vā urūti vālikā vuccati; velāti mariyādā, velātikamanahetu āhaṭṭa uru uruvelāti evamettha attho daṭṭhabbo.</i>	Or, in another way, "urū" means sand; "velā" is the boundary (of morality), (therefore) "uruvelā" means the sand brought because of transgressing the boundary (of morality); thus, the meaning should be known.
<i>Aṭṭe kira anuppanne buddhe dasasahassā kulaputtā tāpasapabbajjaṃ pabbajitvā tasmim padese viharantā ekadivasaṃ sannipatitvā katikavattaṃ akāmsu –</i>	In fact, in the past, before the Buddha was born, ten thousand clansmen went forth (from home) to become ascetics, and after going forth they stayed in that region. One day they assembled and made an agreement:
<i>"kāyakammavacīkammāni nāma paresampi pākaṭāni honti, manokammaṃ pana apākaṭaṃ.</i>	"The so-called 'action by body' and 'action by speech' are evident even to others; the 'action by mind' is however not evident.
<i>Tasmā yo kāmavitakkaṃ vā byāpādavittakkaṃ vā vihiṃsāvittakkaṃ vā vittakketi, tassa añño codako nāma natthi;</i>	Therefore, whoever thinks the thought of sensual pleasures, or the thought of anger, or the thought of harm, no one other will be an accuser as such,
<i>so attanāva attānaṃ codetvā pattapuṭena vālikaṃ āharitvā imasmim ṭhāne ākiratu, idamassa daṇḍakamma"nti.</i>	(hence) he himself will accuse himself, bring sand in a leaf-basket (and) empty (it) in this place – this is the work of punishment for him."
<i>Tato paṭṭhāya yo tādisaṃ vitakkaṃ vittakketi, so tattha pattapuṭena vālikaṃ ākirati, evaṃ tattha anukkamena mahāvālikarāsī jāto.</i>	Beginning since then, whoever thought that kind of thought, he emptied the sand from a leaf-basket there, (and) thus there gradually arose a large heap of sand.
<i>Tato taṃ pacchimā janatā parikkhipitvā cetiyaṭṭhānamakāsi; taṃ sandhāya vuttaṃ – "uruvelāti mahāvelā, mahāvālikarāsīti attho"ti.</i>	After that, the later generations surrounded (that place) and made (it) a sacred place; it is (therefore) told in connection to that: "'Uruvela' is of abundant sand, meaning there was a large heap of sand."
<i>Tameva sandhāya vuttaṃ – "atha vā urūti vālikā vuccati, velāti mariyādā.</i>	Even in connection with that, it is said: "In another way, 'urū' means sand; 'velā' is a boundary (of morality).
<i>Velātikamanahetu āhaṭṭa uru uruvelāti evamettha attho daṭṭhabbo"ti.</i>	(therefore) "uruvelā" means the sand brought because of transgressing the boundary (of morality); thus the meaning should be known."

<i>Senānigamoti senāya nigamo.</i>	"Village Sena" is the village of an army.
<i>Paṭhamakappikānaṃ kira tasmim ṭhāne senāniveso ahoṣi;</i>	In fact, for the (people) of the first eon (out of five in this world) in (this) place, there was the residence of the army.
<i>tasmā so padeso senānigamoti vuccati. "Senāni-gāmo"tipi pāṭho.</i>	Therefore, that area is called "Village Sena". ⁶⁵
<i>Senāni nāma sujātāya pitā, tassa gāmoti attho.</i>	Senāni (is also) called the father of Sujātā, the meaning (of Village Sena) is (to be understood as) his village. ⁶⁶
<i>Tadavasarinti tattha osariṃ.</i>	"I settled there" means I entered.
<i>Ramaṇīyaṃ bhūmibhāganti supupphitanānappakārajalajathalajapupphavicittam manorammaṃ bhūmibhāgaṃ.</i>	"Charming piece of land" means abundant in flowers, diverse flowers growing in different ways from ground and water, and an enchanting piece of land.
<i>Pāsādikañca vanasaṇḍanti morapiñchakalāpasadisam pasādajananavanasāṇḍaṇca addasaṃ.</i>	"With gorgeous forests" means I saw forests arousing joy, like a bundle of peacock feathers.
<i>Nadiñca sandantinti sandamānañca maṇikkhandhasadisam vimalanīlasītalasalilam nerañjaraṃ nadiṃ addasaṃ.</i>	"The flowing river" means I saw the Nerañjarā river, perfect blue, cool (and) pure, like a lump of a gem.
<i>Setakanti parisuddhaṃ nikkaddamaṃ.</i>	"Pure" means clean, without scum.
<i>Supatitthanti anupubbagambhīrehi sundarehi titthehi upetaṃ.</i>	"Well located" means complete in beautiful embankments (entering) gradually in the depth (of the river).

⁶⁵ Because the army didn't reside there any more, and because of the ambiguity of the name I keep the Pāli name to prevent readers from confusion.

⁶⁶ The lady Sujātā was the first person to bring meal (milk-rice) to the *bodhisatta* after he gave up his austere practices.

<i>Ramaṇīyanti rajatapattasadisam vippakinnavālikam pahūtamacchakacchapaṃ abhirāmadassanaṃ.</i>	"Charming" means a fascinating view of (the river) with scattered sand like a silver coin, (and) an abundance of fish (and) tortoises.
<i>Samantā ca gocaraḡāṃanti tassa padesassa samantā avidūre gamaṇāgamanasampannaṃ sampattapabbajitānaṃ sulabhapiṇḍaṃ gocaraḡāmañca addasaṃ.</i>	"Alms-providing village all around" means all around that area, nearby; I saw an alms-providing village of an easily gained meal ("lump") for (any) arrived recluses, with many coming (and) going (people).
<i>Alaṃ vatāti samatthaṃ vata.</i>	"Oh, certainly" means certain to succeed.
<i>Tattheva nisīdinti bodhipallaṅke nisajjaṃ sandhāyāha.</i>	"Sat down right there" was said because (the <i>Bodhisatta</i>) sat down in the Enlightenment posture.
<i>Uparisuttasmiñhi tatthevāti dukkarakārikaṭṭhānaṃ adhippetam, idha pana bodhipallaṅko.</i>	In the discourse further ("above") by "right there" is intended the beginning of austere practices, here is (however meant) the Enlightenment posture ("throne"). ⁶⁷
<i>Tenāha – "tattheva nisīdi"nti.</i>	Therefore (the <i>bodhisatta</i>) said: "I sat down right there."
<i>Alamidaṃ padhānāyāti idaṃ ṭhānaṃ padhānatthāya samatthanti evaṃ cintetvā nisīdinti attho.</i>	"Oh, this (place) is (suitable) for making an effort" means "this place is (bringing) success in making effort", meaning, "I thought in that way and sat down."

<i>Apissu maṃ, bhāradvāja, tisso upamā paṭibhamsu anacchariyā pubbe assutapubbā.</i>	Then, Bhāradvāja, occurred to me (in my mind) indeed three similes repeatedly amazing, never heard before:
<i>"Seyyathāpi, bhāradvāja, allaṃ kaṭṭhaṃ sasnehaṃ uduke nikkhattaṃ.</i>	"Suppose, Bhāradvāja, that sticky wet wood is kept in water.
<i>Atha puriso āgaccheyya uttarāraṇiṃ ādāya – 'aggim abhinibbattessāmi, tejo pātukarissāmi'ti.</i>	Then a man would come, and taking a kindling stick (he would think): "I will kindle fire, I will make fire appear."
<i>Taṃ kiṃ maññasi, bhāradvāja, api nu so puriso amuṃ allaṃ kaṭṭhaṃ sasnehaṃ uduke nikkhattaṃ uttarāraṇiṃ ādāya abhimanthento aggim abhinibbatteyya, tejo pātukareyyā'ti?</i>	What do you think about that, Bhāradvāja, would that man, indeed, taking a kindling stick, (really) kindle fire on that sticky wet wood kept in water; would he make fire appear?
<i>"No hidaṃ, bho gotama.</i>	"Indeed, (I do) not (think) that, friend Gotama.
<i>Taṃ kissa hetu?</i>	What is the reason for that?
<i>Aduñhi, bho gotama, allaṃ kaṭṭhaṃ sasnehaṃ, tañca pana uduke nikkhattaṃ; yāvadeva ca pana so puriso kilamathassa vighātassa bhāḡi assā'ti.</i>	Friend Gotama, indeed, this kind of sticky wet wood that, moreover, is however kept in water, will be, however, only the cause of that man's exhaustion (and) suffering.
<i>"Evameva kho, bhāradvāja, ye hi keci samaṇā vā brāhmaṇā vā kāyena ceva cittaṇa ca kāmehi avūpakaṭṭhā viharanti,</i>	"Exactly so, Bhāradvāja, those certain ascetics or brahmins, who indeed stay undetached by their body and mind from sensual pleasures,
<i>yo ca nesaṃ kāmesu kāmacchando kāmasneho kāmamucchā kāmapipāsā kāmapariḷāho so ca ajjhattaṃ na suppaḡiṇo hoti na suppaṭippassaddho,</i>	Whose desire for sensual pleasures, the affection ⁶⁸ by sensual pleasures, the infatuation for sensual pleasures, the thirst for sensual pleasures, the fever for sensual pleasures, is also not well suppressed internally by them, not well allayed,
<i>opakkamikā cepi te bhonto samaṇabrāhmaṇā dukkhā tibbā kharā kaṭukā vedanā vedayanti, abhabbāva te ñāṇāya dassanāya anuttarāya sambodhāya.</i>	And those sirs ascetics (and) brahmins then, when torturing (themselves) further experience painful, sharp, harsh, bitter feelings, (and) they are indeed incapable of knowledge (and) vision of the ultimate full Enlightenment.
<i>No capi te bhonto samaṇabrāhmaṇā opakkamikā dukkhā tibbā kharā kaṭukā vedanā vedayanti abhabbāva te ñāṇāya dassanāya anuttarāya sambodhāya.</i>	But even if those sirs ascetics (and) brahmins further do not torture (themselves) to experience painful, sharp, harsh, bitter feelings, they will still be incapable of knowledge (and) vision of the ultimate full Enlightenment.

⁶⁷ This is the commentary for *Pāsārāsī Sutta* (MN 26). There this means that the *bodhisatta* is going to sit down under the Bodhi tree and attain Buddhahood. In our *Saṅgārava Sutta* (MN 100), as well as in the *Mahāsaccaka Sutta* (MN 36) it however implies the *bodhisatta* will engage in austere practices. Here in MN 100. Saṅgārava Sutta the *bodhisatta* will sit down under the Bodhi tree later in the text. The *MN 36. Mahāsaccaka Sutta's* Commentary for "tattheva nisīdim" explains in relation to the *bodhipallaṅka* meaning in *MN 26*. vs. *MN 36 (& MN 100) – "Ayaṃ pana viseso, tattha bodhipallaṅke nisajjā, idha dukkarakārikā."* = "This is however the difference, there (i.e. in MN 26) the sitting was in the Enlightenment posture, here (i.e. in *MN 36*) in order to engage in austere practices."

⁶⁸ Literally "stickiness", "moistness".

<i>Ayaṃ kho maṃ, bhāradvāja, paṭhamā upamā paṭibhāsi anacchariyā pubbe assutapubbā.</i>	This first simile, Bhāradvāja, indeed occurred to me, repeatedly amazing, never heard before.
---	---

<i>MNA 36. Mahāsaccakasuttavaṇṇanā</i>	Commentary to MN 36. Greater Discourse to Saccaka
<i>374. Allakattḥanti allaṃ udumbarakattḥam.</i>	374. "Wet wood" means wet fig wood.
<i>Sasnehanti sakhīraṃ.</i>	"Sticky" means "clammy".
<i>Kāmehīti vatthukāmehi.</i>	"From sensual pleasures" means pleasures of the (five) sensual objects. ⁶⁹
<i>Avūpakaṭṭhāti anapagatā.</i>	"Undetached" means not abandoned.
<i>Kāmacchandotiādīsu kilesakāmoḥa chandakaraṇavasena chando.</i>	In "desire for sensual pleasures," etc., the desire (is meant) as the desire that creates the sensual-desire defilement.
<i>Sinehakarāṇavasena sneho.</i>	Because it creates affection, (it is) affection.
<i>Mucchākarāṇavasena mucchā.</i>	Because it creates infatuation, (it is) infatuation. ⁷⁰
<i>Pipāsākarāṇavasena pipāsā.</i>	Because it creates thirst, (it is) thirst.
<i>Anudahanavasena pariḷāhoti vedītabbo.</i>	Because it follows (and) burns, it is fever; (thus) it should be known. ⁷¹
<i>Opakkamikāti upakkamanibbattā.</i>	"Torturing (themselves)" means (the feelings) arise due to austere practices.
<i>Ñāṇāya dassanāya anuttarāya sambodhāyāti sabbam lokuttaramaggavevacanameva.</i>	"Of knowledge (and) vision of the ultimate full Enlightenment" means simply all interpretations of the supramundane Path. ⁷²

<i>Idaṃ panettha opammasaṃsandanaṃ – allaṃ sakhīraṃ udumbarakattḥam viya hi kilesakāmena vatthukāmato anissaṭapuggalā.</i>	This is there then, the explanation ("combination") of the simile – indeed, like the wet sticky fig wood (they are) people not free from the (five) objects of sensual pleasures by the sensual-desire defilement.
<i>Udake pakkhittabhāvo viya kilesakāmena tintatā;</i>	Like when (the wood) is thrown in the water, (the people) are wet by the sensual-desire defilement.
<i>manthanenāpi aggino anabhinibbattanaṃ viya kilesakāmena vatthukāmato anissaṭanaṃ opakkamikāhi vedanāhi lokuttaramaggassa anadhigamo.</i>	Like even by drilling (the kindling stick in the wet wood), the fire won't get kindled; there is no attainment of supramundane Path by torturing (practices) for those not free from (five) objects of sensual-pleasures by the defilement of sensual-desire.
<i>Amanthanenāpi aggino anabhinibbattanaṃ viya tesam puggalānaṃ vināpi opakkamikāhi vedanāhi lokuttaramaggassa anadhigamo.</i>	Like even by not drilling (the kindling stick in the wet wood), the fire won't get kindled, and there is no attainment of a supramundane Path for those persons even without the feelings from (self-)torturing (practices).

<i>478. "Aparāpi kho maṃ, bhāradvāja, dutiyā upamā paṭibhāsi anacchariyā pubbe assutapubbā.</i>	478. "Then, Bhāradvāja, indeed another, the second simile occurred to me (in my mind), repeatedly amazing, never heard before.
<i>Seyyathāpi, bhāradvāja, allaṃ kattḥam sasnehaṃ ārakā udakā thale nikkhattam. Atha puriso āgaccheyya uttarānaṃ ādāya – 'aggim abhinibbattessāmi, tejo pātukarissāmi'.</i>	Suppose, Bhāradvāja, that sticky wet wood is kept further from water on the land. Then a man would come, and taking a kindling stick (he would think): "I will kindle fire, I will make fire appear."

⁶⁹ I.e. pleasant sights, sounds, smells, tastes, and bodily contacts. According to [AN 1 1.1. Rūpādivaggo](#), the Buddha said: "Monks, I do not find any other sight that stays enthralling man's mind than what is this, monks, the sight of a woman." (The same is for sound, smell, taste, and bodily contact with/of a woman.) The Buddha there says the same for women in relation to men.

⁷⁰ The Sub-Commentary explains that it is the basis for delusion (*moha*).

⁷¹ The Sub-Commentary adds that it follows and burns by the fire of lust (*rāga*).

⁷² The Subcommentary further explains: "*Allaggahaṇena kilesānaṃ asamucchinabhāvaṃ dasseti, sasnehaṃ avikkhambhitabhāvaṃ, udake pakkhittabhāvaggahaṇena samudācārāvattham, udumbarakattḥaggahaṇena attabhāvassa asārakattam.*" = By taking the sticky (wood), (the Buddha) points to the cutting of defilements not (done) completely, by taking the wet (wood) the absence of detachment (from objects of sensual pleasures), taking (the wood) kept in water has the meaning of dealing (/behavior) (with the purpose of enjoying sensual pleasures), (and) taking fig wood is because of the essencelessness of (one's) own self.

<i>Taṃ kiṃ maññasi, bhāradvāja, api nu so puriso amuṃ allam kaṭṭham sasneham ārakā udakā thale nikkhittam uttarāraṇiṃ ādāya abhimanthento aggim abhinibbatteyya tejo pātukareyyā”ti?</i>	What do you think about that, Bhāradvāja, would that man, indeed, taking a kindling stick, (really) kindle fire on that sticky wet wood kept further from the water, on the land; would he make fire appear?
<i>“No hidam, bho gotama.</i>	"Indeed, (I do) not (think) that, friend Gotama.
<i>Taṃ kissa hetu?</i>	What is the reason for that?
<i>Aduñhi, bho gotama, allam kaṭṭham sasneham, kiñcāpi ārakā udakā thale nikkhittam; yāvadeva ca pana so puriso kilamathassa vighātassa bhāgī assā”ti.</i>	Friend Gotama, indeed, this kind of sticky wet wood that, although even kept further from the water, on the land, will be, however, only the cause of that man's exhaustion (and) suffering.
<i>“Evameva kho, bhāradvāja, ye hi keci samaṇā vā brāhmaṇā vā kāyena ceva cittaṇa ca kāmehi vūpakaṭṭhā viharanti,</i>	"Exactly so, Bhāradvāja, those certain ascetics or Brahmins who indeed stay detached from sensual pleasures by both (their) body and mind,
<i>yo ca nesam kāmesu kāmacchando kāmasneho kāmamucchā kāmapipāsā kāmapariḷāho so ca ajjhattam na suppahīno hoti na suppaṭippassaddho,</i>	Whose desire for sensual pleasures, the affection by sensual pleasures, the infatuation for sensual pleasures, the thirst for sensual pleasures, the fever for sensual pleasures, is (however) not well suppressed internally by them, not well allayed,
<i>opakkamikā cepi te bhonto samaṇabrāhmaṇā dukkhā tibbā kharā kaṭukā vedanā vedayanti, abhabbāva te ñāṇāya dassanāya anuttarāya sambodhāya.</i>	And those sirs ascetics (and) brahmins then, when torturing (themselves) further experience painful, sharp, harsh, bitter feelings, (and) they are indeed incapable of knowledge (and) vision of the ultimate full Enlightenment.
<i>No cepi te bhonto samaṇabrāhmaṇā opakkamikā dukkhā tibbā kharā kaṭukā vedanā vedayanti, abhabbāva te ñāṇāya dassanāya anuttarāya sambodhāya.</i>	But even if those sirs ascetics (and) brahmins further do not torture (themselves) to experience painful, sharp, harsh, bitter feelings, they will still be incapable of knowledge (and) vision of the ultimate full Enlightenment.
<i>Ayaṃ kho maṃ, bhāradvāja, dutiyā upamā paṭibhāsi anacchariyā pubbe assutapubbā.</i>	This second simile, Bhāradvāja, indeed occurred to me, repeatedly amazing, never heard before.

<i>Dutiyaupamāpi imināva nayena veditabbā.</i>	Even the second simile should be known exactly in this way (mentioned above).
<i>Ayaṃ pana viseso, purimā saputtabhariyapabbajjāya upamā;</i>	However, this is the difference – formerly (it was) a simile for recluseship with wife (and) children;
<i>pacchimā brāhmaṇadhammikapabbajjāya.</i>	The later (simile was) for the recluseship according to the Brahmanical teaching (i.e. with wrong views).

<i>479. “Aparāpi kho maṃ, bhāradvāja, tatiyā upamā paṭibhāsi anacchariyā pubbe assutapubbā.</i>	479. "Then, Bhāradvāja, indeed another, the third simile occurred to me (in my mind), repeatedly amazing, never heard before.
<i>Seyyathāpi, bhāradvāja, sukkham kaṭṭham koḷāpaṃ ārakā udakā thale nikkhittam.</i>	Suppose, Bhāradvāja, that greaseless dry wood is kept further from water on the land.
<i>Atha puriso āgaccheyya uttarāraṇiṃ ādāya – ‘aggim abhinibbattessāmi, tejo pātukarissāmi”ti.</i>	Then a man would come, and taking a kindling stick (he would think): "I will kindle fire, I will make fire appear."
<i>Taṃ kiṃ maññasi, bhāradvāja, api nu so puriso amuṃ sukkham kaṭṭham koḷāpaṃ ārakā udakā thale nikkhittam uttarāraṇiṃ ādāya abhimanthento aggim abhinibbatteyya, tejo pātukareyyā”ti?</i>	What do you think about that, Bhāradvāja, would that man, indeed, taking a kindling stick, (really) kindle fire on that greaseless dry wood kept further from the water, on the land; would he make fire appear?
<i>“Evaṃ bho gotama.</i>	"(I think) so, friend Gotama.
<i>Taṃ kissa hetu?</i>	What is the reason for that?
<i>Aduñhi, bho gotama, sukkham kaṭṭham koḷāpaṃ, tañca pana ārakā udakā thale nikkhitta”nti.</i>	Friend Gotama, indeed, this (is) a kind of greaseless dry wood, moreover (it) is kept further from the water, on the land.
<i>“Evameva kho, bhāradvāja, ye hi keci samaṇā vā brāhmaṇā vā kāyena ceva cittaṇa ca kāmehi vūpakaṭṭhā viharanti,</i>	"Exactly so, Bhāradvāja, those certain ascetics or Brahmins who indeed stay detached from sensual pleasures by both (their) body and mind,
<i>yo ca nesam kāmesu kāmacchando kāmasneho kāmamucchā kāmapipāsā kāmapariḷāho so ca ajjhattam suppahīno hoti suppaṭippassaddho,</i>	Whose desire for sensual pleasures, the affection by sensual pleasures, the infatuation for sensual pleasures, the thirst for sensual pleasures, the fever for sensual

	pleasures, is internally well suppressed by them, well allayed,
<i>opakkamikā cepi te bhonto samaṇabrāhmaṇā dukkhā tippā kharā kaṭukā vedanā vedayanti, bhābbāva te ñāṇāya dassanāya anuttarāya sambodhāya.</i>	And those sirs ascetics (and) brahmins then when torturing (themselves) also (because they) experience painful, sharp, harsh, bitter feelings, they are indeed capable of knowledge (and) vision of the ultimate full Enlightenment.
<i>No cepi te bhonto samaṇabrāhmaṇā opakkamikā dukkhā tippā kharā kaṭukā vedanā vedayanti, bhābbāva te ñāṇāya dassanāya anuttarāya sambodhāya.</i>	But even if those sirs ascetics (and) brahmins further do not torture (themselves) to experience painful, sharp, harsh, bitter feelings, they will still be capable of knowledge (and) vision of the ultimate full Enlightenment.
<i>Ayaṃ kho maṃ, bhāradvāja, tatiyā upamā paṭibhāsi anacchariyā pubbe assutapubbā.</i>	This third simile, Bhāradvāja, indeed occurred to me, repeatedly amazing, never heard before.
<i>Imā kho maṃ, bhāradvāja, tisso upamā paṭibhaṃsu anacchariyā pubbe assutapubbā.</i>	These three similes, Bhāradvāja, indeed occurred to me, repeatedly amazing, never heard before.

<i>376. Tatiyaupamāya koḷāpanti chinnaśinehaṃ nirāpaṃ.</i>	376. In the third simile, "greaseless" means void of stickiness, without moisture.
<i>Thale nikkhittanti pabbatathale vā bhūmithale vā nikkhittaṃ.</i>	"Kept on the land" means kept either on the surface of a mountain or on the surface of the land.
<i>Etthāpi idaṃ opammasaṃsandanaṃ – sukkhakoḷāpakaṭṭhaṃ viya hi kilesakāmena vatthukāmato nissaṭapuggalā, ārakā udakā thale nikkhittabhāvo viya kilesakāmena atintatā.</i>	There, indeed, is this explanation ("combination") for the simile: like the greaseless dry wood, the persons devoid of the sensual-desire defilement, (devoid) of the (five) objects of sensual pleasure, are not wet by the sensual-desire defilement.
<i>Manthanenāpi aggino abhinibbattaṃ viya kilesakāmena vatthukāmato nissaṭānaṃ abbhokāsikanesaṃjikkādivasena opakkamikāhipi vedanāhi lokuttaramaggassa adhiḡamo.</i>	Like kindling fire by the kindling stick, there is indeed attainment of the supramundane Path for those devoid of sensual-desire defilement, (devoid) of the (five) objects of sensual pleasure, even by the torturing feelings from the (ascetic practices) such as (dwelling under) open space (or) the sitter's (practice, i.e., refraining from lying down).
<i>Aññassa rukkhassa sukhasākhāya saddhiṃ ghaṃsanamatteneva aggino abhinibbattaṃ viya vināpi opakkamikāhi vedanāhi sukhāyeva paṭipadāya lokuttaramaggassa adhiḡamoti.</i>	Just like a fire is kindled even just by rubbing with a dry branch of another tree, (there is) attainment of the supramundane Path even for (those) without (the experience) of torturing feelings, even by a comfortable practice.
<i>Ayaṃ upamā bhagavatā attano atthāya āhaṭā.</i>	This simile occurred ("was brought") for the purposes of the Exalted One.

Part Three: The Ascetic Practices

<i>480. "Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, etadahosi – 'yaṃnūnāhaṃ dantebhidantamādhāya, jivhāya tāluṃ āhacca, cetasā cittaṃ abhiniggaṇheyyaṃ abhinippīḷeyyaṃ abhisantāpeyya'nti.</i>	"Then, Bhāradvāja, this occurred to me: "What if I keep (my) upper teeth on (my) lower teeth, supporting the palate with (my) tongue, ⁷³ (and) forcefully grasp, forcefully press, seriously burn down [unskillful] thoughts by [skillful] thoughts? ⁷⁴
---	---

⁷³ Tipiṭakadhara Mingun Sayadaw, quoting an undisclosed Pāḷi text, however says the *bodhisatta* was grinding his teeth and clicking his tongue. ("The Great Chronicle of the Buddhas", vol.2, part 1, p.152; PDF p.170.)

⁷⁴ Tipiṭakadhara Mingun Sayadaw adds a further ascetic practice of the *bodhisatta* ascribed to him before he decided to apply the mental force. The sayadaw later cites Jinālaṅkāra Ṭīkā (an apocryphal Sub-Commentary) as the source (in p.155). According to it the *bodhisatta* first came to the conclusion that food is "coarse", hence he reduced his food to fruits fallen from trees. Later he decided that "searching for fruit is also a kind of impediment" (*palibodhā*) and reduced himself only to the fruit fallen from the tree that he used as a shelter (thus he could peacefully stay sitting where he was). (Note that *Visuddhimagga* in the description of *rukhamūlika dhutaṅga* however prohibits fruit trees as a dwelling place.) As the *bodhisatta* was sustaining himself by that little amount of food he decided to practice the application of mental force. (*ibid.*)

<i>So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, dantebhidantamādhāya, jivhāya tāluṃ āhacca, cetasā cittaṃ abhiniggaṇhāmi abhinippīlemi abhisantāpemi.</i>	Then I indeed, Bhāradvāja, keeping (my) upper teeth on (my) lower teeth, supporting the palate with (my) tongue, forcefully grasp, forcefully press, seriously burn down [unskillful] thoughts by [skillful] thoughts.
<i>Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, dantebhidantamādhāya, jivhāya tāluṃ āhacca, cetasā cittaṃ abhiniggaṇhato abhinippīlayato abhisantāpayato kacchehi sedā muccanti.</i>	Then, Bhāradvāja, to me keeping (my) upper teeth on (my) lower teeth, supporting the palate with (my) tongue, forcefully grasping, forcefully pressing, seriously burning down [unskillful] thoughts by [skillful] thoughts, sweat escapes from (my) armpits.
<i>Seyyathāpi, bhāradvāja, balavā puriso dubbalataraṃ purisaṃ sīse vā gahetvā khandhe vā gahetvā abhiniggaṇheyya abhinippīleyya abhisantāpeyya,</i>	Suppose, Bhāradvāja, that a strong man either took a weak man by the head, or ("took") (him) by shoulder, and then forcefully grasped (him), forcefully pressed, seriously burnt down;
<i>evameva kho me, bhāradvāja, dantebhidantamādhāya, jivhāya tāluṃ āhacca, cetasā cittaṃ abhiniggaṇhato abhinippīlayato abhisantāpayato kacchehi sedā muccanti.</i>	Indeed, exactly so, Bhāradvāja, to me keeping (my) upper teeth on (my) lower teeth, supporting the palate with (my) tongue, forcefully grasping, forcefully pressing, seriously burning down [unskillful] thoughts by [skillful] thoughts, escaped sweat from armpits.
<i>Āraddhaṃ kho pana me, bhāradvāja, vīriyaṃ hoti asallīnaṃ, upaṭṭhitā sati asammuṭṭhā;</i>	(At that time) there is unshakeable effort indeed made by me, established mindfulness without lapse,
<i>sāradhho ca pana me kāyo hoti appaṭippassaddho, teneva dukkhappadhānena padhānābhittunnassa sato.</i>	My body is, however, burning (and) restless just by endeavoring so uncomfortably, by forcing the effort (that much).

<i>377. Idāni attano dukkarakārikaṃ dassento, tassa mayhantiādīmāha.</i>	377. Now (the Buddha) explains His austere practices, hence (He) said "to me," etc.
<i>Kim pana bhagavā dukkaraṃ akatvā buddho bhavituṃ na samatthoti?</i>	However, what (is the reason) that the Buddha couldn't avoid ("not do") the austerities (and) become a Buddha (right away)?
<i>Katvāpi akatvāpi samatthova.</i>	Whether (the Buddha) did (the austerities) or did not, (He) could (become a Buddha right away) anyway.
<i>Atha kasmā akāsīti?</i>	Then why did He do (them)?
<i>Sadevakassa lokassa attano parakkamaṃ dassessāmi.</i>	(Thinking:) "I will show my exertion to the world with (its) deities.
<i>So ca maṃ vīriyanimmathanaguṇo hāsessatīti.</i>	Also, that quality of destructive energy ⁷⁵ will gladden me.
<i>Pāsāde nisinnoyeva hi paveṇiāgataṃ rajjaṃ labhitvāpi khattiyo na tathāpamudito hoti,</i>	Indeed, just sitting in the palace, the <i>khattiya</i> (of the royal family) is not satisfied merely from receiving kingship by lineage,
<i>yathā balakāyaṃ gahetvā saṅgāme dve tayo sampahāre datvā amittamathanaṃ katvā pattarajjo.</i>	Rather, (he is satisfied from) becoming a king when (he) has taken a body of an army, delivered two (or) three blows in the battle, (and) suppressed the enemy.
<i>Evaṃ pattarajjassa hi rajasirīṃ anubhavantassa parisāṃ oloketvā attano parakkamaṃ anussarivā,</i>	To (one) who has become a king that way, indeed, when observing the crowd as (he) enjoys the kingly majesty, (he) remembers (his) own exertion,
<i>"asukaṭṭhāne asukakammaṃ katvā asukañca asukañca amittaṃ evaṃ vijjhivā evaṃ paharivā imaṃ rajasirīṃ pattosmi"ti cintayato balavasomanassaṃ uppajjati.</i>	(thinking:) "doing that particular work at that particular place, having destroyed that particular enemy thus, I entered the kingly majesty after striking thus," (and) a powerful happiness arises (in him).
<i>Evamevaṃ bhagavāpi sadevakassa lokassa parakkamaṃ dassessāmi, so hi maṃ parakkamo ativiya hāsessati, somanassaṃ uppādessatīti dukkaramakāsi.</i>	Exactly so, also the Exalted One (thinking:) "I will show (my) exertion to the world with (its) deities, (and) that exertion of mine, indeed, will immensely gladden, (and) arouse happiness," the <i>Bodhisatta</i>) engaged in austerities.
<i>Apica pacchimaṃ janataṃ anukampamānopi akāsiyeva,</i>	Moreover, (the Exalted One) practiced (the austerities) also because of (His) compassion to the future generations, (thinking:)
<i>pacchimā hi janatā sammāsambuddho kappasatasahassādhikāni cattāri asaṅkhyeyyāni pāramiyo pūretvāpi padhānaṃ padahitvāva sabbaññutaññānaṃ patto,</i>	"The future generations will think: 'only (when) the rightly (and) thoroughly Enlightened One completed the Perfections (<i>Pāramī</i>) for four incalculable (eons and)

⁷⁵ I.e. energy that leads to destruction of mental defilements.

	hundred thousand (ordinary) eons, entered the omniscience after exerting effort,
<i>kimaṅgaṃ pana mayanti padhānavīriyaṃ kattabbaṃ maññissati;</i>	How come then that we (would without making any effort)? There should be exertion (and) effort made ¹⁷⁶
<i>evaṃ sante khippameva jātijarāmarāṇassa antaṃ karissatīti pacchimaṃ janataṃ anukampamāno akāsiyeva.</i>	(and) being so, (the future generations) will quickly make the end to birth, old age, (and) death." (Thus) compassionate toward the future generations, (the Exalted One) practiced (the austerities).

<i>Ṭikā - 6. Mahāsaccakasuttavaṇṇanā</i> ⁷⁷	Sub-Commentary to MN 6. The Great Discourse to Saccaka
<i>377. Kiṃ pana na samattho, yato evaṃ parehi cintitumpi asakkuṇeyyaṃ dukkaracariyaṃ chabbassāni akāsīti adhippāyo.</i>	377. What (is the reason) that (the Buddha) couldn't avoid ("not do") (the austerities) – has the meaning that this way others won't be able even to think (to follow:) "(the Buddha) did (the austerities) for six years."
<i>Katvāpi akatvāpi samatthova kāraṇassa nipphannattā.</i>	Whether (the Buddha) did (the austerities) or did not, (He) could (become a Buddha right away is (based) on fulfilling the conditions.
<i>"Yathāpi sabbesampi kho bodhisattānaṃ carimabhava antamaso sattāhamattampi dhammatāvasena dukkaracariyā hotiyeva,</i>	"Just like indeed for all the Buddhas-to-be in (their) last life there is naturally the practice of austerities indeed at least just for seven days,
<i>evaṃ bhagavā samattho dukkaracariyaṃ kātuṃ, evaṃca naṃ akāsi, na pana tāya buddho jāto, atha kho majjhimāya eva paṭipattiyā</i> " ^{ti}	Thus the Exalted One able (to attain Enlightenment anyway) (decided) to practice the austerities; and thus He did, although (He) didn't become a Buddha by that, but in fact just by the Middle Path." ⁷⁸
<i>tassā byatirekamukhena sadevakassa lokassa bodhāya amaggabhāvadīpanatthaṃ,</i>	By that contradiction (the practice was done) in order to explain the existence of the wrong path toward the Enlightenment in the world with its deities.
<i>imassa pana bhagavato kammavipākasena chabbassāni dukkaracariyā ahoṣi.</i>	However, because of the result of the actions (<i>kamma-vipāka</i>) of this Exalted One, the practice of austerities lasted six years.
<i>Vuttañhetam –</i>	Indeed, it is said: ⁷⁹
<i>"Avacāhaṃ jotipālo, kassapaṃ sugataṃ tadā;</i>	"Told I (a brahmin of the name) Jotipāla, to the Well Gone (Buddha) Kassapa at that time,
<i>Kuto nu bodhi muṇḍassa, bodhi paramadullabhā.</i>	'Where would be an Enlightenment for (this) shaveling? Enlightenment is supremely rare.'
<i>Tena kammavipākena, acarim dukkaraṃ bahum;</i>	As the result of that action, (I) practiced a lot of austerities,
<i>Chabbassānuruvelāyaṃ, tato bodhimapāpuṇim.</i>	For six years in Uruvela, (and) after that, attained Enlightenment.
<i>Nāhaṃ etena maggena, pāpuṇim bodhimuttamaṃ;</i>	I haven't by that (ascetic) path attained the ultimate Enlightenment;

⁷⁶ Tipiṭakadhara Mingun Sayadaw explains: "the strenuous exertion made up of fourfold determination, namely, (1) 'Let only the skin be left!' (2) 'Let only the sinews be left!' (3) 'Let only the bones be left!' and (4) 'Let the flesh and the blood be dried up!' is called *Padhāna-viriya*." (*The Great Chronicle of the Buddhas*, vol.2, part 1, p.152; PDF p.170.)

⁷⁷ I am including the explanation of the Sub-Commentary as a reaction to the endnote of ven. Bhikkhu Bodhi, which you can read at the "Notes" portion of *The Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha, A Translation of the Majjhima Nikāya*, Wisdom Publications, Boston, 2009; p.1229, n.387.

⁷⁸ The quotes in the original seem to indicate a citation, but I could not find these words in any of the scriptures available to me.

⁷⁹ What follows is the citation of *Apadānapāli – 39. Avataphalavaggo – 10. Pubbakammapiṭikabuddhaapadānam - par.92-94*. For whatever reason ven. Bhikkhu Bodhi was not aware of this text included in the main portion of Pāli scriptures (perhaps making an exception and not spotting the reference in the Sub-Commentaries?) and doubted the authenticity of the *Majjhima Nikāya* text. Ven. Bhikkhu Bodhi suggests that perhaps the order of the incidents mentioned in the discourse has been originally different, pointing out the Buddha's rejection of necessity of austere practices at the very start. Actually, the Buddha's own words (coming later in the text) suggest that He was not aware of the Middle Path before He gave up the austerities: "*Na kho panāhaṃ imāya kaṭukāya dukkarakārikāya adhigacchāmi uttari manussadhammā alamariyaññadassanavisesaṃ.*" = "However, indeed, I won't attain the superhuman states, the distinction of knowledge (and) vision worthy of the Noble (men) by this bitter, painful austerity." The Buddha says this as what "occurred to Him later" - "*Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, etadahosi*".

<i>Kumaggena gavesissam, pubbakammena vārito</i> "ti.	Traveled I by the wrong path, obstructed by the previous action."
<i>Dukkaracariyāya bodhāya amaggabhāvadassanattam dukkaracariyam akāsīti keci.</i>	Some (say) that (the Buddha) practiced the austerities in order to show the reality of the wrong path (i.e.) the practice of austerities for Enlightenment. ⁸⁰
<i>Atha vā lokanāthassa attano parakkamasampattidassanattāya dukkaracariyā.</i>	Or otherwise (it was) the practice of austerities for the World Leader's purpose of showing (His) own wealth of exertion.
<i>Pañitādhimuttīyā hi paramukkaṃsagatabhāvato abhinīhārānurūpaṃ sambodhiyam tibbachandatāya sikhāpattiyā</i>	"On behalf of the entrance to the training by sharp will for the sake of the complete Enlightenment characterized by the noble wish for the aspect of perfect departure out through the sweet liberation,
<i>tadattham idisampi nāma dukkaracariyam akāsīti loke attano vīriyānubhāvaṃ vibhāvetum –</i>	For that purpose (the Buddha) indeed practiced right this kind of austerity." (The Buddha thinking so) explained the power of energy:
<i>"so ca me pacchā pītisomanassāvaho bhavissati</i> "ti lokanātho dukkaracariyam akāsī.	"Then also there will be joy (and) happiness gained by me," the World Leader practiced the austerities.
<i>Tenāha "sadevakassa lokassā"tiādi.</i>	Therefore (He) said: "in the world with (its) deities.
<i>Tattha vīriyanimmathanaguṇoti vīriyassa saṃvaḍḍhanasampādanaguṇo.</i>	There "quality of destructive energy" means the quality of increasing (and) exerting the energy.
<i>Yathāvuttamattham upamāya vibhāvetum "pāsāde"tiādi vuttam.</i>	In order to explain by a simile the meaning of what was said, (it was) said: "in the palace," etc.
<i>Saṅgāme dve tayo sampahāreti dvikkhattum tikkhattum vā parasenāya pahārapayoge.</i>	"Two (or) three blows in the battle" means making two or three times an effort to beat (/hit) the other army.
<i>Padhānavīriyanti sammappadhānehi āsevanavīriyam, sabbam vā pubbhāgavīriyam.</i>	"Exertion (and) effort" means out of the (kinds of) right exertion, the continuous effort, otherwise all the effort previous (to Enlightenment).

<i>Dantebhidantamādhāyāti heṭṭhādante uparidantam ṭhapetvā.</i>	"(My) upper teeth on (my) lower teeth" means placing the upper teeth on the lower teeth.
<i>Cetasā cittanti kusalacittena akusalacittam.</i>	"[Unskillful] thoughts by [skillful] thoughts" means the unskillful thoughts ⁸¹ by skillful thoughts.
<i>Abhiniggaṇheyyanti niggaṇheyyam.</i>	"If I forcefully grasp" means if I grasp.
<i>Abhinippīleyanti nippīleyam.</i>	"If I forcefully press" means if I press.
<i>Abhisantāpeyyanti tāpetvā vīriyanimmathanam kareyyam.</i>	"If I seriously burn down" means having burnt, I shall exercise the suppression by exertion.
<i>Sāradhoti sadaratho.</i>	"Burning" means being heated.
<i>Padhānābhītunnassāti padhānena abhitunnassa, viddhassa satoti attho.</i>	"By forcing the effort" (has) the meaning of forcing by effort being destructive.

<i>481. "Tassa mayham, bhāradvāja, etadahosi – 'yamnūnāham appānakāmyeva jhānam jhāyeyya'nti.</i>	481. "Then, Bhāradvāja, this occurred to me: "What if I meditate on the meditation of non-breathing?"
<i>So kho aham, bhāradvāja, mukhato ca nāsato ca assāsapassāse uparundhim.</i>	Then I indeed, Bhāradvāja, stopped in-breath (and) out-breath from (my) mouth as well as from (my) nose.

⁸⁰ From the word *keci* it might seem that this is an opinion voiced by not-very-appreciated teachers. However, because the argument itself is included in the Commentaries (mentioned above), I suppose that here *keci* simple points to a number of Theravāda teachers in general.

⁸¹ The Sub-Commentary adds that the *kusala citta* here is the skillful thinking accompanied by powerful Right Thought (*balavasammāsaṅkappayuttana kusalacittena*), and the unskillful thoughts are the unskillful thoughts together with thoughts on sensual pleasures etc. (*kāma vitakkādisahitam akusalacittam*). It should be however noted, that the demon Māra, when rejected during the time of *bodhisatta's* great departure from the palace, warned *bodhisatta* in these words: "*ito dāni te paṭṭhāya kāma vitakkaṃ vā byāpādavitaṅkaṃ vā vihiṃsāvitaṅkaṃ vā cintitakāle jānissāmi*"ti" = "Starting from now on I will notify you when (you) think the thought of sensual pleasures, the thought of anger, or the thought of violence." (*Jātaka-Attakathā – Nidānakathā – Avidūrenidānakathā* (MM vol.1 p.74) and *Apadāna-Atthakathā – 2. Avidūrenidānakathā* (MM vol.1 p.76).) Mingun Sayadaw even adds that if such thoughts arose in the *bodhisatta*, Māra would have killed the *bodhisatta* "right on the spot." ("*The Great Chronicle of the Buddhas*", vol.2, part 1, p.158; PDF p.176.) Could it be so, that the *bodhisatta* simply forced skillful thoughts over any thoughts that were not "particularly" skillful, such as sloth & torpor, or restlessness & worry? That would however contradict the Sub-Commentary quoted above.

<i>Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, mukhato ca nāsato ca assāsapassāsesu uparuddhesu kaṇṇasotehi vātānaṃ nikkhamantānaṃ adhimatto saddo hoti.</i>	Then, Bhāradvāja, to me (who) stopped in-breath (and) out-breath from (my) mouth as well as from (my) nose, there was a great noise in (my) ears from the escaping air.
<i>Seyyathāpi nāma kammāragaggariyā dhamamānāya adhimatto saddo hoti,</i>	Suppose for example, that there is a great noise of blowing bellows.
<i>evameva kho me, bhāradvāja, mukhato ca nāsato ca assāsapassāsesu uparuddhesu kaṇṇasotehi vātānaṃ nikkhamantānaṃ adhimatto saddo hoti.</i>	Indeed, exactly so, Bhāradvāja, there was a great noise in (my) ears from the escaping air to me (who) stopped in-breath (and) out-breath from (my) mouth as well as from (my) nose.
<i>Āraddhaṃ kho pana me, bhāradvāja, vīriyaṃ hoti asallīnaṃ, upaṭṭhitā sati asammuṭṭhā;</i>	(At that time) there is unshakeable effort indeed made by me, established mindfulness without lapse,
<i>sāraddho ca pana me kāyo hoti appaṭippassaddho, teneva dukkhappadhānena padhānābhittunnassa sato.</i>	My body is, however, burning (and) restless just by endeavoring so uncomfortably, by forcing the effort (that much).

<i>"Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, etadahosi – 'yaṃnūnāhaṃ appāṇakāmyeva jhānaṃ jhāyeyya'nti.</i>	"Then, Bhāradvāja, this occurred to me: 'What if I meditate on the meditation of non-breathing?'
<i>So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, mukhato ca nāsato ca kaṇṇato ca assāsapassāse uparundhiṃ.</i>	Then I indeed, Bhāradvāja, stopped in-breath (and) out-breath from (my) mouth, from (my) nose, as well as from (my) ears.
<i>Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, mukhato ca nāsato ca kaṇṇato ca assāsapassāsesu uparuddhesu adhimattā vātā muddhani ūhananti.</i>	Then, Bhāradvāja, to me (who) stopped in-breath (and) out-breath from (my) mouth as well as from (my) ears, great winds push (toward the top) of (my) head.
<i>Seyyathāpi, bhāradvāja, balavā puriso, tiṇhena sikharena muddhani abhimattheyya,</i>	Suppose, Bhāradvāja, that a strong man fiercely pierced the top of (my) head by a sharp razor; ⁸²
<i>evameva kho me, bhāradvāja, mukhato ca nāsato ca kaṇṇato ca assāsapassāsesu uparuddhesu adhimattā vātā muddhani ūhananti.</i>	Indeed, exactly so, Bhāradvāja, to me (who) stopped in-breath (and) out-breath from (my) mouth, (my) nose, as well as from (my) ears, great winds push (toward the top) of (my) head.
<i>Āraddhaṃ kho pana me, bhāradvāja, vīriyaṃ hoti asallīnaṃ, upaṭṭhitā sati asammuṭṭhā;</i>	(At that time) there is unshakeable effort indeed made by me, established mindfulness without lapse,
<i>sāraddho ca pana me kāyo hoti appaṭippassaddho, teneva dukkhappadhānena padhānābhittunnassa sato.</i>	My body is, however, burning (and) restless just by endeavoring so uncomfortably, by forcing the effort (that much).

<i>"Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, etadahosi – 'yaṃnūnāhaṃ appāṇakāmyeva jhānaṃ jhāyeyya'nti.</i>	"Then, Bhāradvāja, this occurred to me: "What if I meditate on the meditation of non-breathing?"
<i>So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, mukhato ca nāsato ca kaṇṇato ca assāsapassāse uparundhiṃ.</i>	Then I indeed, Bhāradvāja, stopped in-breath (and) out-breath from (my) mouth, from (my) nose, as well as from (my) ears.
<i>Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, mukhato ca nāsato ca kaṇṇato ca assāsapassāsesu uparuddhesu adhimattā sīse sīsavedanā honti.</i>	Then, Bhāradvāja, to me (who) stopped in-breath (and) out-breath from (my) mouth as well as from (my) ears, there were (painful) ("head-") feelings in (my) head.
<i>Seyyathāpi, bhāradvāja, balavā puriso dālhena varattakkhaṇḍena sīse sīsaveṭhaṃ dadeyya,</i>	Suppose, Bhāradvāja, that a strong man might give (me) head-binding by a piece of coarse leather-rope on (my) head;
<i>evameva kho, bhāradvāja, mukhato ca nāsato ca kaṇṇato ca assāsapassāsesu uparuddhesu adhimattā sīse sīsavedanā honti.</i>	Indeed, exactly so, Bhāradvāja, to me (who) stopped in-breath (and) out-breath from (my) mouth, (my) nose, as well as from (my) ears, there were (painful) ("head-") feelings in (my) head.
<i>Āraddhaṃ kho pana me, bhāradvāja, vīriyaṃ hoti asallīnaṃ, upaṭṭhitā sati asammuṭṭhā;</i>	(At that time) there is unshakeable effort indeed made by me, established mindfulness without lapse,
<i>sāraddho ca pana me kāyo hoti appaṭippassaddho, teneva dukkhappadhānena padhānābhittunnassa sato.</i>	My body is, however, burning (and) restless just by endeavoring so uncomfortably, by forcing the effort (that much).

⁸² Tipiṭakadhara Mingun Sayadaw however says: "as if a man of strength was churning the head with a sharp and pointed drill." (*The Great Chronicle of the Buddhas*, vol.2, part 1, p.153; PDF p.171.)

<i>"Tassa mayham, bhāradvāja, etadahosi – 'yaṃnūnāhaṃ appāṇakāmyeva jhānaṃ jhāyeyya'nti.</i>	"Then, Bhāradvāja, this occurred to me: "What if I meditate on the meditation of non-breathing?"
<i>So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, mukhato ca nāsato ca kaṇṇato ca assāsapassāse uparundhiṃ.</i>	Then I indeed, Bhāradvāja, stopped in-breath (and) out-breath from (my) mouth, from (my) nose, as well as from (my) ears.
<i>Tassa mayham, bhāradvāja, mukhato ca nāsato ca kaṇṇato ca assāsapassāsesu uparuddhesu adhimattā vātā kucchim parikantanti.</i>	Then, Bhāradvāja, to me (who) stopped in-breath (and) out-breath from (my) mouth as well as from (my) ears, great winds cut through (my) belly.
<i>Seyyathāpi, bhāradvāja, dakkho goghātako vā goghātakantevāsī vā tiṅhena govikantanena kucchim parikanteyya,</i>	Suppose, Bhāradvāja, that a skilled bovine slaughterman or an apprentice of bovine slaughterman cuts through (my) belly by a sharp bovine knife;
<i>evameva kho me, bhāradvāja, mukhato ca nāsato ca kaṇṇato ca assāsapassāsesu uparuddhesu adhimattā vātā kucchim parikantanti.</i>	Indeed, exactly so, Bhāradvāja, to me (who) stopped in-breath (and) out-breath from (my) mouth as well as from (my) ears, great winds cut through (my) belly.
<i>Āraddhaṃ kho pana me, bhāradvāja, vīriyaṃ hoti asallīnaṃ upaṭṭhitā sati asammutṭhā;</i>	(At that time) there is unshakeable effort indeed made by me, established mindfulness without lapse,
<i>sāraddho ca pana me kāyo hoti appaṭippassaddho, teneva dukkhappadhānena padhānābhittunnassa sato.</i>	My body is, however, burning (and) restless just by endeavoring so uncomfortably, by forcing the effort (that much).

<i>"Tassa mayham, bhāradvāja, etadahosi – 'yaṃnūnāhaṃ appāṇakāmyeva jhānaṃ jhāyeyya'nti.</i>	"Then, Bhāradvāja, this occurred to me: "What if I meditate on the meditation of non-breathing?"
<i>So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, mukhato ca nāsato ca kaṇṇato ca assāsapassāse uparundhiṃ.</i>	Then I indeed, Bhāradvāja, stopped in-breath (and) out-breath from (my) mouth, from (my) nose, as well as from (my) ears.
<i>Tassa mayham, bhāradvāja, mukhato ca nāsato ca kaṇṇato ca assāsapassāsesu uparuddhesu adhimatto kāyasmim dāho hoti.</i>	Then, Bhāradvāja, to me (who) stopped in-breath (and) out-breath from (my) mouth as well as from (my) ears, there is great burning in (my) body.
<i>Seyyathāpi, bhāradvāja, dve balavanto purisā dubbalataram purisaṃ nānābhāsu gahetvā aṅgārakāsuyā santāpeyyuṃ samparitāpeyyuṃ,</i>	Suppose, Bhāradvāja, that two strong men take a weaker man by different limbs (and) roast (him) in a pile of coals, totally roast (him) up.
<i>evameva kho me, bhāradvāja, mukhato ca nāsato ca kaṇṇato ca assāsapassāsesu uparuddhesu adhimatto kāyasmim dāho hoti.</i>	Indeed, exactly so, Bhāradvāja, to me (who) stopped in-breath (and) out-breath from (my) mouth as well as from (my) ears, there is great burning in (my) body.
<i>Āraddhaṃ kho pana me, bhāradvāja, vīriyaṃ hoti asallīnaṃ, upaṭṭhitā sati asammutṭhā, sāraddho ca pana me kāyo hoti appaṭippassaddho, teneva dukkhappadhānena padhānābhittunnassa sato.</i>	(At that time) there is an unshakeable effort indeed made by me, establishing mindfulness without lapse; my body is, however, burning (and) restless just by endeavoring so uncomfortably, by forcing the effort (that much).
<i>Apissu maṃ, bhāradvāja, devatā disvā evamāhaṃsu – 'kālaṅkato samaṇo gotamo'ti.</i>	Thereafter, Bhāradvāja, deities saw me and spoke thus: "The ascetic Gotama is dead."
<i>Ekaccā devatā evamāhaṃsu – 'na kālaṅkato samaṇo gotamo, api ca kālaṅkarotī'ti.</i>	Some deities spoke thus: "The ascetic Gotama is not dead; however, he is dying."
<i>Ekaccā devatā evamāhaṃsu – 'na kālaṅkato samaṇo gotamo, nāpi kālaṅkaroti;</i>	Some deities spoke thus: "the ascetic Gotama is neither dead, nor is he dying;
<i>araham samaṇo gotamo, vihārotveva so arahato⁸³ evarūpo hotī'ti.</i>	Enlightened is the ascetic Gotama, the Arahant, when residing, (he) is such."

<i>378. Appāṇakanti nirassāsakaṃ.</i>	378. "Of non-breathing" means without breathing.
<i>Kammāragaggariyāti kammārassa gaggaranāliyā.</i>	"Of blowing bellows" means of smith's ⁸⁴ bellows.

⁸³ Because the word has four different meanings, I am keeping *Arahant* even in translation, to avoid prioritizing any of the four meanings. The four meanings are: "*ārakattā arīnaṃ, arānañca hatattā, paccayādīnaṃ arahattā, pāpakaraṇe rahābhāvāti imehi tāva kāraṇehi arahanti vedittabbo.*" = "Moving away from the enemies (i.e. defilements), because of killing the enemies (i.e. the defilements), by the worthiness of (receiving) necessities etc., (and) the absence of committing evil (even) secretly – the word "*araham*" should be known even by these characteristics.

⁸⁴ The Pāli-Burmese verbatim translation translates *kammārassa gaggaranāliyā* as "goldsmith's bellows" (ဝေရးပန်းဝံနု၏ ရွှေခွံ့ပုလင်း). I don't see this supported by the Sub-Commentaries, nor even by Tipiṭakadhara Mingun Sayadaw who says "blacksmith" (TGCB 2.1. p.153).

<i>Sīsavedanā hontīti kutoci nikkhamitūṃ alabhamānehi vātehi samuṭṭhāpitā balavatiyo sīsavedanā honti.</i>	"There were (painful) ("head-") feelings" means there arose strong head-feelings by the winds that didn't (get) to escape from anywhere.
<i>Sīsaveṭhaṃ dadeyyāti sīsaveṭhanaṃ dadeyya.</i>	"Give (me) head-binding" means (he) might give a head-binding.
<i>Devatāti bodhisattassa caṅkamanakoṭiyam paṇṇasālapariveṇasāmantā ca adhivatthā devatā.</i>	"Deities" means the deity that stayed at the end of the <i>Bodhisatta's</i> walking-meditation path as well as (the deity) that stayed in the (<i>Bodhisatta's</i>) chamber of a leaf-roofed hall.

<i>Tadā kira bodhisattassa adhimatte kāyadāhe uppanne mucchā udapādi.</i>	Indeed, at that time, there arose dizziness in the immensely hot body of the <i>Bodhisatta</i> .
<i>So caṅkameva nisinno hutvā papati.</i>	He, while just walking, fell down into sitting. ⁸⁵
<i>Taṃ disvā devatā evamaḥamsu – “vihārotveva so arahato”ti, “arahanto nāma evarūpā honti matakasadisā”ti laddhiyā vadanti.</i>	Having seen that, deities spoke thus: "Thus resides He, the Arahant," "As for Arahants, they are of such character, like dead," speak (the deities their) assumption.
<i>Tattha yā devatā “kālaṅkato”ti āhaṃsu, tā gantvā suddhodanamahārājassa ārocesuṃ – “tumhākaṃ putto kālaṅkato”ti.</i>	There the deities that said "dead" went and informed the great king <i>Suddhodana</i> : "Your son is dead."
<i>Mama putto buddho hutvā kālaṅkato, no ahutvāti?</i>	"Is my son dead after becoming Enlightened, or not after becoming (Enlightened)?"
<i>Buddho bhavitūṃ nāsakkhi, padhānabhūmiyaṃyeva patitvā kālaṅkatoti.</i>	"He was not able to become Enlightened; he is dead having fallen right on the floor (where he) exerted (himself)."
<i>Nāhaṃ saddahāmi, mama puttassa bodhiṃ apatvā kālaṅkiriya nāma natthīti.</i>	"I don't believe (you); there is no death for my son if (he) hasn't (yet) attained Enlightenment," (said the king).

<i>Aparabhāge sammāsambuddhassa dhammacakkaṃ pavattetvā anupubbena rājagahaṃ gantvā</i>	In the later part (of the Buddha's life), when the Wheel of Dhamma was set spinning, (the Buddha) gradually went to Rājagaha,
<i>kapilavatthuṃ anuppattassa suddhodanamahārājā pattam gahetvā pāsādam āropetvā yāgukhajjakaṃ datvā</i>	And then from (the Buddha) who arrived in Kapilavatthu, the great king <i>Suddhodana</i> took the alms-bowl, placed (it) in the palace, gave (the Buddha) sumptuous rice-gruel,
<i>antarābhattasamaye etamatthaṃ ārocesi – tumhākaṃ bhagavā padhānakaraṇakāle devatā āgantvā, “putto te, mahārāja, kālaṅkato”ti āhaṃsūti.</i>	And at the end of the meal, informed (the Buddha) about that matter: "Exalted One, during the time of Your exertion, deities arrived and said: 'Great king, your son is dead.'"
<i>Kiṃ saddahasi mahārājāti?</i>	"What did (you) believe, great king?"
<i>Na bhagavā saddahinti.</i>	"Exalted One, I didn't believe."
<i>Idāni, mahārāja, supinappaṭiggahaṇato paṭṭhāya acchariyāni passanto kiṃ saddahissasi?</i>	"Now, great king, since the (time you) have received the explanation of (your) dreams, seeing wonders, what do you believe?"
<i>Ahampi buddho jāto, tvampi buddhapitā jāto, pubbe pana mayhaṃ aparipakke ñāṇe bodhicariyaṃ carantassa dhammapālakumārakālepi sippaṃ uggahetuṃ gatassa,</i>	I have become the Enlightened One, you have also become the father of the Enlightened One. Previously, moreover, when my knowledge was not accomplished, training in the Enlightenment training, even in the life ("time") as the prince <i>Dhammapāla</i> when (I) went to learn skills,
<i>“tumhākaṃ putto dhammapālakumāro kālaṅkato, idamassa aṭṭhī”ti eḷakaṭṭhiṃ āharitvā dassesuṃ,</i>	(people) brought a wild goat's bone and explained: 'your son prince <i>Dhammapāla</i> is dead, this is his bone' -
<i>tadāpi tumhe, “mama puttassa antarāmaraṇaṃ nāma natthī, nāhaṃ saddahāmi”ti avocuttha, mahārājāti.</i>	Even at that time, you said: 'There is no untimely death to my son, I don't believe (you),' great king."

⁸⁵ Tipiṭakadhara Mingun Sayadaw translates this Pāli Commentary taking the words *nisinno hutvā* as describing the word *papati*, rather than (as would be the more common understanding) placing the moment of falling after the moment of sitting. Sayadaw writes: "the Bodhisatta fainted and fell down into a sitting position while walking. (He did not fall down lying on his face in an unsightly manner. Being one endowed with great mindfulness, he just fell into a sitting posture while walking up and down.)" (TGCB 2.1. p.155)

<i>imissā aṭṭhuppattiyā bhagavā mahādhammapālaṅgataṃ kathesi.</i>	(Based) on this biography, the Exalted One narrated the birth story (called) The Great Dhammapāla.
---	--

<i>“Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, etadahosi – ‘yaṃnūnāhaṃ sabbaso āhārupacchedāya paṭipajjeyya’nti.</i>	"Then, Bhāradvāja, this occurred to me: 'What if I practice having cut off all food?'
<i>Atha kho maṃ, bhāradvāja, devatā upasaṅkamtīvā etadavocuṃ – ‘mā kho tvaṃ, mārisa, sabbaso āhārupacchedāya paṭipajji.</i>	Then, Bhāradvāja, indeed the deities approached me and said this: 'May you, sir, indeed not practice having cut off all food.'
<i>Sace kho tvaṃ, mārisa, sabbaso āhārupacchedāya paṭipajjissasi, tassa te mayhaṃ dibbaṃ ojaṃ lomakūpehi ajjhohāressāma. Tāya tvaṃ yāpessasīti.</i>	If you, sir, really practice having cut off all food, then we will bring heavenly nutrition for you by (your) skin pores. ⁸⁶ By that, you will thrive.'
<i>Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, etadahosi – ‘ahañceva kho pana sabbaso ajajjitaṃ paṭijāneyyaṃ,</i>	Then, Bhāradvāja, this occurred to me: 'So, even though I would proclaim thorough fasting,
<i>imā ca me devatā dibbaṃ ojaṃ lomakūpehi ajjhohāreyyūṃ, tāya cāhaṃ yāpeyyaṃ.</i>	These deities would then bring me heavenly nutrition by (my) skin pores, and by that, I would thrive.
<i>Taṃ mamassa musā’ti.</i>	That would be a lie of mine. ⁸⁷
<i>So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, tā devatā paccācikkhāmi, ‘hala’nti vadāmi.</i>	Then I, Bhāradvāja, indeed refused those deities, (and) said: 'enough!'

<i>379. Mā kho tvaṃ mārisāti sampiyāyamānā āhaṃsu.</i>	379. "(May) you, sir, indeed no (practice)" – (the deities) said (that) out of love (for the <i>Bodhisatta</i>).
<i>Devatānaṃ kirāyaṃ piyamanāpavohāro, yadidaṃ mārisāti.</i>	Indeed, this is the usage of love & affection for deities, namely this "sir" (<i>/mārisa</i>).
<i>Ajajjitanti abhojanaṃ. Halanti vadāmiti alanti vadāmi, alaṃ iminā evaṃ mā karittha, yāpessāmahanti evaṃ paṭisedhemīti attho.</i>	"Fasting" means not eating. "I said: 'enough'" has the meaning, "I said: 'stop, stop that, don't do so, I will thrive,' I prohibit (them)."

<i>“Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, etadahosi – ‘yaṃnūnāhaṃ thokaṃ thokaṃ āhāraṃ āhāreyyaṃ pasataṃ pasataṃ, yadi vā muggayūsaṃ, yadi vā kulatthayūsaṃ, yadi vā kaḷāyayūsaṃ, yadi vā hareṇukayūsa’nti.</i>	"Then, Bhāradvāja, this occurred to me: 'What if I eat a little (and then again) a little food, a handful by handful (of liquid), as is either the mungo juice, or the horse-gram juice, or the cow-pea juice, or the chick-pea juice.'
<i>So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, thokaṃ thokaṃ āhāraṃ āhāresim pasataṃ pasataṃ, yadi vā muggayūsaṃ, yadi vā kulatthayūsaṃ, yadi vā kaḷāyayūsaṃ, yadi vā hareṇukayūsaṃ.</i>	Thus I, Bhāradvāja, indeed ate a little by little food, a handful by handful (of liquid), as is either the mung-bean juice, or the horse-gram juice, or the cow-pea juice, or the chick-pea juice.
<i>Seyyathāpi nāma āsītikapabbāni⁸⁸ vā kālapabbāni vā, evamevassu me aṅgapaccaṅgāni bhavanti tāyevappāhāratāya;</i>	Suppose for example joints of (bamboo) (called) "eighty (years old)," or "black" (bamboo) joints, exactly so became my limbs just by eating so little.
<i>seyyathāpi nāma oṭṭhapadaṃ, evamevassu me ānisadaṃ hoti tāyevappāhāratāya;</i>	Suppose, for example, a camel's hoof, exactly so was the flesh of my buttocks just by eating so little. ⁸⁹
<i>seyyathāpi nāma vaṭṭanāvalī, evamevassu me piṭṭhikaṅṭako uṇṇatāvanato hoti tāyevappāhāratāya;</i>	Suppose for example a string of beads ⁹⁰ , exactly so were my backbone vertebrae rising (and) descending (/in depressed intervals) just by eating so little.
<i>seyyathāpi nāma jarasālāya gopānasiyo oluggaviluggā bhavanti, evamevassu me phāsuḷiyo oluggaviluggā bhavanti tāyevappāhāratāya;</i>	Suppose for example roof-supporting beams of a rest-house that start to rot away, exactly so where my ribs just by eating so little.

⁸⁶ Literally "body-hair pores".

⁸⁷ I.e. the Buddha would then say He was fasting, although He would in fact receive nutrition from deities. The fasting practice would thus be not perfect – because although He would avoid food from human world, He would not avoid food from heaven.

⁸⁸ From the translation you might wonder whether the original meaning of "*āsītikapabbāni*" wasn't simply "joints of eighty years (old man)". However, the word *pabba* is used only for joints of branches, creepers, cane, reed, or grass (as explained in Pāli-Myanmar-English Dictionary of U Hote Sein), whereas the word for anatomical joints is "*sandhi*".

⁸⁹ Tipiṭakadhara Mingun Sayadaw says: "The hips of the Bodhisatta wrinkled all over like the big hoofs of a camel and the anus was depressed." (TGCB 2.1. p.156)

⁹⁰ The verbatim Pāli-Burmese translation glosses: "where each presses on one another".

<i>seyyathāpi nāma gambhīre udapāne udakatārakā gambhīragatā okkhāyikā dissanti, evamevassu me akkhikūpesu akkhitarakā gambhīragatā okkhāyikā dissanti tāyevappāhāratāya;</i>	Suppose for example the water bubbles in a deep (water) well are visible as gone (and) descended deep, ⁹¹ exactly so were my eye-balls visible in the eye-sockets gone (and) descended deep just by eating so little.
<i>seyyathāpi nāma tittakālābu āmakacchinno vātātapena saṃphuṭito hoti sammilāto, evamevassu me sīsacchavi saṃphuṭitā hoti sammilātā tāyevappāhāratāya.</i>	Suppose, for example, a bitter gourd picked when tender is thoroughly affected by wind (and) heat, dried up, exactly so was my skin on the head thoroughly affected, dried up, just by eating so little.
<i>So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, ‘udaracchaviṃ parimasissāmī’ti piṭṭhikaṇṭakaṃyeva pariggaṇhāmi, ‘piṭṭhikaṇṭakaṃ parimasissāmī’ti udaracchaviṃyeva pariggaṇhāmi;</i>	Then I, Bhāradvāja, indeed (thinking:) 'I will take hold of the skin of (my) belly' I held just (my) backbone. (Thinking:) "I will take hold of the backbone" I held just the skin of (my) belly.
<i>yāvassu me, bhāradvāja, udaracchavi piṭṭhikaṇṭakaṃ allinā hoti tāyevappāhāratāya.</i>	So much did, Bhāradvāja, the skin of (my) belly attach to the backbone just by eating so little.
<i>So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, ‘vaccaṃ vā muttaṃ vā karissāmī’ti tattheva avakuḅḅo papatāmi tāyevappāhāratāya.</i>	Then I, Bhāradvāja, (thinking:) 'I will defecate or urinate,' fall right there on (my) face, just by eating so little. ⁹²
<i>So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, imameva kāyaṃ assāsento pāṇinā gattāni anumajjāmi.</i>	Then I, Bhāradvāja, indeed (think:) 'I will rub (my) limbs with (my) hands appeasing this very body.'
<i>Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, pāṇinā gattāni anumajjato pūtimūlāni lomāni kāyasmā papatanti tāyevappāhāratāya.</i>	Then, Bhāradvāja, to me rubbing (my) limbs by (my) hand, hair of decayed roots fall out from the body just by eating so little. ⁹³
<i>Apissu maṃ, bhāradvāja, manussā disvā evamāhaṃsu – ‘kāḷo samaṇo gotamo’ti.</i>	Thereafter, Bhāradvāja, when people saw me (they) spoke thus: 'The ascetic Gotama is black.'
<i>Ekacce manussā evamāhaṃsu – ‘na kāḷo samaṇo gotamo, sāmo samaṇo gotamo’ti.</i>	Some people spoke thus: 'The ascetic Gotama is not black; dark is the ascetic Gotama.'
<i>Ekacce manussā evamāhaṃsu – ‘na kāḷo samaṇo gotamo napi sāmo, maṅguracchavi samaṇo gotamo’ti;</i>	Some people spoke thus: 'the ascetic Gotama is neither black nor even dark. Dark-golden (/gray) skinned is the ascetic Gotama.' ⁹⁴
<i>yāvassu me, bhāradvāja, tāva parisuddho chavivaṇṇo pariyaḍāto upahato hoti tāyevappāhāratāya.</i>	So much, Bhāradvāja, was (my) pure color of skin, of glittering light, bright, (changed) just by eating so little. ⁹⁵

<i>380-1. Maṅguracchavīti maṅguramacchacchavi.</i>	380-1. "Dark golden (/grey) skinned" means the skin of the fish (known as) freshwater catfish.
--	--

⁹¹ U Htinn Fatt's English translation says: "like the gleam of water lying at the bottom of a deep well." Tipiṭakadhara Mingun Sayadaw however says: "like the bubbles of water in a large deep well" (TGCB 2.1. p.157). The word "udakatārakā" can mean both. The great Pāli-Myanmar dictionary says: "ရှေ့ထူငှော အရိပ်" ("shadow visible in water"), whereas U Hote Sein's Pāli-Myanmar dictionary says "ရှေ့ပြုတူ" ("water bubbles"). I suppose that bubbles make more sense in this context, because their shape is comparable to the shape of eyes.

⁹² Tipiṭakadhara Mingun Sayadaw explains: "When sitting to answer the call of nature, the urine did not come out at all as there was not enough liquid food in the belly to turn into urine. As for the excrement, just one or two hardened balls of the size of a betel nut was discharged with difficulty. The sweat trickled profusely from the whole body. He fell on the spot with his face downwards." (TGCB 2.1. p.157) Notice the difference from what sayadaw said in p.155: "Being one endowed with great mindfulness, he just fell into a sitting posture while walking up and down." Perhaps this is to show how strong effect had the fasting on the *bodhisatta's* mindfulness.

⁹³ Tipiṭakadhara Mingun Sayadaw expands on this, saying that they came off from the body and stuck to the hand. (TGCB 2.1. p.157)

⁹⁴ Tipiṭakadhara Mingun Sayadaw glosses that the natural complexion of the *Bodhisatta* was "bright yellow like the colour of *singīnikkha* pure gold." (TGCB 2.1. p.158)

⁹⁵ In *Suttanipāta – 3. Mahāvagga – 2. Padhāna Sutta* the Buddha explains, that at this point the demon Māra appeared near the *bodhisatta* and suggested that it is better for the *bodhisatta* to go back home, because this way he may soon die. (Notice the similarity of this recommendation to what certain parents and relatives may suggest to a conscientious monk who wants to dedicate himself to ardent meditation in a jungle. At that time their intention is sincere love. However, in this case Māra is described as "feigning" good will in order to prevent *bodhisatta* from becoming a Buddha.) The *bodhisatta* then pointed out to Māra himself the "ten armies" of Māra, namely: (1) sensual pleasure (*kāma*), (2) aversion (*arati*), (3) thirst and hunger (*khuppipāsa*), (4) weariness (*tandi*), (5) sloth and torpor (*thinamiddha*), (6) fear (*bhīru*), (7) doubt (*vicikicchā*), (8) arrogance and haughtiness (*makkha-thambha*), (9) craving and conceit (*taṇhāmāna*), and (10) self-praise and honor with despising and condemning others (*attukkaṃsana-paravambhana*). Thereafter the *bodhisatta* uttered his famous proclamation: "*Saṅgāme me mataṃ seyyo yaṃ ce jīve parājīto.*" = "It is better for me to die in the battle, rather than be defeated and live."

482. "Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, etadahosi – 'ye kho keci atītamaddhānaṃ samaṇā vā brāhmaṇā vā opakkamikā dukkhā tībā kharā kaṭukā vedanā vedayiṃsu, etāvaparamaṃ, nayito bhiyyo;	482. Then, Bhāradvāja, this occurred to me: "Indeed, of those torturing, painful, sharp, harsh, bitter feelings experienced by either ascetics or the brahmins of the past times this much is the ultimate, there is none greater.
yepi hi keci anāgatamaddhānaṃ samaṇā vā brāhmaṇā vā opakkamikā dukkhā tībā kharā kaṭukā vedanā vedayissanti, etāvaparamaṃ, nayito bhiyyo;	Indeed, also of those torturing, painful, sharp, harsh, bitter feelings experienced by either ascetics or the brahmins of the future times this much is the ultimate, there is none greater.
yepi hi keci etarahi samaṇā vā brāhmaṇā vā opakkamikā dukkhā tībā kharā kaṭukā vedanā vedayanti, etāvaparamaṃ, nayito bhiyyo.	Indeed, also of those torturing, painful, sharp, harsh, bitter feelings experienced by either ascetics or the brahmins of the present times, this much is the ultimate, there is none greater.
Na kho panāhaṃ imāya kaṭukāya dukkarakārikāya adhigacchāmi uttari manussadhammā alamariyaññadassanavisesaṃ.	However, indeed, I won't attain the superhuman states, the distinction of knowledge (and) vision worthy of the Noble (men) by this bitter, painful austerity. ⁹⁶

Etāva paramanti tāsampi vedanānametaṃyeva paramaṃ, uttamaṃ pamāṇaṃ.	"This much is the ultimate" means out of those feelings right this is the ultimate, the utmost amount.
---	--

Part Four: Entering The Middle Path

Siyā nu kho añño maggo bodhāyā'ti?	Could there be a different path to Awakening?
Tassa mayhaṃ bhāradvāja, etadahosi –	Then, Bhāradvāja, this occurred to me:
'abhijānāmi kho panāhaṃ pitu sakkassa kammante sītāya jambucchāyāya nisinno vivicceva kāmehi vivicca akusalehi dhammehi savitakkaṃ savicāraṃ vivekajaṃ pītisukhaṃ paṭhamaṃ jhānaṃ upasampajja viharitā.	"Indeed, I, however remember (how I), while (my) Sakyān father worked, sat in a cool shade, (and) devoid of sensual desires, devoid of unskillful thoughts, (I) dwelled having attained the first absorption (<i>Jhāna</i>) accompanied by (applied) thought (<i>Vitakka</i>), accompanied by sustained (thought) (<i>vicāra</i>), born of seclusion (<i>vivekaja</i>), with joy (<i>pīti</i>) (and) ease (<i>sukha</i>). ⁹⁷
Siyā nu kho eso maggo bodhāyā'ti?	Could right that be the path to Awakening?"
Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, satānusāri viññānaṃ ahoṣi – 'eseva maggo bodhāyā'ti.	Then to me, Bhāradvāja, occurred mindful remembering consciousness: "That is the path to Awakening."

⁹⁶ From the books about Buddha's life, which are commonly available in bookstores today, we learn that the *bodhisatta* decided to stop his austere practices because he heard a group of ladies singing around, playing a lute. He got the idea that if the strings in the lute are too tight, the sound won't be correct, and if the strings are too loose, no sound will come out. Taking this as the simile for slack and austere practices, he entered the Middle Path. This simile, nor any other similar simile as a part of the *bodhisatta*'s journey toward Enlightenment occurs in the main text, Commentaries, Sub-Commentaries, or even the great Chronicle of Tipiṭakadhara Mingun Sayadaw. Could it be a story pertaining exclusively to Mahāyāna or a non-Theravāda scripture? (The Buddha however taught that simile to Soṇa Kōlīvisa in *AN 6.6.1. Sona Sutta* a *Vinaya Pitaka – Mahāvaggapāli – 5. Cammakhandhako – Sonassa Pabbajjā*.) As we can see from the main text, the *bodhisatta* decided for the Middle Path through the perceived ultimate extreme in his austere practices and absence of any progress toward the Liberation. In fact, it is well consistent with the previous two cases – first the *bodhisatta* realized he can't attain eternal peace by life in luxury; second he realized he can't attain eternal peace by meditative absorptions (*jhāna*), and now he realized he can't attain eternal peace by austere practices. In all cases he achieved the ultimate level, and through his peerless mindfulness he let go of it, seeking a different method.

⁹⁷ The Sub-Commentary glosses: "*Ājārudakasamāgame laddhajjhānāni vaṭṭapādakāni, ānāpānasamādhī pana kāyagatāsati pariyāpannattā sabbesañca bodhisattānaṃ vipassanāpādakattā "bodhāya maggo"ti vutto.*" = "When (the *bodhisatta*) was with Ājāra (and) Udaka, the absorptions (he) attained are a condition for the (existence) in the Cycle of Rebirth. However, because the concentration on in-breath (and) out-breath is entirely grounded in the mindfulness on body (*kāyagatāsati*) and because (it is) the basis of Insight for all *bodhisattas* it is called 'the path to Awakening.'" In other words, the *bodhisatta* rejected the eight absorptions because he saw they will cause another existence, however he pursued the *ānāpānassati*, the mindfulness of in-breath (and) out-breath, because that is the meditation leading out from attachment (on one's own body), and because that is the basis of a *bodhisattas* Insight. (Note here, that the meditation on breath is meditated to understand the repulsiveness and dangers of the physical body, a purpose not always mentioned by the modern "*vipassanā*" teachers of this meditation.)

<i>Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, etadahosi – ‘kiṃ nu kho ahaṃ tassa sukhasa bhāyāmi yaṃ taṃ sukhaṃ aññatreva kāmehi aññatra akusalehi dhammehi’ti?</i>	Then, Bhāradvāja, this occurred to me: "why am I afraid of that pleasure, if that pleasure is just different from sensual pleasures, different from unskilful thoughts?"
--	--

<i>Pītu sakkassa kammante ...pe... paṭhamaṃ jhānaṃ upasampajja viharitāti rañño kira vappamaṅgaladivaso nāma hoti,</i>	"While (my) Sakyan father worked...rep... dwelled having attained the first absorption (<i>Jhāna</i>)" – in fact, there was so called "the festival of plowing" for the king;
<i>tadā anekappakāraṃ khādanīyaṃ bhojanīyaṃ paṭiyādentī.</i>	At that time, chewables (and) eatables were prepared in different ways.
<i>Nagaravīthiyo sodhāpetvā punnaghaṭe ṭhapāpetvā dhajapaṭākādayo ussāpetvā sakalanagaraṃ devavimānaṃ viya alaṅkaronti.</i>	The city roads were cleaned, pots filled (with water) were caused to keep (available for others), the banners, flagstaves, etc., were erected, and the whole town was adorned like a heavenly abode.
<i>Sabbe dāsakammakarādayo ahaṭavatta⁹⁸nivatthā gandhamālādipaṭimaṇḍitā rājakule sannipatanti.</i>	All the servants, workers, etc., wearing new clothes, adorned by perfumes (and) flowers all around, assembled were the royal family (was).
<i>Rañño kammante naṅgalasatasahassaṃ yoṇiyati.</i>	During the work of the king, a hundred thousand plows were (usually) yoked.
<i>Tasmiṃ pana divase ekena ūnaṃ aṭṭhasataṃ yojenti.</i>	However, on that day, there were yoked one less eight hundred (i.e., 799) plows. ⁹⁹
<i>Sabbanaṅgalāni saddhiṃ balibaddarasmīyottehi jāṇussoṇissa ratho viya rajataparikkhittāni honti.</i>	The oxen with the dragging rope, together with all the plows, were decorated all-around by (silver) coins like the chariot of (the brahmin) Jāṇussoṇi.
<i>Rañño ālambanaṅgalaṃ rattasuvanṇaparikkhittaṃ hoti.</i>	(However,) the plow driven by the king was decorated all-around with red gold.
<i>Balibaddānaṃ siṅgānīpi rasmīpatodāpi suvaṇṇaparikkhittā honti.</i>	The horns of the oxen, as well as the dragging ropes, were adorned all-around by gold.
<i>Rājā mahāparivārena nikkhamanto puttaṃ gahetvā agamāsi.</i>	The king leaving with a large retinue, went taking (his) son (with him).

<i>Kammantaṭṭhāne eko jamburukkho bahalapattapalāso sandacchāyo¹⁰⁰ ahoṣi.</i>	In the place of the work, one rose apple tree was rich in leaves (and) foliage of a dense shadow.
<i>Tassa heṭṭhā kumārassa sayanaṃ paññāpetvā upari suvaṇṇatārakakacitaṃ vitānaṃ bandhāpetvā sāṇipākārena parikkhipāpetvā ārakkhaṃ ṭhapetvā</i>	Having prepared a place to lie down under it (i.e., the tree), tying up a canopied ceiling with arranged golden stars above, ordering a garment-curtain to (be hung and) surround (the place), placing a guard (there),
<i>rājā sabbālaṅkāraṃ alaṅkaritvā amaccagaṇaparivuto naṅgalakaraṇaṭṭhānaṃ agamāsi. Tattha rājā suvaṇṇanaṅgalaṃ gaṇhāti.</i>	The king, adorned by all adornments, surrounded by a group of ministers, left to the place of the plowing works. There the king took a golden plow.
<i>Amaccā ekenūnaaṭṭhasatarajatanāṅgalāni gahetvā ito cito ca kasanti.</i>	The ministers took one-less eight hundred (i.e., 799) silver plows and plowed here and there ("from here and from here").
<i>Rājā pana orato pāraṃ gacchati, pārato vā oraṃ gacchati.</i>	However, the king either goes from here to there, or he goes from there to here.
<i>Etasmiṃ thāne mahāsampatti hoti, bodhisattaṃ parivāretvā nisinnā dhātiyo rañño sampattiṃ passissāmāti antosāṇito bahi nikkhanta.</i>	There is a great abundance in that place (of plowing), (hence) the guards who were sitting gathered around the <i>Bodhisatta</i> (decided): "We will look at the abundance of the king" and left from inside the curtains.
<i>Bodhisatto ito cito ca olokento kañci adisvā vegena uṭṭhāya pallaṅkaṃ ābhujitvā ānāpāne pariggahetvā paṭhamajjhānaṃ nibbattesi.</i>	The <i>Bodhisatta</i> looked here and there around, not seeing anybody, quickly rose up, and sitting cross-legged, he grasped the in-breath (and) out-breath, (and) entered the first absorption (<i>Jhāna</i>). ¹⁰¹

⁹⁸ The verbatim Pāli-Myanmar translation however reads *ahaṭavatta*, translating it as "အစမေ့ခေသ-အဝတံ", which literally means "undigested clothes". I suppose that "new clothes" was the intended meaning.

⁹⁹ The Sub-Commentary explains that the king had one golden plough and the ministers had the 799 silver ploughs, making them altogether eight hundred.

¹⁰⁰ The verbatim Pāli-Myanmar translation however reads *ghanacchāyo*, translating it as "တခဲန့တေသ-အရိပိုသည", i.e. "has a strong, dark shadow".

¹⁰¹ In the documentary "Buddha", narrated by Richard Gere with Blair Brown, written and directed by David Grubin, 2010, 38:35 onward, we learn: "[narrator] He remembered a day when he was young, and sat by the river with his

<i>Dhātiyo khajjabhojjantare vicaramānā thokaṃ cirāyimsu, sesarukkānaṃ chāyā nivattā, tassa pana rukkhassa parimaṇḍalā hutvā aṭṭhāsi.</i>	It took just a short time that the guards walked here and there among the chewables (and) eatables. The shadows of other trees turned back, however, (the shadow) of the (rose apple) tree stayed round.
<i>Dhātiyo ayyaputto ekakoti vegena sāṇiṃ ukkhipitvā anto pavisamānā bodhisattaṃ sayane pallaṅkena nisinnaṃ tañca pāṭihāriyaṃ disvā gantvā rañño ārocayimsu –</i>	The guards (thinking): "the lord son is alone," quickly lifted the curtain (built around the rose apple tree), and entering inside (they) saw also that miracle - the <i>Bodhisatta</i> sitting cross-legged on the bed, and leaving they informed the king:
<i>"kumāro deva, evaṃ nisinna aññesaṃ rukkhānaṃ chāyā nivattā, jamburukkhassa parimaṇḍalā ṭhitā"ti.</i>	"Lord, the prince thus sitting, the shadows of other trees turned back, (whereas the shadow) of the rose apple tree stays round."
<i>Rājā vegenāgantvā pāṭihāriyaṃ disvā, "idaṃ te, tāta, dutiyaṃ vandana"nti puttāṃ vandi.</i>	The king quickly arrived, and seeing the miracle, he bowed down (in front of) the son, (saying): "This, (my) dear, is (my) second bowing to you."
<i>Idameṭaṃ sandhāya vuttaṃ – "pitu sakkassa kammante...pe... paṭhamajjhānaṃ upasampajja viharitā"ti.</i>	This was said in connection to that (i.e.): "while (my) Sakyan father worked...rep... (I) dwelled having attained the first absorption."
<i>Siyā nu kho eso maggo bodhāyāti bhaveyya nu kho etaṃ ānāpānassatipaṭhamajjhānaṃ bujjanatthāya maggoti.</i>	"Could that be the path to Enlightenment?" means might that the first absorption of in-breath (and) out-breath indeed (be) the path that leads to Awakening.
<i>Satānusāriiviññānti nayidaṃ bodhāya maggo bhavissati, ānāpānassatipaṭhamajjhānaṃ pana bhavissatīti</i>	"Mindful remembering consciousness" means this (i.e. the austerities) will not be a path to Awakening, the first absorption of in-breath (and) out-breath however will be.
<i>evaṃ ekaṃ dve vāre uppannasatiyā anantaraṃ uppannaviññānaṃ satānusāriiviññānaṃ nāma.</i>	Thus the uninterrupted consciousness that occurs by the occurrence of one (or) two turns of mindfulness is called the "mindful remembering consciousness." ¹⁰²
<i>Yaṃ taṃ sukhanti yaṃ taṃ ānāpānassatipaṭhamajjhānasukhaṃ.</i>	"If that pleasure" means if that pleasure of the first absorption of in-breath (and) out-breath.

<i>483. "Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, etadahosi – 'na kho taṃ sukhaṃ sukhaṃ adhigantuṃ evaṃ adhimattakasimānaṃ pattakāyena.</i>	483. "Then, Bhāradvāja, this occurred to me: "Indeed, it is not easy to attain that pleasure by a body fallen into such great emaciation.
<i>Yaṃnūnāhaṃ oḷārikaṃ āhāraṃ āhāreyyaṃ odanakummāsa'nti.</i>	What if I ate a coarse meal, (namely) milk-rice?"
<i>So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, oḷārikaṃ āhāraṃ āhāresim odanakummāsaṃ.</i>	Then I, Bhāradvāja, indeed ate a coarse meal, (namely) milk-rice. ¹⁰³
<i>Tena kho pana maṃ, bhāradvāja, samayena pañcavaggiyā bhikkhū paccupaṭṭhitā honti –</i>	At that time, Bhāradvāja, indeed the group of five monks however cared for me:
<i>'yaṃ kho samaṇo gotamo dhammaṃ adhigamissati taṃ no ārocessatīti.</i>	"Whatever truth the ascetic Gotama attains, (he) will inform us of it."
<i>Yato kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, oḷārikaṃ āhāraṃ āhāresim odanakummāsaṃ,</i>	When I, Bhāradvāja, indeed ate the coarse meal, (namely) the milk-rice,

father. And the perfection of the world as it was, simply gave itself to him. Years before, when Siddharta was a small boy, his father, the king, had taken him to a spring planting festival. While he watched the ceremonial dancing, he looked down at the grass. He thought about the insects and their eggs, destroyed as the field was planted. He was overwhelmed with sadness. [Jane Hirshfield] One great top word(?) of Buddhism is compassion, which is the deep affection that we feel for every thing, because we're all in it together. Be it other human beings, other animals, the planet as a whole, the creatures of this planet, the trees and rivers of this planet. Everything is connected. [narrator] It was a beautiful day. His mind drifted. As if by instinct, he crossed his legs in a yoga pose of meditation, and the natural world paid him homage. As the sun moved through the sky, the shadow shifted. But the shadow of the rose apple tree where he sat remained still. He felt a sense of pure joy." I found no mention of the ants or any other compassionate thoughts ascribed to the *bodhisatta* during the occasion of the ploughing festival in any of the scriptures available to me, nor even in the Great Chronicle of Tipiṭakadhara Mingun Sayadaw.

¹⁰² The Sub-Commentary further explains: "*Satiyā anussaraṇakaviññānaṃ satānusāriiviññānaṃ.*" = "Mindful remembering consciousness is the consciousness of one who mindfully remembers."

¹⁰³ Tipiṭakadhara Mingun Sayadaw explains, that the *bodhisatta* went for alms-round in the market town Sena, and within two or three days regained his previous appearance including all the 32 Marks of a Great Man, including the gold color of His skin.

<i>atha me te pañcavaggiyā bhikkhū nibbija pakkamiṃsu – 'bāhulliko samaṇo gotamo padhānavibbhanto āvatto bāhullāyā'ti.</i>	The group of five monks then left me displeased (thinking): "Greedy is the ascetic Gotama, having given up the effort (he) is (now) obstructed by greed."
--	---

382. <i>Paccupaṭṭhitā hontīti pañṇasālapariveṇasammajjanādivattakaraṇena upaṭṭhitā hontī.</i>	382. "Cared (for me)" means they cared (for the <i>Bodhisatta</i>) by carrying out duties such as sweeping the (<i>Bodhisatta's</i>) chamber of a leaf(-roofed) hall.
<i>Bāhullikoti paccayabāhulliko.</i>	"Greedy" means greedy for the (four) requisites. ¹⁰⁴
<i>Āvatto bāhullāyāti rasagiddho hutvā paṇītapinḍapātādīnaṃ atthāya āvatto.</i>	"Obstructed by greed" means gluttonous in tastes, (the <i>Bodhisatta</i>) was obstructed by the purposes of (search for) delicious alms-food, etc.
<i>Nibbija pakkamiṃsūti ukkaṇṭhitvā dhammaniyāmeneva pakkantā bodhisattassa sambodhiṃ pattakāle kāyavivekassa okāsadānatthaṃ dhammatāya gatā.</i>	"Left displeased" means being disgusted, (they) left only by the law of nature; (they) went away by the nature of the purpose to give (the <i>Bodhisatta</i>) opportunity for personal solitude at the time when the <i>Bodhisatta</i> was (about to) enter the Full Awakening.
<i>Gacchantā ca aññaṭṭhānaṃ agantvā bārāṇasimeva agamaṃsu.</i>	Going, (they) didn't go to any other place, (except that) they went only to Bārāṇasī.
<i>Bodhisatto tesu gatesu addhamāsaṃ kāyavivekaṃ labhitvā bodhimaṇḍe aparājītapallanke nisīditvā sabbaññutaññānaṃ paṭivijjhi.</i>	By their departure, the <i>Bodhisatta</i> gained personal solitude for half of a month, and sitting down on the platform of the Bodhi (tree), (he) penetrated the Omniscient Knowledge.

The Attainment of The Four Absorptions

<i>"So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, oḷārikaṃ āhāraṃ āhāretvā balaṃ gahevā vivicceva kāmehi vivicca akusalehi dhammehi savitakkaṃ savicāraṃ vivekaṃ pītisukhaṃ paṭhamaṃ jhānaṃ upasampajja vihāsiṃ.</i>	Then I, Bhāradvāja, indeed ate the coarse meal, gained strength, (and) devoid of sensual desires, devoid of unskillful thoughts, I dwelled having attained the first absorption (<i>Jhāna</i>) accompanied by (applied) thought, accompanied by sustained thought, born of seclusion, with joy (and) ease.
<i>Vitakkavicārānaṃ vūpasamā ajjhataṃ sampasādanaṃ cetaso ekodibhāvaṃ avitakkaṃ avicāraṃ samādhijaṃ pītisukhaṃ dutiyaṃ jhānaṃ upasampajja vihāsiṃ.</i>	Appeasing the (applied) thought (and) sustained thought, I attained and dwelled in the second absorption, pleasing inside, being of one mental (object), (with) no applied thought, no sustained thought, born of mental stability, joy, (and) ease.
<i>Pītiyā ca virāgā upekkhako ca vihāsiṃ, sato ca sampajāno sukhañca kāyena paṭisaṃvedesiṃ; yaṃ taṃ ariyā ācikkhanti – 'upekkhako satimā sukhavihārī'ti tatiyaṃ jhānaṃ upasampajja vihāsiṃ.</i>	I dwelled in joy and equanimous, without lust, mindful (and) clearly comprehending, I experienced ease also by (my) body. I attained dwelled in the third absorption, (in the way) how the Nobles point to it: "equanimous, the mindful (one) dwells at ease."
<i>Sukhassa ca pahānā dukkhassa ca pahānā pubbeva somanassadomanassānaṃ atthaṅgamā adukkhamasukhaṃ upekkhāsatipārisuddhiṃ catutthaṃ jhānaṃ upasampajja vihāsiṃ.</i>	Abandoning (physical) ease and abandoning (physical) displeasure as well, surpassing the previous pleasant mental (states) (and) unpleasant mental (states), I attained and dwelled in the fourth absorption (with) no displeasure, no pleasure, entirely pure in equanimity (and) mindfulness.

<i>MNA 4. Bhayabheravasuttavaṇṇanā</i>	Commentary for MN 4. Discourse on Dread (and) Scare
<i>51. ... Idāni imāya paṭipadāya adhigataṃ paṭhamajjhānaṃ ādiṃ katvā vijjāttayapariyosānaṃ visesaṃ dassento so kho ahantiādīmāha.</i>	51. ... Starting with the practice of the attained first absorption (the <i>Bodhisatta</i>) now, explaining the end (of the attainment) of the Three Knowledges, said: "Then I, indeed."
<i>Tattha vivicceva kāmehi...pe... catutthajjhānaṃ upasampajja vihāsinti ettha tāva yaṃ vattabbaṃ siyā,</i>	There "devoid of sensual pleasures...rep... I attained and dwelled in the fourth absorption," there so far

¹⁰⁴ From the main text it is obvious that "greedy" is related to the increase in food. However, the Commentary suggests that the *bodhisatta* seemed to be greedy for all four requisites, namely food, robes, dwelling place, and medicine.

<i>taṃ sabbam visuddhimagge pathavīkaṣiṇakathāyaṃ vuttam.</i>	whatever should be said, all that is said in the (chapter called) The Talk about Earth Kasiṇa in (the book) Path to Purity. ¹⁰⁵
<i>Kevalañhi tattha “upasampajja viharatī”ti āgataṃ, idha “vihāsi”nti, ayameva viseso.</i>	Indeed, (out of) all (the text), there "having attained (he) dwells" is appearing ("coming"), here "I dwelled" is just the difference (and nothing else).
<i>Kiṃ katvā pana bhagavā imāni jhānāni upasampajja vihāsīti, kammaṭṭhānaṃ bhāvetvā.</i>	What did the Exalted One, however, do, (that He) "attained and dwelled (in) these absorptions"? (He) practiced meditation.
<i>Kataram? Ānāpānassatikammaṭṭhānaṃ.</i>	Which (meditation)? The meditation of mindfulness on in-breath (and) out-breath.

<i>Imāni ca pana cattāri jhānāni kesañci cittaekaggatthāni honti, kesañci vipassanāpādakāni, kesañci abhiññāpādakāni, kesañci nirodhapādakāni, kesañci bhavokkamanatthāni.</i>	However, also, for some (people) these four absorptions are <u>the cause of mental one-pointedness</u> ; for some (they are) the <u>bases of Insight</u> (<i>vipassanā</i>); for some, the <u>bases of Supernatural Knowledge</u> ; for some, the <u>bases of Cessation</u> (of all defilements), (and) for some the <u>cause of transcending existence</u> .
<i>Tattha khīṇāsavānaṃ cittaekaggatthāni honti.</i>	There they are <u>the cause of one-pointedness</u> for those of perished defilements.
<i>Te hi samāpajjivā ekaggacittā sukhaṃ divasaṃ viharissāmāti iccevaṃ kaṣiṇaparikkammaṃ katvā aṭṭha samāpattiyo nibbattenti.</i>	Indeed, those (determine): "We will enter and dwell (throughout) the day pleurably, by mental one-pointedness." Thus they make prearrangements and arouse the eight attainments. ¹⁰⁶
<i>Sekkhaputhujanānaṃ samāpattito vuṭṭhāya samāhitena cittaena vipassissāmāti nibbattentānaṃ vipassanāpādakāni honti.</i>	To the trainees ¹⁰⁷ (and) worldlings (the absorptions) are the <u>bases of Insight</u> when they arouse (Insight) (determining): "after exiting from the attainment, we will observe well (<i>vipassissāma</i>) (the reality) by the well established (<i>samāhita</i>) mind."
<i>Ye pana aṭṭha samāpattiyo nibbattetvā abhiññāpādakajjhānaṃ samāpajjivā samāpattito vuṭṭhāya</i>	However, those who have aroused the eight attainments, entered the absorptions (that are) the <u>bases of Supernatural Knowledge</u> , exiting from the attainment,
<i>“ekopi hutvā bahudhā hotī”ti (dī. ni. 1.238; paṭi. ma. 1.102) vuttanayā abhiññāyo patthentā nibbattenti, tesam abhiññāpādakāni honti.</i>	And arouse (them) wishing for the Supernatural Knowledge in the way said (in <i>DN 2. Sāmaññaphala S.</i>): "being one he is many". ¹⁰⁸
<i>Ye pana aṭṭha samāpattiyo nibbattetvā nirodhasamāpattiṃ samāpajjivā sattāhaṃ acittā hutvā</i>	However, those who arouse the eight attainments, attain and stay in the Attainment of Cessation for seven days without mentality,
<i>ditṭheva dhamme nirodhaṃ nibbānaṃ patvā sukhaṃ viharissāmāti nibbattenti, tesam nirodhapādakāni honti.</i>	Entering the Cessation of phenomena in the present and arouse (thus the eight attainments) (determining): "we will dwell in ease," for them (the absorptions) are <u>bases of Cessation</u> .
<i>Ye pana aṭṭha samāpattiyo nibbattetvā aparihīnājjhānā brahmaloke uppajjissāmāti nibbattenti, tesam bhavokkamanatthāni honti.</i>	However, those who arouse the eight attainments and without losing the absorptions (at death) (determine): "We will be born in the Brahma World," for them (the absorptions) are the <u>cause of transcending existence</u> .

¹⁰⁵ Famous as "The Path of Purification" the translation of ven. Nāṇamoli is freely available online. The chapter on Earth Kasiṇa (there called "Chapter IV – The Earth Kasina"). Ven. Buddhaghosa there explains the prerequisites, methods, and the progress on the path toward all absorptions known in Buddhism in minute detail.

¹⁰⁶ Here "eight attainments" is taking the four material absorption (*cattāri rūpa jhānāni*) and the four immaterial absorptions (*arūpa jhānāni*) together. In order to attain Cessation (*Nirodha Samāpatti*) the eighth absorption is essential, so I suppose that the Commentator simplified causes and bases as "eight attainments" (*aṭṭhasamāpattiyo*) to make the list of causes and bases more comprehensible.

¹⁰⁷ I.e. the Stream-Enterers (*Sotāpanna*), Once-Returners (*Sakadāgāmi*), and Non-Returners (*Anāgāmi*).

¹⁰⁸ Taking the absorptions as the basis for supernatural powers, the monks attain them with the resolution to exercise their power when they exit from the absorptions. Supernatural powers, such as self-multiplication, levitation, disappearing and appearing, walking through mountains, diving in the earth, etc. are attained through the power of mental purity and concentration. The exact procedures, prerequisites and methods are described in *Visuddhimagga*, available freely online as "The Path of Purification".

<i>Bhagavatā panidaṃ catutthajjhānaṃ bodhirukkhamūle nibbattiṃ,</i>	However, it should be known that for the Exalted One the ("this") fourth absorption was aroused at the root of the Bodhi tree,
<i>taṃ tassa vipassanāpādakañceva ahosi abhiññāpādakañca sabbakiccasādhakañca, sabbalokiyalokuttaraguṇadāyakanti veditabbaṃ.</i>	(and) for Him, it became the basis of Insight, the basis for Supernatural Knowledge, the accomplishment of all tasks (such as the attainment of psychic powers), and the source of all worldly qualities (and) (the qualities) beyond the world as well.

The Three Supernatural Powers

<i>"So evaṃ samāhite citte parisuddhe pariyodāte anaṅgaṇe vigatūpakkilese mudubhūte kammaniye thite āneñjappatte pubbenivāsānussatiññāya cittaṃ abhininnāmesim.</i>	"Then, in the mind thus steady, pure, bright, spotless, void of defilements, subtle, pliable, stable, unshakeable, (I) supernaturally directed the mind toward the Knowledge of Remembering Past Existences.
<i>So anekavihiṭaṃ pubbenivāsaṃ anussarāmi, seyyathidaṃ – ekampi jātiṃ dvepi jātiyo tisso pi jātiyo catasso pi jātiyo pañcapi jātiyo dasa pi jātiyo</i>	Thus (I) remember numerous previous existences, namely – even one birth, even two births, even three births, even four births, even five births,
<i>visampi jātiyo tiṃsampi jātiyo cattālīsampi jātiyo paññāsampi jātiyo jātisatampi jātisahassampi jātisatasahassampi</i>	Even twenty births, even thirty births, even forty births, even fifty births, even hundred births, even thousand births, even hundred thousand births,
<i>anekepi saṃvaṭṭakappe anekepi vivaṭṭakappe anekepi saṃvaṭṭavivaṭṭakappe –</i>	Even numerous eons of (world's) formation, even numerous eons of (world's) destruction, even numerous eons of (world's) formation (and) destruction -
<i>'amutrāsīm evaṃnāmo evaṃgotto evaṃvaṇṇo evamāhāro evaṃsukhadukkhappaṭisaṃvedī evamāyupariyanto,</i>	'There was (I), of such name, such clan, such color, such food, experiencing such pleasure (and) suffering, thus ending the life-span,
<i>so tato cuto amutra udapādim; tatrāpāsīm evaṃnāmo evaṃgotto evaṃvaṇṇo evamāhāro evaṃsukhadukkhappaṭisaṃvedī evamāyupariyanto, so tato cuto idhūpapanno 'ti.</i>	(and) then dying from there (I) was born elsewhere ("there"), (and) I passed (my life) there (being) of such name, such clan, such color, such food, experiencing such pleasure (and) suffering, thus ending the life-span, (and) then dying from there I am born here.'
<i>Iti sākāraṃ sauddesaṃ anekavihiṭaṃ pubbenivāsaṃ anussarāmi.</i>	Thus I remember (my) numerous previous existences of various characteristics in detail.
<i>Ayaṃ kho me, bhāradvāja, rattiyā paṭhame yāme paṭhamā vijjā adhiḡatā, avijjā vihatā, vijjā uppannā; tamo vihato, āloko uppanno; yathā taṃ appamattassa ātāpino pahitattassa viharato.</i>	That, for me, Bhāradvāja, was indeed the first Knowledge acquired during the first phase (of the night), ignorance eliminated, Knowledge arisen; darkness eliminated, light arisen; because it (happened to me,) the mindful ("not forgetful"), who dwelled endeavoring, making an effort.

<i>52. Yesaṃca guṇānaṃ dāyakaṃ ahosi, tesam ekadesaṃ dassento so evaṃ samāhite cittetiādīmāha.</i>	He (the Buddha) said, "In the mind thus steady," showing in part whatever qualities was (that mental state) providing.
<i>Tattha dvinnaṃ vijjānaṃ anupadavaṇṇanā ceva bhāvanānayo ca visuddhimagge vitthārito.</i>	The word-by-word definition for the two Knowledges ¹⁰⁹ there, as well as the way of meditation ("development"), is detailed in the (book) "Path to Purity."
<i>Kevalaṃhi tattha "so evaṃ samāhite citte...pe... abhininnāmeti"ti vuttaṃ, idha "abhininnāmesi"nti.</i>	Indeed, (out of) all said there (namely) "then, in the mind thus steady...rep.... I supernaturally directed (the mind)..." here (the only difference is) "(he) supernaturally directed (the mind)."
<i>Ayaṃ kho me brāhmaṇāti ayaṃca appanāvāro tattha anāgatoti ayameva viseso.</i>	"That for me, Bhāradvāja" - This then is the portion on resolution, there (in "Path to Purity") it is not mentioned ("coming"), that is the only difference (in comparison with this original Pāli text).

¹⁰⁹ This includes the Knowledge of Past Existences as well as the second Knowledge of Divine Eye, or Knowledge of Death and Birth (explained below).

<i>Tattha soti so ahaṃ.</i>	"There he" ¹¹⁰ means "then I."
<i>Abhininnāmesinti abhinīhariṃ.</i>	"I supernaturally directed" means supernaturally carried toward.
<i>Abhininnāmesinti ca vacanato soti ettha so ahanti evamattho veditabbo.</i>	The meaning should be known thus: from the word "(I) supernaturally directed" and "then" there (it should be understood as) "then I".

<i>Yasmā cidam bhagavato vasena pubbenivāsānussatiñāṇaṃ āgaṭaṃ, tasmā "so tato cuto idhūpapanno"ti ettha evaṃ yojanā veditabbā.</i>	In the way this Knowledge of remembering past existences is appearing ("coming") (in the text) as (possessed) by the Exalted One, the connection there should thereby be known thus: "then dying from there (I) am born here."
<i>Ettha hi so tato cutoti paṭinivattantassa paccavekkhaṇaṃ.</i>	There, indeed "then dying from there" is the reflection on the (Buddha's) re-cycling. ¹¹¹
<i>Tasmā idhūpapannoti imissā idhūpapattiyā anantaraṃ.</i>	Therefore, "(I am) born here" means uninterruptedly until birth here.
<i>Amutra udapādinti tusitabhavanaṃ sandhāyāhāti veditabbo.</i>	"(I) was born in that place" should be known (as spoken) in connection to the World of Joy (<i>Tusitabhavana</i>). ¹¹²
<i>Tatrāpāsiṃ evaṃnāmoti tatrāpi tusitabhavane setaketu nāma devaputto ahoṣiṃ.</i>	"(And) passed (my life) there (being) of such name" means indeed, there in the World of Joy I was a son of a deity (i.e., a deity) named "Setaketu."
<i>Evaṃgottoti tāhi devatāhi saddhiṃ ekagotto.</i>	"Of such a clan" means being of the same clan as those deities.
<i>Evaṃvaṇṇoti suvaṇṇavaṇṇo.</i>	"Of such color" means golden colored.
<i>Evaṃāhāroti dibbasudhāhāro.</i>	"Of such food" means of the divine pure (" <i>suddha</i> ") food.
<i>Evaṃsukhadukkhappaṭisaṃvedīti evaṃ dibbasukhappaṭisaṃvedī.</i>	"Experiencing such pleasure (and) suffering" means thus experiencing divine pleasure.
<i>Dukkhaṃ pana saṅkhāradukkhāmeteva.</i>	The suffering (there), however, was just the suffering of formations (<i>saṅkhārā</i>). ¹¹³
<i>Evaṃāyupariyantoti evaṃ sattapaññāsavassakoṭṭisaṭṭhivassasatasahassāyupariyānto.</i>	"Thus ending the life-span" means thus ending the life-span of 576 million years (living in a World of Joy).
<i>So tato cutoti so ahaṃ tato tusitabhavanato cuto.</i>	"Then dying from there" means then I died from there, the World of Joy.
<i>Idhūpapannoti idha mahāmāyāya deviyā kucchimhi nibbatto.</i>	"I am born here" means born here from the womb of the queen Mahāmāyā.

<i>Ayaṃ kho me brāhmaṇātiādīsu meti mayā.</i>	"That for me, Bhāradvāja, indeed" etc. – (there) "for me" (<i>me</i>) means "by me" (<i>mayā</i>).
<i>Vijjāti viditakaraṇaṭṭhena vijjā.</i>	"Knowledge" is knowledge by the meaning of seeing.
<i>Kiṃ viditaṃ karoti?</i>	What makes (it) seen?
<i>Pubbenivāsaṃ.</i>	The previous existences.
<i>Avijjāti tasseva pubbenivāsassa aviditakaraṇaṭṭhena tappaṭicchādako moho vuccati.</i>	"Ignorance" is (thus) called the delusion that covers up, in terms of obscuring (" <i>not visibility</i> "), the previous existences.
<i>Tamoti sveva moho paṭicchādakaṭṭhena "tamo"ti vuccati.</i>	"Darkness," that is simply called "darkness" because it is the delusion, the coverer.

¹¹⁰ As in a previous part of this translation, the word "so" literally means "he", but here I translate it as "then" to avoid a confusion.

¹¹¹ The Buddha explained how His previous lives, consisting of birth and death, were coming again and again always consisting of birth and death.

¹¹² The World of Joy, "*Tusitabhavana*" or simply "*Tusita*" is the fourth heaven out of six where the deities still enjoy sensual pleasures. *Bodhisattas* are generally believed to stay there in their last life before the life when they become a Buddha in the world of humans.

¹¹³ The "*saṅkhāra dukkha*" can be understood as impermanence, or the old age and death which deities cannot avoid. A deity knows that he/she is old by five marks – their flowers wither, clothes gets dirty, the body is discolored, sweat trickles from both armpits, and the deity does not enjoy on his/her heavenly seat. (Mentioned in *Jātaka Commentary no. 531*.)

<i>Ālokoti sāyeva vijjā obhāsakaraṇaṭṭhena “āloko”ti vuccati.</i>	"Light," that is simply called "light" because it makes radiance.
<i>Ettha ca vijjā adhiḡatāti ayaṃ attho, sesaṃ pasamsāvacaṇaṃ.</i>	Also, there "Knowledge acquired" is the meaning; the rest are words of praise (for the attainment).
<i>Yojanā panettha ayaṃ kho me vijjā adhiḡatā, tassa me adhiḡatavijjassa avijjā vihatā, vinaṭṭhāti attho.</i>	There then is the connection: "This, indeed, is the Knowledge acquired by me, therefore to me of acquired Knowledge the ignorance is eliminated", meaning (so) because (the Buddha was) devoid (of it.).
<i>Kasmā? Yasmā vijjā uppannā.</i>	How? In the way the Knowledge arose.
<i>Esa nayo itarasmimpi padadvaye.</i>	That way (of explanation applies) also for the remaining two words.

<i>Yathā tanti ettha yathāti opamme.</i>	"Because it" there "because" means in the explanation,
<i>Tanti nipāto.</i>	"It" is a particle.
<i>Satiyā avippavāseṇa appamattassa.</i>	"To the mindful" (is meant) by not abandoning mindfulness.
<i>Vīriyātāpena ātāpino.</i>	"Endeavoring" (is meant) by exhausting effort.
<i>Kāye ca jīvite ca anapekkhatāya pahitattassa, pesitattassāti attho.</i>	The meaning (is) being energetic, carrying (the effort) without expectations from (his) body as well as life.
<i>Idaṃ vuttaṃ hoti “yathā appamattassa ātāpino pahitattassa viharato avijjā vihaññeyya, vijjā uppajjeyya.</i>	This is said: "In the way ignorance would be eliminated for one exhausting (himself) mindfully (and) dwelling energetic, for (him/her) the Knowledge would arise.
<i>Tamo vihaññeyya, āloko uppajjeyya.</i>	The darkness would be eliminated; the light would arise.
<i>Evameva mama avijjā vihatā, vijjā uppannā.</i>	Just so is my ignorance eliminated, (and) Knowledge arose.
<i>Tamo vihato, āloko uppanno.</i>	Darkness is eliminated; light has arisen.
<i>Etassa me padhānānuyogassa anurūpameva phalaṃ laddha”nti.</i>	There to me (thus) engaging in the endeavor (there was) attained a corresponding fruit.

<i>484. “So evaṃ samāhite citte parisuddhe pariyodāte anaḡgaṇe vigatūpakkilese mudubhūte kammaniye ṭhite āneñjappatte sattānaṃ cutūpapātāññāya cittaṃ abhininnāmesim.</i>	484. "Then, in the mind thus steady, pure, bright, spotless, void of defilements, subtle, pliable, stable, unshakeable, I supernaturally directed the mind toward the Knowledge of death (and) birth.
---	---

<i>Verañjakaṇḡa¹¹⁴</i>	The Portion on (the Brahmin) Verañja
<i>So dibbena cakkhunā visuddhena atikkantamānusakena¹¹⁵ satte passāmi cavamāne upapajjamāne hīne paṇite suvaṇṇe dubbaṇṇe.</i>	Then by divine eye, purified, surpassing the (ordinary) human, I see beings as they die, as they are born, inferior, superior, of desirable color, (or) undesirable color. ¹¹⁶
<i>Sugate duggate yathākammūpage satte pajānāmi – ‘ime vaṭa bhonto sattā kāyaduccaritena samannāgatā vacīduccaritena samannāgatā manoduccaritena samannāgatā ariyānaṃ upavādakā micchādīṭṭhikā micchādīṭṭhikammasamādānā;</i>	I recognize beings born according to (their) <i>kamma</i> , coming to a pleasurable (existence) (as well as) (those) coming to a painful (existence) – "Oh dear, these beings endowed with bodily misconduct, endowed with verbal misconduct, endowed with mental misconduct, blaming the Noble Ones, of wrong views, undertaking actions based on wrong views,

¹¹⁴ This is a detailed version of the attainment coming from *Vinaya Pitaka – Pārājika Pāli – Verañjakanda*, and it also appears in many other scriptures throughout the ancient strata of Pāli texts: *DN 2, 10, 25, 28; MN 4, 6, 12, 51, 72, 78, 94, 101, 130; SN 12, 16, 51; AN 3, 5, 6, 8, 10, 11*; also in *Iti, MNid, CNid, Psm, Netti*; and also in *Vibhaḡga and Puggalapaññatti* of *Abhidhamma Pitaka*.

¹¹⁵ In the Pāli scripture written in Burmese characters (which is the source of this quote) is mentioned that in certain other versions of the *Tipiṭaka* (written in Burmese script) this word appears also in different spelling, namely "atikkantamānussakena". Both of the spellings have the same meaning.

¹¹⁶ The original says "good color" and "bad color", but this may lead to misunderstanding. The Commentary to this passage explains that "good color" is a desirable color without blemishes, whereas "bad color" is undesirable color with blemishes. (A good example could be the sickness of skin where the person is naturally of darker color, but here and there arise undesirable bright spots. Today it is known as "vitiligo", or "albinism".)

<i>te kāyassa bhedaṃ paraṃ maraṇā apāyaṃ duggatiṃ vinipātaṃ nirayaṃ upapannā.</i>	They, when (their) body is destroyed after death, are born in a realm of woe, in a painful destination, in a state of punishment, in hell.
<i>Ime vā pana bhonto sattā kāyasucaritena samannāgatā vacīsucaritena samannāgatā manosucaritena samannāgatā ariyānaṃ anupavādakā sammādiṭṭhikā sammādiṭṭhikammasamādānā;</i>	However, dear, these beings on the contrary, endowed with good bodily conduct, endowed with good verbal conduct, endowed with good mental conduct, not blaming Noble Ones, of right view, undertaking actions based on right view,
<i>te kāyassa bhedaṃ paraṃ maraṇā sugatiṃ saggam lokaṃ upapannā'ti.</i>	They, when (their) body is destroyed, after death, are born in a realm of joy, in a heavenly realm. ¹¹⁷
<i>Iti dibbena cakkhunā visuddhena atikkantamānusakena satte passāmi cavamāne upapajjamāne hīne paṇīte suvaṇṇe dubbaṇṇe.</i>	Thus by divine eye, purified, surpassing the (ordinary) human, I see beings as they die, as they are born, inferior, superior, of desirable color, (or) undesirable color.
<i>Sugate duggate yathākammūpage satte pajānāmi.</i>	I recognize beings born according to (their) <i>kamma</i> , coming to a pleasurable (existence) (as well as) (those) coming to a painful (existence).

<i>ayaṃ kho me, bhāradvāja, rattiyā majjhime yāme dutiyā vijjā adhiḡatā, avijjā vihatā, vijjā uppannā; tamo vihatō, āloko uppanno; yathā taṃ appamattassa ātāpino pahitattassa viharato.</i>	That, for me, Bhāradvāja, was indeed the first Knowledge acquired during the second phase (of the night), ignorance eliminated, Knowledge arisen; darkness eliminated, light arisen; because it (happened to me,) the mindful ("not forgetful"), who dwelled endeavoring, making an effort.
--	---

<i>53. Cutūpapātakathāyaṃ yasmā idha bhagavato vasena pāli āgatā, tasmā "passāmi pajānāmi"ti vuttaṃ, ayaṃ viseso.</i>	53. In the talk on death (and) birth, how here appears ("comes") the written text (<i>Pāli</i>) by the Exalted One, thus is said: "I see, I know," that is the (only) difference (between this text and the text in " <i>Path to Purity</i> ").
<i>Sesaṃ visuddhimagge vuttasadisameva.</i>	The remaining (explanation) is just the same as told in " <i>Path to Purity</i> ".
<i>Ettha pana vijjāti dibbacakkhuñāṇavijjā.</i>	There, however, " <i>Knowledge</i> " is (called) the Knowledge of knowing (by) the divine eye.
<i>Avijjāti sattānaṃ cutipaṭisandhipaṭicchādikā avijjā.</i>	"Ignorance" is the ignorance that covers the death (and) birth of beings.
<i>Sesaṃ vuttanayamevāti.</i>	The rest is just as told (in the main text).
<i>Yasmā ca pūritapāramīnaṃ mahāsattānaṃ parikkammakiccaṃ nāma natthi.</i>	Also, how there is no such duty of Great Beings (<i>Bodhisattas</i>) to make resolution (related to) the completed perfections, ¹¹⁸
<i>Te hi citte abhininnāmitamatteyeva anekavihitam pubbenivāsaṃ anussaranti, dibbena cakkhunā satte passanti.</i>	Indeed, right to the extent of supernaturally directing (their) minds, they remember numerous previous existences, (and) see beings by the divine eye.
<i>Tasmā yo tattha parikkammaṃ ādiṃ katvā bhāvanānayo vutto, na tena idha atthoti.</i>	Therefore whatever meditation method is explained starting there by (such) resolution, that is not meant here. ¹¹⁹

¹¹⁷ Now in the West (where any specks of Right View have been shrouded by materialist nihilism) we will commonly encounter individuals who have difficulty in accepting existence of heaven, hell, or even next birth. As a reaction to this distressful situation certain Buddhist monks (who thereby do not acknowledge the importance of Right View) suggest that the "hell" and "heaven" is the mental suffering which human commonly experiences during their life as a human. This is however going directly against the Buddha's word: "*kāyassa bhedaṃ paraṃ maraṇā*" - "when the body is destroyed, after death". Indeed, the Buddha Himself has seen by His own wisdom and psychic powers that there is hell and heaven, and He has also seen the living beings as they travel in the different worlds based on their previous actions (*kamma*). That particular Knowledge and Vision is the very reason why the Buddha taught the path to Liberation – because He was well aware of the dangerous destinations where the beings may fall if they are not Enlightened.

¹¹⁸ The Perfections (*pāramī*) are ten, and they should be perfected by a *Bodhisatta* in order to be qualified to become a Buddha.

¹¹⁹ I.e. for the *bodhisattas* the recollection of past existences as well as the divine eye are Knowledges acquired without any particular resolution. They just little bit direct their mind toward those Knowledges and immediately attain them.

<i>“So evaṃ samāhite citte parisuddhe pariyodāte anaṅgaṇe vigaṭūpakkilese mudubhūte kammaniye thite āneñjappatte āsavānaṃ khayaññāyā cittaṃ abhininnāmesim.</i>	"Then, in the mind thus steady, pure, bright, spotless, void of defilements, subtle, pliable, stable, unshakeable, I supernaturally directed the mind toward the Knowledge of destroyed taints.
<i>So ‘idaṃ dukkha’nti yathābhūtaṃ abbhāññāsim, ‘ayaṃ dukkhasamudayo’ti yathābhūtaṃ abbhāññāsim, ‘ayaṃ dukkhanirodho’ti yathābhūtaṃ abbhāññāsim, ‘ayaṃ dukkhanirodhagāminī paṭipadā’ti yathābhūtaṃ abbhāññāsim;</i>	Then I supernaturally knew: "This is suffering" as it is; I supernaturally knew: "this is the cause of suffering" as it is; I supernaturally knew: "this is the cessation of suffering" as it is; I supernaturally knew: "this is the practice leading to the cessation of suffering" as it is;
<i>‘ime āsavā’ti yathābhūtaṃ abbhāññāsim, ‘ayaṃ āsavasamudayo’ti yathābhūtaṃ abbhāññāsim, ‘ayaṃ āsavanirodho’ti yathābhūtaṃ abbhāññāsim, ‘ayaṃ āsavanirodhagāminī paṭipadā’ti yathābhūtaṃ abbhāññāsim.</i>	I supernaturally knew: "These are taints" as they are; I supernaturally knew: "This is the origin of taints" as it is; I supernaturally knew: "This is the cessation of taints" as it is; I supernaturally knew: "this is the practice leading to the cessation of taints" as it is.
<i>Tassa me evaṃ jānato evaṃ passato kāmāsavāpi cittaṃ vimuccittha, bhavāsavāpi cittaṃ vimuccittha, avijjāsavāpi cittaṃ vimuccittha.</i>	Thereafter to me, knowing thus, seeing thus, the mind also liberated from the taint of sensual (desires), the mind also liberated from the taint of existence, (and finally) the mind also liberated from the taint of ignorance.
<i>Vimuttasim vimuttamiti ñāṇaṃ ahosi.</i>	There arose the knowledge: "This is liberation in liberation." ¹²⁰
<i>‘Khīṇā jāti, vusitaṃ brahmacariyaṃ, kataṃ karaṇīyaṃ, nāparaṃ itthattāyā’ti abbhāññāsim.</i>	I supernaturally knew: "Destroyed is birth, accomplished is the practice of holy life, done is what should have been done, there is no further expectation."
<i>Ayaṃ kho me, bhāradvāja, rattiyā pacchime yāme tatiyā vijjā adhiḡatā, avijjā vihatā, vijjā uppannā; tamo vihatō, āloko uppanno; yathā taṃ appamattassa ātāpino pahitattassa viharato’</i> ti.	This, for me, Bhāradvāja, was indeed the third Knowledge acquired during the third phase (of the night), ignorance eliminated, Knowledge arisen; darkness eliminated, light arisen; because it (happened to me,) the mindful ("not forgetful"), who dwelled endeavoring, making an effort.

<i>54. Tatiyavijjāya so evaṃ samāhite citteti vipassanāpādaḡaṃ catutthajjhānacittaṃ veditabbaṃ.</i>	54. In the third Knowledge, it should be known that "then, in the mind thus steady" means the mind of fourth absorption, (being) the basis for Insight.
<i>Āsavānaṃ khayaññāyāti arahattamaggaññāṭṭhāya.</i>	"Toward the Knowledge of destroyed taints" (was said), meaning the Knowledge of the Arahatta Path (<i>arahattamagga</i>).
<i>Arahattamaggo hi āsavavināsanato āsavānaṃ khayoti vuccati, tatra cetāṃ ñāṇaṃ, tappariyāpannattāti.</i>	Indeed, the Arahatta Path is called (so) because (it) demolishes the taints, (being) the destruction of taints; there (in the text) also that is the Knowledge (acquired) by such thorough attainment.
<i>Cittaṃ abhininnāmesinti vipassanācittaṃ abhinñariṃ.</i>	"I supernaturally directed the mind" means I supernaturally carried the mind of Insight.
<i>So idaṃ dukkhanti evamādīsu “ettaḡaṃ dukkhaṃ, na ito bhiyyo”ti sabbampi dukkhasaccaṃ sarasalakkaṇapaṭivedhena yathābhūtaṃ abbhāññāsim jāniṃ paṭivijjhiṃ.</i>	Then in (the words) such as "this is suffering" (the meaning is) "this much is suffering, there is no more than that" – realizing all the Truth of Suffering with its characteristics (and) marks, I supernaturally knew, recognized, (and) penetrated.
<i>Tassa ca dukkhassa nibbattikaṃ taṇhaṃ ayaṃ dukkhasamudayoti.</i>	The craving that gives rise to that suffering, that is the "Cause of Suffering."
<i>Tadubhayampi yaṃ thānaṃ patvā nirujjhati, taṃ tesāṃ appavattim nibbānaṃ ayaṃ dukkhanirodhoti.</i>	Both of them (i.e., the Suffering and Craving) cease when (one) attains that state (of <i>Nibbāna</i>), <i>Nibbāna</i> is that which is the absence of them (i.e., of Suffering and Craving), (and) that is the Cessation of Suffering.
<i>Tassa sampāpakaṃ ariyamaggaṃ ayaṃ dukkhanirodhagāminī paṭipadāti</i>	The meaning should be known thus: "I supernaturally knew, recognized, (and) penetrated as it is by realizing

¹²⁰ I.e. the Buddha then was aware that by His attainment of Arahatta Fruition (*arahattaphala*) He was liberated from all defilements.

<i>sarasalakkhaṇapaṭivedhena yathābhūtaṃ abbhaññāsīm jāniṃ paṭivijjhinti evamattho vedītabbo.</i>	(it) with its characteristics (and) marks: "this is the practice leading to the cessation of taints," (being) the noble path to the attainment of it (i.e., of Cessation of Suffering).
---	---

<i>Evam sarūpato saccāni dassetvā idāni kilesavasena pariyāyato dassento ime āsavātiādīmāha.</i>	Showing the Truth thus with their characteristics, now (the Buddha) said: "These are taints," showing (the attainment) thoroughly in terms of defilements.
<i>Tassa me evam jānato evam passatoti tassa mayham evam jānantassa evam passantassa.</i>	"Thereafter to me, knowing thus, seeing thus" means thereafter to me who knew thus, who saw thus.
<i>Saha vipassanāya koṭippattaṃ maggaṃ katheti.</i>	(The Buddha) proclaims the Path culminating in the <i>summum bonum</i> (which He) attained through Insight.
<i>Kāmasavāti kāmasavato.</i>	"From taint of sensual (desires)" means from the taint of sensuality.
<i>Vimuccitthāti iminā phalakkhaṇaṃ dasseti, maggakkhaṇe hi cittaṃ vimuccati, phalakkhaṇe vimuttaṃ hoti.</i>	"Liberated" – by this (the Buddha) shows the moment of Fruition (<i>phala</i>). Indeed, in the moment of Path, the mind is being liberated, and in the moment of Fruition (the mind) is liberated. ¹²¹
<i>Vimuttasmiṃ vimuttamiti ñānanti iminā paccavekkhaṇaṇāṇaṃ dasseti.</i>	The knowledge: "This is liberation in liberation" – by this (the Buddha) shows the (Insight) knowledge of reflection. ¹²²
<i>Khīṇā jātītiādīhi tassa bhūmiṃ, tena hi ñāṇena bhagavā paccavekkhanto "khīṇā jāti"tiādīni abbhaññāsī.</i>	"Destroyed is birth," etc., is the object of it (i.e., the knowledge of reflection). Indeed, by that knowledge, the Exalted One (while) reflecting supernaturally knew: "Destroyed is birth," etc.
<i>Katamā pana bhagavato jāti khīṇā, kathaṅca naṃ abbhaññāsīti?</i>	However, what birth of the Exalted One was destroyed, and how did (He) supernaturally know it?
<i>Na tāvassa atītā jāti khīṇā, pubbeva khīṇattā, na anāgatā, anāgate vāyāmābhāvato, na paccuppanā, vijjamānattā.</i>	Not that His previous births would be destroyed because (those) were destroyed already in the past. Not (even) the future (births), because there was no effort made by (the Buddha) in the future (yet); (and) not (even) the present (birth), because (that birth) was obvious (so not destroyed indeed).
<i>Yā pana maggassa abhāvitattā uppajjeyya ekacatupañcavokārabhavesu ekacatupañcakkhandhabhedā jāti,</i>	Whatever then is the birth of one, four, (or) five aggregates ¹²³ in the worlds of one, four, (or) five bases that might arise by not practicing the Path,
<i>sā maggassa bhāvitattā anuppādadammatam āpajanena khīṇā, taṃ so maggabhāvanāya pahīnakilese paccavekkhitvā</i>	That is destroyed by practicing the Path, (and thereby) by entering the reality of non-arising; that He (i.e., the Buddha) reflected upon when (His) defilements were abandoned by the practice of the Path,
<i>"kilesābhāve vijjamānampi kammaṃ āyatim appaṭisandhikam hoti"ti jānanto abbhaññāsī.</i>	(Thereafter) recognized (and) supernaturally knew: "In the absence of the defilements, even the obvious <i>kamma</i> , ¹²⁴ is unable to (cause) rebirth again." ¹²⁵

¹²¹ In accordance with the 17 Insight Knowledges (*vipassanā ñāṇa*), which are all stages of Enlightenment for each of the four levels, there are separate mind-moments for the Path (*magga*) and Fruition (*phala*). A detailed explanation of Insight Knowledges can be read in "*The Progress of Insight*", a transcription from Mahasi Sayadaw's Dhamma talks on that topic. It is available online to download for free.

¹²² *Paccavekkhaṇaṇāṇa* is the last of the 17 Insight Knowledges. There the yogi reflects on their attainment from the position where he/she already has it.

¹²³ In Buddhism there are "five aggregates" which constitute a being: body, feelings/sensations, perceptions, volitions (or intentions), and consciousness. In the 31 worlds that make up the Buddhist cosmological system there is one Brahma world where the beings have only one aggregate, the body (the *Asaññasattā* world, attained through the fourth absorption that was practiced during the previous life as a human), and four Brahma worlds where the beings have only four aggregates, the four aggregates of mentality (the *Arūpa* worlds, attained through the fifth to eighth absorption that was practiced during the previous life as a human).

¹²⁴ The "obvious *kamma*" is *kamma* of which consequences have yet to be experienced.

¹²⁵ In other words, the Buddha has not destroyed "birth" (in terms of life), but rather the cause of birth, i.e. craving (*taṇhā*) with all its related defilements, thereby nipping the rebirth-*kamma* in the bud. The Buddha's previous *kamma* had yet to bring its results, but none of it would cause a new birth. (Note however, that unlike *Apadāna Pāli – 10. Pubbakammapiṭotikabuddhaapadānam* where the Buddha is reported as He Himself reveals what *kamma* He had to suffer even after His attainment of Buddhahood, the Arahant ven. Nāgasena in *Milindapañhāpāli 4.1.8.*

<i>Vusitanti vuttham parivuttham, kataṃ caritaṃ niṭṭhanti attho.</i>	"Accomplished" has the meaning of practiced, accomplished, done, abode, ended.
<i>Brahmacariyanti maggabrahmacariyaṃ, puthujjanakalyāṇakena hi saddhiṃ sattasekkhā brahmacariyavāsaṃ vasanti nāma, khīṇāsavo vutthavāso.</i>	"Holy life" is the path of holy life. Indeed, it is a good worldling together with the seven trainees who live the life of holy life; (and then) one of destroyed taints is accomplished in (that) living.
<i>Tasmā bhagavā attano brahmacariyavāsaṃ paccavekkhanto "vusitaṃ brahmacariya"nti abbhaññāsi.</i>	Therefore the Exalted One supernaturally knew, reflecting on (His) own life of holy life: "Accomplished is the practice of holy life."
<i>Kataṃ karaṇīyanti catūsu saccesu catūhi maggehi pariññāpahānasacchikiriyābhāvanāvasena soḷasavidhampi kiccaṃ niṭṭhāpitanti attho.</i>	"Done is what should have been done" has the meaning that the duty of even the sixteen ways of suppressing (the defilements) ¹²⁶ by thorough knowledge (and) asseveration of truth through the Four Truths (and) the Four Paths are finished.
<i>Puthujjanakalyāṇakādayo hi taṃ kiccaṃ karonti, khīṇāsavo katakaraṇīyo.</i>	Indeed, the worldlings, good persons, etc., fulfill ("do") that duty, (and) one of destroyed taints has fulfilled ("done") (all) what had to be done.
<i>Tasmā bhagavā attano karaṇīyaṃ paccavekkhanto "kataṃ karaṇīya"nti abbhaññāsi.</i>	Therefore, the Exalted One reflecting on (His) own duties, supernaturally knew: "Done is what should have been done."
<i>Nāparaṃ itthattāyāti idāni puna itthabhāvāya evaṃsoḷasakiccabhāvāya, kilesakkhayāya vā maggabhāvanākiccaṃ me natthīti abbhaññāsi.</i>	"There is no further expectation" – (the Buddha) supernaturally knew: "Now for me, there is no more expectation of existence, thus (also) existence of sixteen duties, of the destruction of the taints, or (even) the duty to practice the Path."
<i>Atha vā itthattāyāti itthabhāvato imasmā evampakārā idāni vattamānakkhandhasantānā aparaṃ khandhasantānaṃ mayhaṃ natthi.</i>	Otherwise, "of expectation" means from (this) existence (that was) wished for, from these characteristics of the flux of the present aggregates ¹²⁷ there is no (more) flux of aggregates for me."
<i>Ime pana pañcakkhandhā pariññātā tiṭṭhanti chinnamūlakā rukkhā viya.</i>	However, these thoroughly recognized five aggregates stay like trees that have been uprooted. ¹²⁸
<i>Te carimakaviññāṇanirodhena anupādāno viya jātavedo nibbāyissantīti abbhaññāsi.</i>	(The Buddha) supernaturally recognized, that like the fire (of oil lamp), which has no basis (i.e., no wick), they (i.e., the five aggregates) will be extinguished at the cessation of the last (moment of) consciousness (at the end of His life).
<i>Idāni evaṃ paccavekkhaṇaṇāṇapariggahitaṃ āsavānaṃ khayaṇādhigamaṃ brāhmaṇassa dassento, ayaṃ kho me brāhmaṇātiādīmāha.</i>	Now showing thus to the brahmin the acquisition of the Knowledge of Destruction of Taints, which was comprehended by the knowledge of reflection, (the Buddha) said: "This for me, brahmin." ¹²⁹
<i>Tattha vijjāti arahattamaggañāṇavijjā.</i>	There "Knowledge" is the Knowledge of the knowledge of Arahatta Path.
<i>Avijjāti catusaccapaṭicchādikā avijjā.</i>	"Ignorance" is the ignorance that covers the Four Truths.
<i>Sesaṃ vuttanayameva.</i>	The rest is just in the way told (above).
<i>Ettāvata ca pubbenivāsañāṇena atītaṃsañāṇaṃ, dibbacakkhunā paccuppannānāgataṃsañāṇaṃ,</i>	That much is the (1) knowledge of the past by the Knowledge of Previous Existences, (2) the knowledge of conditionality (and) the future by the Divine Eye,

Akusalacchedapañho suggests that the Buddha had no *kamma* to suffer from after His Attainment. Referring to what the Buddha explained in SN 4.2.3.1. Samiddhi Sutta, all unpleasant that the Buddha had to experience was caused either by natural causes or by interpersonal relationships, not by *kamma*.)

¹²⁶ According to Abhidhammapitaka – Pañcapakarana Atthakathā – Dhātukathā-Atthakathā - 4.

Catukkaniddesavannanā – par. 185 the sixteen duties is the realization of the Four Noble Truths at each of the four levels of Enlightenment (Stream-Enterer, Once-Returner, Non-Returner, Arahant). (4 x 4 = 16)

¹²⁷ "Flux" here means the constant change. It is the constant change of the five aggregates of being, namely: body, feelings, perceptions, volitions (intentions), and consciousness.

¹²⁸ I.e. the Buddha's materiality and mentality still exist (or "flow"), but like the trees that have been uprooted will never take root again, the Buddha's materiality and mentality will not give rise to a new birth.

¹²⁹ This might have been a slip of tongue, because in the main text the Buddha calls him "Bhāradvāja", not "brahmin".

<i>āsavakkhayena sakalalokiyalokuttaragūṇanti evaṃ tīhi vijjāhi sabbepi sabbaññiguṇe saṅgahetvā pakāseto attano asammohavihāraṃ brāhmaṇassa dassesi.</i>	(and) (3) the (knowledge of) the character of all the mundane (and) the supramundane by the (Knowledge) of Destroyed Taints – thus by the three Knowledges (the Buddha) summarized all (His) virtues of (His) Omniscience and showed the brahmin (His) own abiding free from any delusion.
--	--

The Buddha's Visitor Becomes a Buddhist

<i>485. Evaṃ vutte, saṅgāraṃ māṇava bhagavantaṃ etadavoca – “aṭṭhitavatāṃ¹³⁰ bhoṭo gotamassa padhānaṃ ahoṣi, sappurisavatāṃ¹³¹ bhoṭo gotamassa padhānaṃ ahoṣi; yathā taṃ arahato sammāsambuddhassa.</i>	485. (When it) was thus spoken (by the Buddha), the young man Saṅgāraṃ told this to the Exalted One: "There has been made a continuous effort in striving by friend Gotama, there has been made a good man's effort in striving by friend Gotama, so that He (became) the Arahant, Rightly (and) Fully Awakened.
<i>Kim nu kho, bho gotama, atthi devā¹³²”ti?</i>	"Well, friend Gotama, do gods exist?"
<i>“Thānaso metaṃ¹³³ bhāradvāja, viditaṃ yadidaṃ – adhidevā¹³⁴”ti.</i>	"This is known by me according to the conditions, Bhāradvāja, namely the higher gods."
<i>“Kim nu kho, bho gotama, ‘atthi devā¹³²’ti puṭṭho samāno ‘thānaso metaṃ, bhāradvāja, viditaṃ yadidaṃ adhidevā¹³⁴’ti vadesi.</i>	"Well, friend Gotama, why when asked: 'do gods exist,' you say: 'this is known by me according to the conditions, Bhāradvāja, namely the higher gods'?"
<i>Nanu, bho gotama, evaṃ sante tucchā musā hoti¹³⁵”ti?</i>	Being so, isn't (your speech) empty (and) false?"
<i>“‘Atthi devā¹³²’ti, bhāradvāja, puṭṭho samāno ‘atthi devā¹³²’ti yo vadeyya, ‘thānaso me viditā¹³⁵’yo vadeyya;</i>	"Bhāradvāja, if anyone when asked 'do gods exist' says 'gods exist', if anyone says 'this is known by me according to the conditions',
<i>atha khvettha viññunā purisena ekamsena niṭṭhaṃ gantabbaṃ¹³⁶ yadidaṃ – ‘atthi devā¹³²’ti.</i>	Thereafter, indeed, there by the knowledgeable man should be thoroughly definitely understood ("taken") this, namely, 'gods exist.'
<i>“Kissa pana me bhavaṃ gotamo ādikeneva na byākāsi¹³⁷”ti.</i>	"Why then the Exalted Gotama didn't tell me (this) already before?"
<i>“Uccena sammataṃ kho etaṃ, bhāradvāja, lokasmiṃ yadidaṃ – ‘atthi devā¹³²’ti.</i>	"Indeed, Bhāradvāja, this is generally established in the world, namely, 'gods exist.'

<i>485. Aṭṭhitavatanti aṭṭhitatapaṃ, assa padhānapadena saddhiṃ sambandho, tathā sappurisapadassa.</i>	485. "Continuous effort" means continuous exertion, (that) is connected with the word "striving," thereafter with the word "good man".
--	--

¹³⁰ Sinhalese, Thai, Cambodian, and PTS(?) we find the word separated by space: *aṭṭhita vata* (no difference in meaning)

¹³¹ Sinhalese, Thai, Cambodian, and PTS(?) we find the word separated by space: *sappurisa vata* (no difference in meaning)

¹³² In certain Burmese versions of the Pāli Tipiṭaka, all "*atthi devā*" is inscribed as "*adhidevā*". "*Atthi devā*" means "be a deity". "*Adhidevā*" means "higher-deity" / "higher-god. Usually it is the Buddha who is called *adhidevo*, because the Buddha is superior to all gods in His wisdom. However, in this particular case – as the *Commentaries* and *Sub-Commentaries* explain, the word *adhidevā* points to the fact that "*devā*" ("deities") is a word also used for one's children, for the kings and queens of the country. Thus "*adhidevā*" ("super-deities / higher gods") point to the deities of greater powers, i.e. the deities in heaven.

¹³³ According to the Thai, Cambodian, and some Burmese version of the Pāli Tipiṭaka instead of *metaṃ* there should be *panetaṃ*. *Metaṃ* (*me + etaṃ*) means "this by me", whereas *kho panetaṃ* (*kho pana + etaṃ*) means "however, indeed, this".

¹³⁴ According to the Sinhalese, Thai, Cambodian, and PTS(?) versions there should be "*atthi devāti*" (gods exist). The version used here contains *adhidevā* (Super-God), and the transcriber suggests whether *atidevā* (Super-God) would be plausible here. The Pāli text here says "*adhidevā*" now.

¹³⁵ The Sinhalese, Thai, Cambodian, and PTS(?) say "*thānaso viditā me viditāti*", i.e. "it is known according to the conditions, known by me" and the transcriber again suggests "*thānaso me viditā atidevāti*", i.e. "the super-gods are known by me according to conditions."

¹³⁶ Some Burmese editions of Pāli Tipiṭaka say "*gantum*" and Thai with Cambodian versions say "*gantum vā*". The difference is only grammatical.

¹³⁷ Some Burmese editions of Pāli Tipiṭaka say "*gotamo ādikeneva byākāsīti*" and the transcriber suggests "*gotamo atthi devāti na byākāsīti*", but the difference is only grammatical.

<i>Idaṅhi vuttaṃ hoti – bhoto gotamassa aṭṭhitapadhānavataṃ ahoṣi, sappurisapadhānavataṃ ahoṣīti.</i>	Indeed, this is said: "there was a continuous effort in the striving of friend Gotama, there was a continuous effort of a good man."
<i>Atthi devāti puṭṭho samānoti idaṃ māṇavo "sammāsambuddho ajānantova pakāsesī"ti saññāya āha.</i>	"When asked 'do gods exist' - this the young man asked, perceiving, "The Rightly (and) Fully Awakened One proclaims not knowing (it himself)."
<i>Evaṃ santeti tumhākaṃ ajānanabhāve sante.</i>	"Being so" means "When your (<i>pl.</i>) ¹³⁸ ignorance is so."
<i>Tucchaṃ musā hotīti tumhākaṃ kathā aphaḷā nipphalā hoti.</i>	"(Isn't it) empty (and) false" means "your (<i>pl.</i>) speech is meaningless, without a meaning."
<i>Evaṃ māṇavo bhagavantaṃ musāvādena niggaṇhāti nāma.</i>	Indeed, thus the young man accused the Exalted One of false speech.
<i>Viññunā purisenāti paṇḍitena manussena.</i>	"By a knowledgeable man," means by a wise man.
<i>Tvaṃ pana aviññutāya mayā byākatampi na jānāsīti dīpeti.</i>	(The Buddha then) explains: "You, however, out of (your) ignorance, don't know (that) what was said by me."
<i>Uccena sammatanti uccena saddena sammatam pākātam lokasmiṃ.</i>	"Obviously established" means established by an obvious word (/sound), obvious in the world.
<i>Adhidevāti susudārakāpi hi devā nāma honti, deviyo nāma honti devā pana adhidevā nāma,</i>	"Higher gods" – even young children, indeed, are known as "gods"; there are, however, "goddesses," the "higher gods,"
<i>loke devo devīti laddhanāmehi manussehi adhiḷkāti attho.</i>	Meaning that in the world, "god" (and) "goddess" are appellations received by humans (but those above) are superior.
<i>Sesaṃ sabbattha uttānamevāti.</i>	All the rest has been already ("just") said.

<i>486. Evaṃ vutte, saṅgāravo māṇavo bhagavantaṃ etadavoca – "abhikkantaṃ, bho gotama, abhikkantaṃ, bho gotama!</i>	486. When spoken thus, the young man Saṅgārava told this to the Exalted One: "Very beautiful, friend Gotama, very beautiful, friend Gotama!
<i>Seyyathāpi, bho gotama, nikkujjitaṃ vā ukkujjeyya, paṭicchannaṃ vā vivareyya, mūlhasa vā maggaṃ ācikkheyya, andhakāre vā telapajjotaṃ dhāreyya – cakkhumanto rūpāni dakkhantīti –</i>	Suppose, friend Gotama, that (somebody) would turn up what was turned down, or open up what was covered, or show the path to the one on the wrong (path), or bore an oil torch in the darkness (thinking) "who has eyes they will see the forms (/appearance)."
<i>evamevaṃ bhotā gotamena anekapariyāyena dhammo pakāsīto.</i>	Just so was the Dhamma explained in several ways by friend Gotama.
<i>Esāhaṃ bhavantaṃ gotamaṃ saraṇaṃ gacchāmi dhammañca bhikkhusaṅghaṇca.</i>	Therefore, I go for the refuge to the Exalted Gotama, I go for the refuge to the Dhamma, as well as the Community of monks.
<i>Upāsakaṃ maṃ bhavaṃ gotamo dhāretu ajjatagge paṇupetaṃ saraṇaṃ gata"nti.</i>	May the Exalted Gotama consider me a lay person who has gone for refuge from today until (he) lives."
<i>Saṅgārasuttaṃ niṭṭhitaṃ dasamaṃ.</i>	The Discourse to Saṅgārava is finished, (numbered) tenth.

<i>MNA 4. Bhayabheravasuttavaṇṇanā</i>	Commentary for MN 4. Discourse on Dread (and) Scare
<i>56. ... Evañca pana vatvā puna taṃ bhagavato dhammadesanaṃ abbhānumodamāno bhagavantaṃ etadavoca abhikkantaṃ, bho gotama, abhikkantaṃ, bho gotamāti.</i>	56. ... Saying so, however, (the brahmin,) extraordinarily rejoicing of the Exalted One's Dhamma discourse, said: "Very beautiful, friend Gotama, very beautiful, friend Gotama!"
<i>Tatthāyaṃ abhikkantasaddo khayasundarābhīrūpaabbhānumodanesu dissati.</i>	There this word "beautiful" is seen in the (cases of) (1) <u>end</u> , (2) <u>beauty</u> , (3) <u>splendor</u> , (and) (4) <u>extraordinary</u> rejoicing.
<i>"Abhikkantā, bhante, ratti, nikkhanto paṭhama yāmo, ciraṇisīno bhikkhusaṅgho"tiādīsu (cūlava. 383; a. ni. 8.20) hi khaye dissati.</i>	(1) (In the quotes such as) "Lord, the night is very beautiful , the first watch (of night) has risen, the Community of monks has been sitting (here) for long," etc. (<i>Vinaya Piṭaka – Cūlavagga Pāli - 9. Pātimokkhatthapanakkhandhakam - 1.</i>

¹³⁸ English language doesn't have the word "your" in a specifically plural form (unlike e.g. Czech and Pāli). In certain languages the plural and singular form when addressing a single person is generally used to indicate respect. A single person (e.g. king) is then not address as "dear king" but as "dear kings" – not in the noun, but in the pronoun.

	<i>Pātimokkhuddesayācanā</i> – par. 383; <i>AN 8.2.10. Uposatha Sutta</i>) is seen at the end.
“ <i>Ayaṃ imesaṃ catunnaṃ puggalānaṃ abhikkantataro ca paṇītataro cā</i> ” <i>tiādīsu (a. ni. 4.100) sundare.</i>	(2) (The quotes such as) "this is the surpassingly very beautiful and the surpassingly excellent out of the four Persons," etc. (<i>AN 4 2.5.10. Potaliya Sutta</i>) are beautiful.
“ <i>Ko me vandati pādāni, iddhiyā yasasā jalaṃ; abhikkantena vaṇṇena, sabbā obhāsayaṃ disā</i> ” <i>ti. – ādīsu (vi. va. 857) abhirūpe.</i>	(3) (The quotes such as) "who bows to my feet, (as I) shine with power (and) glory; by (my) very beautiful (divine) color, all directions are illuminated," ¹³⁹ etc. (<i>Vimāna Vatthu – 2. Purisavimānaṃ - 5. Mahārathavaggo – 1. Maṇḍūkadevaputtavimānavāṇṇanā</i> – par. 857) are the splendor .
“ Abhikkantaṃ , bhante” <i>tiādīsu (dī. ni. 1.250; pārā. 15) abbhanumodane.</i>	(and) (4) (the quotes such as) " Very beautiful , Lord" etc. (<i>Dīgha Nikāya – 2. Sāmaññaphala Sutta</i>) are extraordinary rejoicing .
<i>Idhāpi abbhanumodaneyeva.</i>	This then is (the expression) by extraordinary rejoicing.
<i>Yasmā ca abbhanumodane, tasmā sādhu sādhu bho, gotamāti vuttaṃ hotīti vedītabbaṃ.</i>	It should be known that as in the extraordinary rejoicing, so also when saying "Excellently, excellently, friend Gotama."
“ <i>Bhaye kodhe pasamsāyaṃ, turite kotūhalacchare; hāse soke pasāde ca, kare āmedītaṃ budho</i> ” <i>ti. –</i>	"(Such) is the exclamation done by a wise one in fear, anger, praise, hurry, omens (and) wonders; joke, misery, and appreciation."
<i>Iminā ca lakkhaṇena idha pasādavasena pasamsāvasena cāyaṃ dvikkhattuṃ vuttoti vedītabbo.</i>	- Also, because of this character, it should be known that this (the words of approval) is told here even two times here as appreciation, as praise.
<i>Atha vā abhikkantanti abhikantaṃ. Atiīṭṭhaṃ atīmanāpaṃ, atisundaranti vuttaṃ hoti.</i>	Or otherwise, "very beautiful" means very lovable. Very desirable, very pleasant, very lovely.

<i>Tattha ekena abhikkantasaddena desanaṃ thometi, ekena attano pasādaṃ.</i>	There by one word of "very beautiful" (he) eulogizes the (Dhamma) discourse, (and) by one (again) (he means his) own appreciation.
<i>Ayañhettha adhippāyo – abhikkantaṃ, bho gotama, yadidaṃ bhoto gotamassa dhammadesanā,</i>	Indeed, this is the meaning there: "very beautiful, friend Gotama, namely this Dhamma discourse of friend Gotama,
<i>abhikkantaṃ yadidaṃ bhoto gotamassa dhammadesanaṃ āgamma mama pasādoti.</i>	Very beautiful, namely this Dhamma discourse of friend Gotama which aroused my appreciation."
<i>Bhagavato yeva vā vacanaṃ dve dve atthe sandhāya thometi –</i>	Or (he) simply eulogizes the word of the Exalted One in connection with the two by two meanings:
<i>bhoto gotamassa vacanaṃ abhikkantaṃ dosanāsanato, abhikkantaṃ guṇādhigamanato,</i>	(1) the word of friend Gotama is very beautiful because it can destroy defilements, (2) (it) is very beautiful because (it) arouses the qualities (such as virtue, etc.);
<i>tathā saddhājananato, paññājananato, sāthato, sabyañjanato, uttānapadato, gambhīratthato,</i>	Thereby (3) by arousing faith, (4) by arousing wisdom, (5) by meaningfulness, (6) by grammatical correctness, (7) by the used vocabulary, (8) by the deep meaning,
<i>kaṇṇasukhato, hadayaṅgamato, anattukkamsanato, aparavambhanato, karuṇāsīlalato,</i>	(9) Because it is pleasant in the ear, (10) because it enters the heart, (11) because it doesn't exalt oneself, (12) because it doesn't degrade another one, (13) by the coolness of the compassion,
<i>paññāvadātato, āpātharamaṇiyato, vimaddakkhamato, suyyamānasukhato, vīmaṃsiyamānahitatoti evamādīhi yojetabbaṃ.</i>	(14) Because it increases (the listener's) wisdom, (15) because it causes pleasure in those who hear (it), (16) (by the absence of any contradiction and therefore) by its resistance to disturbance, (17) because who hears it becomes happy, (18) because (it) is profitable to those who inquire, and so on. (These meanings) should be applied (in the meaning). ¹⁴⁰

¹³⁹ This is an exclamation uttered by a deity in surprise how much glory and power they obtained for the good deeds made in their previous life.

¹⁴⁰ Altogether 18 qualities of the Buddha's discourse have been listed here.

<i>Tato parampi catūhi upamāhi desanaṃyeva thometi.</i>	Thereafter (he) eulogizes just the discourse by four similes.
<i>Tattha nikkujjīṭanti adhomukhaṭṭhapitaṃ, heṭṭhāmukhajātaṃ vā.</i>	There "turned down" is (whatever is) kept upside down ("orifice down") or born (arisen) with face downward.
<i>Ukkujjeyyāti upari mukhaṃ kareyya.</i>	"Would turn up" means (somebody) would make (it) upside up ("orifice up").
<i>Paṭicchannanti tiṇapaṇṇādicchāditaṃ.</i>	"Covered" means concealed by grass, leaves, etc.
<i>Vivareyyāti ugghāṭeyya.</i>	"Would open up" means (somebody) would uncover (it).
<i>Mūlhassāti disāmūlhassa.</i>	"One on the wrong (path)" means one in the wrong direction.
<i>Maggaṃ ācikkheyyāti hatthe gahetvā "esa maggo"ti vadeyya.</i>	"Would show the path" means (somebody) would take (the person's) hands and say, "This is the path."
<i>Andhakāreti kāḷapakkhacātuddasīḍḍharattaghanavanasanaṇḍamegha paṭalehi caturaṅge tame,</i>	"In the darkness" means in the darkness of four characteristics: (1) in the period of new ("black") (moon), in the 14 th day (i.e., new-moon day), (2) in the middle of a night, (3) in a deep ("dense") jungle, (4) when (the sky) is covered by clouds;
<i>ayaṃ tāva anuttānapadattho.</i>	this is then the word meaning not uttered (earlier).

<i>Ayaṃ pana adhippāyayojanā – yathā koci nikkujjīṭaṃ ukkujjeyya, evaṃ saddhammavimukhaṃ asaddhamme paṭitaṃ maṃ asaddhammā vuṭṭhāpentena,</i>	This is then the connection to the meaning: in the way (someone) would turn up something turned down thus to me fallen to the incorrect truth (/dhamma), out of the direction toward the correct Truth (/Dhamma), (I was) raised from the incorrect truth (/dhamma);
<i>yathā paṭicchannaṃ vivareyya, evaṃ kassapassa bhagavato sāsananāradhānato pabhuti micchādīṭṭhigahanapaṭicchannaṃ sāsanaṃ vivarantena,</i>	In the way (someone) would uncover what was covered thus the (Buddha's) Teachings has been uncovered from being concealed by a forest of wrong view(s) since the time the Dispensation of Kassapa the Exalted One disappeared;
<i>yathā mūlhassa maggaṃ ācikkheyya, evaṃ kummaggamicchāmaggaṃ paṭipannaṃ me saggamokkhamaggaṃ ācikkhantena,</i>	In the way (someone) would show the path to one of wrong (path) thus I who followed the path of doom, the wrong path, was shown the path to heaven (or) Liberation,
<i>yathā andhakāre telapajjotaṃ dhāreyya, evaṃ mohandhakāre nimuggassa me buddhādiratanarūpāni apassato</i>	In the way (someone) would carry an oil torch in darkness thus to me sunk in the darkness of ignorance, who didn't see the forms (/appearance) of the Jewels such as the Buddha,
<i>tappaṭicchādaka mohandhakāra viddhaṃsakadesanā pajjotadhāraṇena mayhaṃ bhotā gotamena etehi pariyāyehi pakāsītattā anekapariyāyena dhammo pakāsītoti.</i>	By carrying the torch of the discourse which dispelled such concealing darkness of ignorance, because of the explanation in those (various) ways by friend Gotama, the Truth (/Dhamma) has been revealed (to me).